

**DECISION MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
APPEALS COMMITTEE**

**Held on Wednesday, 10 November 2021 via Microsoft Teams,
scheduled for 08:30**



Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms Katherine Dumbrell officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

9 Matters Arising

**9.1 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 2291, 21 Dal Road, Camps Bay
HM/CAMPS BAY/ERF 2291
Case No: 20071608KB0303E**

Appeal against a BELCom Decision to be tabled

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Theo Giannelos (owner/appellant), Mr Ashley Lillie, (heritage consultant for the appellant), (Shani Architect for the Appellant, Mr Anton Slabbert (attorney for the appellant) Ms Sandra van der Merwe and Mike Scurr (Docomomo for the respondents) were present and took part in the discussion.

SH read the site inspection report into the record.

DECISION

The appeal is upheld and the demolition of the structure on Erf 2291 at 21 Dal Road Camps Bay is approved with no conditions.

**9.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 53936, 24 Claremont Avenue, Claremont
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 53936**

Case No: 21071209MS0712E

Appeal against a BELCom Decision to be tabled

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Chris Snelling and Mrs Cindy Postelthwayte (heritage consultants representing the appellant), Ms Debbie Wall-Smith, Mr Richard Duckitt and Mr Julien Perreard (Respondent/objectors) were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The committee upheld the appeal and resolved that the structure on Erf 53936 Claremont be demolished without conditions.

**9.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 12255, 230 Victoria Street, Woodstock
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 12255**

Case No: 21012606TZ0128E

Revised drawings as required in the previous meeting were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Nik Smith (Objek Architects) and Ms Ute Kuhlman (WRA) were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The appeal is dismissed. The decision of the BELcom committee is substituted with the decision to approve in principle the proposals contained in drawings numbered 230 Vic_REV7_001, 230 Vic_REV7_002, 230 Vic_REV7_003, 230 Vic_REV7_004. Subject to the condition that the following errors contained in the drawings are corrected and that the amended drawings are returned to HWC for stamping:

- a. The Stairwell and balustrade are not correctly indicated on the plans. The plans need to reflect the changes agreed to between WRA and the architect

10. New Matters

**10.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 1299 & 1300, 77 & 79 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO KAAP/ ERF 1299
Case No: 21071501XM0813E**

Appeal against a BELCom Decision to be tabled

Appeal pack to be tabled

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Richard Summers (Attorney for the applicant/appellant), Ms Clarice Arendse (attorney for the applicant) and Ms Quahnitah Samie (heritage consultant for the applicant) were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The appeal is upheld, and the demolition of Erven 1299 and 1300 Cape Town is approved without conditions.

**10.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12563, 26 Coronation Road Walmer Estate
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WALMER ESTATE/ ERF 12563
Case No: 21081111MS0816E**

Appeal against a BELCom Decision

Appeal pack to be tabled

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case

Ms Tasneem Higgins (owner) and Mr Ron Martin (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussion.

HELD OVER FOR A SITE INSPECTION
(NB, AM)

**10.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1726, 1 Rowan Street, Stellenbosch
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1726
Case No: 21071508KB0716E**

Appeal against a BELCom Decision

Revised drawing arising out of discussions between the parties were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Patricia Botha (representing SIG, the appellant) and Mr Arn Erasmus (architect for the respondent/owner) were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee upheld the appeal and substituted the decision of BELCom with the following decision:

The revised proposals contained in drawings 2.03 Rev B, 2.04 Rev B, 4.02 Rev B, 4.0 Rev B dated 30 September 2021 are approved.

**10.4 Proposed demolition of ERF 3585, 18 Queen Victoria Street, Corner Keerom Street Cape Town
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN/ERF 3585
Decision Case No: 21070510KB0720E)**

Appeal against a BELCom decision.

Appeal pack to be tabled

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DECISION

The appeal is dismissed. The proposed demolition is part of the City Club, which is situated on four erven and therefore triggers Section 38(1) (c) (ii) of the NHRA. The committee therefore resolves that a NID submission process must be followed in terms of Section 38.

11. APPEALS RECEIVED BUT STILL IN PERIOD FOR COMMENT FROM I & Aps

- 11.1 Notification of Intent to Develop: Proposed Development of New Dwellings of Erf 2090 50 Olivenhout Avenue (S38(1) of the NHRA)
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/PLATTEKLOOF 2090
Case No: 21091602SB0920E**

HELD OVER TO THE FOLLOWING MEETING OF THE APPEALS COMMITTEE IN ORDER TO CONDUCT A SITE VISIT.

(AM, AVG, NB, SH)

- 13. Proposed next date of the meeting: 07 December 2021**

- 14. Adoption of decisions and resolutions**
The Committee resolved to adopt the decisions and resolutions dated 10th November 2021.

- 15. Closure:** The meeting was adjourned at: 15 h 27

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON_____

DATE_____

SECRETARY_____

DATE_____