

**FINAL MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING**
**Held on Friday, 17 December 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS,
scheduled for 08:00**



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer officially opened the meeting at 08:10 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members

None

Members of Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT) (secretary)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CS) (Deputy Director)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS) (Intern Admin support)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD) (Assistant Director)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SnJ) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Xola Mwandile (XM) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer)

Legal Advisor

Visitors

Item 11.16

Erica Giljam (architect)
Ian Pretorius (Simon van der Stel Foundation)

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Jonathan Windvogel

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

- 4.1** 17 December 2021. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits. ...KB moves to adopt the agenda and SJ seconds that.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

5.1 To be approved on the 17th of January 2022.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

7. Confidential matters

8. Standing Items

8.1 Site inspections undertaken.

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

8.3.1 None

8.4 Preparation for the upcoming committee meetings

None

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

8.6 Incomplete Applications

Proposed additions & alterations Erf 917, 46 Church Street, Wellington-S34 -A&A

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 None

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 89740, 31 Gatesville Road, Kalk Bay, S34-A&A

Case No: 21092906SB1119E

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The case officer clarified the comments as received by the conservation body;
- Information received on the 14 December 2021;
- The building is graded IIIB inside the HPO;
- The Kalk Bay St James Ratepayers and Residents Associatio and CoCT Supports the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

11.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 406, 3 Church Street, Caledon, S34-A&A

Case No: 19012207KB0122E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee previously requested annotated photographs and a new application form
- Information received on the 15th December 2021;
- The committee is not satisfied with the images provided and requires clear, colour annotated photographs (internal and external) which also shows the areas of proposed change.
- The application form provided is not the latest HWC application form.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

In order to proceed with review of the application, the committee requires the following outstanding information:

- A S34 application form
- Annotated colour photographs
- A methodology statement and heritage motivation prepared by the architect on how the work will be undertaken

KB

11.3 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 883, 25 Barkly Road, Sea Point, S34-A&A

Case No: 21101209 KB10012E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee previously requested a power of attorney
- Information was received 15th December 2021
- The building is graded IIIB and falls outside HPOZ
- Sea Point Fresnaye and Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 3265, 71, Voortrekker Street, Piketberg, S34-Total demolition

Case No: 20020305KB0923E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested that the applicant does broader public participation as the application is a total demolition ;
- A S34 application was requested by the committee and duly submitted;
- The information received on 15th December 2021;
- The committee is concerned that a large section of the structure has already been demolished without a permit from HWC;
- There is no clear evidence that public participation was undertaken as required by the committee.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

In order to proceed with review of the application, the committee requires the following outstanding information:

- Evidence of public participation
- Contextual images

KB

11.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 13870, 36 Milner Street, Woodstock, S34-A&A

Case No: 21041306KB0413E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from Woodstock Aesthetics Advisory Committee and the Woodstock Residents Association
- Information received 14 December 2021
- The building is graded IIIB and it falls inside HPOZ according to the information on ISIS website
- As the plans were submitted as the illegal work was done by the previous owner.

DECISION

The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter.

KB

11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3570, 10 Malan Street Somerset West, S34-A&A

Case No: 21101803KB1025E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comment from Helderberg Renaissance Foundation and written confirmation from the owner if work has commenced / or been completed;
- The information was received on the 12th December 2021;
- The building is a NCW and falls outside an HPOZ

DECISION

The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter.

KB

11.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1498, 2 Bradwell Road, Vredehoek, S34-A&A

Case No: 21083007KB0907E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comment from the Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group (GVHAG)
- The information was received 10th December 2021
- The building is graded IIIB and fall inside a proposed HPOZ
- The GVHAG and City Bowl Ratepayers and Residence Association supports the proposal
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 90213, 11 Lock Road Kalk Bay, S34-A&A

Case No: 21071305 KB0713E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from Kalk Bay St James Ratepayers and Residents Association
- Information received 12 December 2021
- The building is graded IIIC and falls inside HPOZ
- The CoCT notes the work has already been completed but has no objections to the proposal.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter.

KB

11.9 Proposed additions & alterations Rem of 17 and Rem of Erf 19, 9a Church Street, Piketberg-S34 – A&A

Case No: 21033008KB0908E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from the Municipality
- The information was received 15 December 2021
- The applicant clarified, as per correspondence provided by the building control officer, that the municipality only refers applicants to HWC and does not provide heritage related comment on the application
- The building is graded IIIB and falls outside a HPOZ
- The committee noted the proposal does not trigger the NHRA

COMMENT

A letter to be issued to the applicant stating the proposal does not trigger the provisions of S34 of the National Heritage Resources Act

KB

11.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 959, Ave Fontain Bleau Avenue, Fresnaye S34-A&A

Case No: 21092821KB1021E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from Sea Point for All
- Information received 8th December 2021
- CoCt supported the proposal
- Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association noted that they cannot support the illegal work.
- The building is graded Not Conservation Worthy and falls outside HPOZ
- Clarity is required with regards to the status of the building work and the committee requires investigation into potential illegal work

UNDER INVESTIGATION.

Case officer to investigate the status of the building work. If work has commenced or been completed, such work must be reflected and annotated on the building plans submitted to HWC.

KB

11.11 Proposed additions & alterations Erf 917, 46 Church Street, Wellington-S34 -A&A

Case No: 21071210KB0712E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested marked-up plans as well as all photographs.
- Information received 10th December 2021
- The building is graded IIIC and is located inside the Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone
- The Drakenstein Municipality has objected to the application.

COMMENT

The application is incomplete as it requires comment from the Drakenstein Heritage Foundation

KB

11.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on ERF 50118, 10 Riverside Road, Newlands, S34-A&A

Case No: 21091709KB0920E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comment from the City of Cape Town and the stamped plans.
- Information received 15th of December 2021.
- The building is graded IIIB and falls outside an HPOZ
- CoCT and Fernwood Residents Association supports.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2720, 46 High Street, Mossel Bay, S34-A&A

Case No: 21080203KB0811E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from Simon van der Stel (Southern Cape)
- Information received 14th of December 2021.
- The building is graded IIIB and falls outside an HPOZ
- Simon van der Stel (Southern Cape), Heritage Mossel Bay and Mossel Bay Municipality supports

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations on 2162, 11 Pine Close Pinelands S34-A&A

Case No: 21081810KB0818E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from Pinelands Ratepayers Residence Assosiation
- Information received 14 December 2021
- The building is graded IIIC inside HPOZ
- Pinelands Ratepayers Residence Association did not comment within the 30 days commenting period
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resovled to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 103, 11 Malan Street, Albertinia, S34-A&A

Case No: 21110911TZ1117E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested a new HWC application form and a motivation for the work that was already done
- Information received 15 December 2021
- The applicant confirmed the work was done illegally by the previous owner.
- The illegal work has not impacted negatively on the heritage resources.
- The building is graded IIIB it falls outside HPOZ or Special Character Area

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter

TZ

11.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 560, 25 Avenue Normandy, Fresnaye, S34-A&A

Case No: 21111907TZ1119E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

Erica Giljam (architect) and Ian Pretorius (Simon van der Stel Foundation) were present and took part in the discussion

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB and falls outside HPOZ;

- CoCT, Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association, Sea Point For All supports the proposal;
- Simon van der Stel had concerns, saying that building has a intact heritage features that must be retained such the bathroom and front gate;
- The committee did not agree with the IIIB grading as it was of the opinion that the structure had minimal heritage period features;
- The proposal will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

11.17 Proposed additions and alteration on Erf 1889, 58 Leeuwen Street, Bo-Kaap, S34-A&A

Case No: 21063007TZ1029E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from BO-Kaap Youth Movement;
- Information received 14 December 202;
- The building is graded an IIIC and falls inside HPOZ;
- CoCT, Bo-Kaap Civic Association and BO-Kaap Youth Movement supports the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

11.18 Proposed additions and alteration on Erf 812 _ 53 Hastings Street, Tamboerskloof, S34A&A

Case No: 21071505MS0726E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested CoCT comments
- Information received 14 December 2021
- The building is graded IIIB and it fall inside HPOZ
- CoCT and City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter

MS

11.19 Proposed rezoning and redevelopment on Erf 52, Vanrhynsdorp Matzikama, S38(4)-NID

Case No: 21111004NK1116E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The matter was put under investigation and the case officer has clarified that a HIA was undertaken by Aikman & Associates in 2014.
- The details of the report provided sufficient information on the presence of heritage resources in the immediate area, which confirms the need for a HIA

DECISION

Since there is a reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on, the committee requires a Heritage Impact Assessment which complies with S38(3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

- A desktop Palaeontological Impact Assessment
- A Archaeological Impact assessment.

NK

11.20 Proposed Rezoning 1067, 20 Victoria Street, Stanford – S31 Rezoning.

Case No: 21111025SJ1117E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested annotated photographs and a motivation letter
- The motivation letter was received 8th December 2021 and the photographs on the 14th of December 2021
- Rezoning from General residential zone2 to business zone3 (local business)
- The Stanford Heritage Committee supports the proposal

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the rezoning application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ.

11.21 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 72011, 36 Stella Road, Plumstead,

S34-A&A

Case No: 21101811RG1111E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested clarification of the work being done or not
- Information received 1st December 2021
- The building is graded IIIC and falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT does not support the proposal as the work has commenced

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a S51 letter

RG

11.22 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1015, 7 Ronald Road, Camps Bay,**S34-A&A****Case No: 21111105RG1117E**

Mr Robin George introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested comments from the Camps Bay and Clifton Residents and Ratepayers Association, SG diagram and locality plan
- Information received 13th December 2021
- The CoCT has graded the building a potential IIC, however HOMs is of the opinion the building is Not Conservation Worthy.
- The building falls outside of a proposed or declared HPOZ
- CoCT and Camps Bay and Clifton Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal will not impact on heritage resources.

RG

11.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 121152, 54 16th street, Facreton, Maitland S34(A&A)**21111808XM1118E**

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The committee requested CoCT comments and however the CoCT have agreed for HWC to proceed without a formal CoCT comments;
- Information received 14 December 2021;
- The building is graded Not Conservation Worthy;
- The building falls outside of a proposed or declared HPOZ.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal will not impact on heritage resources.

13. OTHER MATTERS

None

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions KB moves to adopt the decisions and resolutions and TZ seconds.

15. CLOSURE: 12:45

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

17 January 2022

Chairperson.....

Date:.....

Secretariat:

Date:...17 December 2021.....