



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE (HWC)
ARCHAEOLOGY, PALAEOLOGY AND METEORITES COMMITTEE (APM)
HELD ON 7 JULY 2021, WEDNESDAY ON MICROSOFT TEAMS CAPE TOWN AT 09:00 AM**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Dr Lita Webley (LW), officially opened the meeting at 9:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Dr Lita Webley (LW)
Mr John Gribble (JG)
Dr Jayson Orton (JO)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Dr Ragna Redelstorff (RR)
Ms Emmylou Bailey (EB)

Members of Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Mr Jonathan Windvogel (JW)
Mr Reagan Fortune (RF)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)
Ms Penelope E Meyer (PM)

Dr Wendy Black (WB) (stepped out of the meeting @ 09:55 & returned at 10:39)

Visitors

Mr Tim Hart
Dr Nicholas Baumann
Dr Alex Mackay
Ms Jenna Lavin
Ms Katherine Dumbrell
Mr Andre Le Roux
Mr Stefan Delpont

Ms Cathy Salter-Jansen
Ms Kathie Smuts
Mr Gideon Malherbe
Ms Quahnita Samie
Dr Peter Nilssen

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Aneeqah Brown

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 7 July 2021

The Committee approved the agenda dated 7 July 2021 with additions and amendments.

5. Approval of Minutes and Matters Arising from Previous Meeting

5.1 2 June 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 2 June 2021 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

6.1 J.O. : 16.2, 16.4, 17.1, 17.2, 17.3 and 21.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Appointments

8.1 None

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals

CAP reported back on the outcomes of the following Appeals and Tribunal matters:

-Proposed Alterations and Additions, ERF 768, Clydebank Road, Green Point. CT. S 34•A&A
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 768
Case No: 2103020780303E

DECISION

The Appeal is dismissed. The decision of BELCom is upheld.

-Tribunal: Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 68058, 4 Smithers Road, Kenilworth
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH 68058
Case No: 19110410WD1106E

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the directive of the Tribunal has been complied with. The Committee endorses the proposal in the document dated 3rd March 2021 by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects – drawings numbers 19-009_SK001, 19-009_SK002, 19-009_SK003, 19-009_SK004, 19-009_SK005, 19-009_SK006, 19-009_SK007, and 19-009_SK08. These drawings are to be developed into the local authority submission drawings and returned to HOMs for stamping.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Erf 4998, Sayers Lane, Simons Town (Reburial)

Mr Tim Hart (Archaeologist) and Ms Cathy Salter-Jansen (Simon's Town Museum Manager) were present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Mr Hart of ACO Associates presented a short summary of the matters related to the history of the property, the excavation of human remains, and the permit for the analysis of human remains by the Cultural Heritage Agency of the Netherlands (RCE),
- He explained the reasons for the delay in the release of the results of the analysis;
- Ms Salter-Jansen explained that the human remains are presently stored in the Simonstown Museum, but the Museum was committed to their reburial at the earliest moment;
- The RCE have indicated that they have a direct interest in the reburial of the human remains;
- The Committee proposed that HWC liaise directly with the RCE about the results of the analysis and the reburial;
- The Committee was informed that the owner of the property was currently in the United Kingdom and the property was for sale.

SB

10.2 Amsterdam Battery Report Back on Conservation Management Plan (CMP) and Heritage Agreement

Dr Nicholas Baumann (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Dr Baumann discussed the CMP and Heritage Agreement and noted that the documents were about to be finalised.
- Some of the comments on the CMP related to the site inspection which APM had undertaken in January 2020;
- He noted that all the trees and shrubs on the rampart wall had been cut down to soil level.
- The Committee agreed that it is important that the final draft CMP should be submitted not later than the 1st of August 2021 so it can be on the agenda for the November Council meeting.

SB

10.3 Clanwilliam Dam

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SB noted that the building in Park Street, Clanwilliam which houses the rock art panels is being vandalised and this is a matter of concern as there is no money to secure the building and protect the panels;
- However, funding for the new building has been made available by the Department of Water Affairs
- JO noted his concern that the third rock art panel which contains images of sheep was never removed and is still in danger of destruction with the projected rise in the level of the dam.

SB

10.4.1 Accidental Finds of Skeletal Remains- Gansbaai

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SB reported that the remains of two individual have been uncovered in Gansbaai along a boundary wall of a housing estate and are presently with South African Police Service (SAPS);
- SB will do a site inspection to investigate the circumstances of the discovery and also provide SAPS with a copy of the Accidental Finds of Human Remains Protocol;
- The human remains will be transferred to a temporary storage at UCT (FACT).
- It was pointed out that the human remains could be from the wreck of the Birkenhead.

SB

10.4.2 Accidental Finds of Skeletal Remains - Hermanus

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SB reported that the cranium of an individual has been recovered on a property in Hermanus and is presently with SAPS;
- SB will do a site inspection to investigate the circumstances of the discovery and also provide the SAPS with a copy of the Accidental Finds of Human Remains Protocol;
- The human remains will be transferred to a temporary storage at UCT (FACT).

SB

10.4.3 Erf 2963, 8 3rd street, Shelly Point Street St Helena Bay

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SB has been alerted to the discovery of human remains from Shelley Bay which have recently been uncovered;
- She will investigate further and report back to the committee.

10.4.4 FACT

- SB notified the committee that according to the MOU with UCT, human remains may only remain in temporary storage at FACT for one year after which the agreement has to be reviewed;
- Dr Wendy Black notified the Committee that the Iziko Museums was now able to take the human remains from FACT and keep them in storage;
- It was agreed that Dr Black would attend the next meeting with FACT to discuss the logistics of moving the human remains;
- Dr Black informed the Committee that the draft Policy on the Repatriation and Restitution of Human Remains and Associated Objects was passed by Parliament in March 2021 and that the document will likely be available by August, depending on DSAC finalisations.

SB

10.5 Erf 64, Baboon Point Cave, Elands Bay

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SB informed the Committee that once the funds have been transferred to the museum, the project can commence operations.

11 Site Inspection undertaken

11.1 None

12 Proposed Site Inspection

12.1 None

13 Site Inspection Report

13.1 None

14 Report back on Council

14.1 None

15. Policy and Procedures

15.1 SAPS and HWC Accidental Finds Protocol and Procedure

Nothing to report.

15.2 Draft - Guideline for Applications for Disturbance of Human Remains

Nothing to report

- 15.3 Circulation/Workshop of Accidental Finds of Human Remains Protocol**
Nothing to report.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

16. SECTION 35 PERMIT APPLICATION

- 16.1 Proposed destructive analysis of Turbo Sarmaticus Opercula samples from Blombos Cave, Blomboschfontein 495/57: NM**
HM/ GARDEN ROUTE / RIVERSDALE / BLOMBOSCHFONTEIN 495/57
Case No: 21061408SB0628E

Permit application and associated documentation prepared by Jovana Milic.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Prof Henshilwood has a valid excavation permit for Blombos Cave which expires in December 2021
- The 187 samples of Turbo sarmaticus opercula will be couriered from Cape Town via DHL to the University of Bergen where the analyses will be undertaken.
- The proposal is to drill into each opercula to obtain a 0.5 mg sample which will be used for stable oxygen analyses.
- The aim is to reconstruct sea surface temperatures and environmental conditions during the Middle Stone Age (MSA) at Blombos Cave.

DECISION

The Committee approved the permit application by Jovan Milic of the University of Bergen in principle, subject to the final list of samples being provided to HWC. The Committee requests that any unused shells must be returned to South Africa.

SB

- 16.2 Proposed Archaeological Excavation at Varsche Rivier 003 Site, Farm Varscherivier 260, Vredendal:NM**
HM/WEST COAST/MATZIKAMA/VREDENDAL/FARM VARSCHRIVIER 260
Case No: 21060307SB0608E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Permit Application and Addendum Documents were tabled.

Dr Alex Mackay was present and took part in the discussion. Dr J. Orton took part in the discussions but then recused himself for the decision and left the meeting.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The aim of the permit is to enable the excavations to be resumed at VR003.
- Further excavations are planned into the slope deposits to clarify the sequence, refine the chronology and provide a palaeo-environmental sequence.
- The eight objectives are set out on pages 13 to 15 of the motivation report.
- The landowner permission has been obtained and the Iziko Museums repository agreement is in place.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit application from Dr Mackay of the University of Wollongong (Australia) for further excavations at Varsche Rivier Site 003.

SB

16.3 Proposed excavation at Erf 2393, 14 Una Drive Betty's Bay: NM HM/OVERSTRAND/ OVERBERG / BETTY BAY / ERF 2393

Case No: 21052505SB0614E

Permit application and associated documentation prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff.

Ms Katie Smuts (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The owners of the property intend to build a garage onto their house.
- Although there is no evidence of surface archaeology, a desktop assessment of archaeology in the immediate surrounds of the site, suggests that there is a possibility of sub-surface midden material.
- The Committee was of the opinion that test excavations were preferable to monitoring as they could be cheaper and undertaken in advance of building.
- Ms Smuts has provided HWC with a description of the methodology and a map of the proposed excavations.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit application by Ms Smuts of Rennie Scurr Adendorff for test excavations in the footprint of the proposed garage.

SB

16.4 Proposed destructive analysis of OES beads and unmodified fragments from Ptn 4 Varsche Rivier 260, Vredendal:NM

HM/WEST COAST/MATZIKAMA/VREDENDAL/FARM VARSCHRIVIER 260

Case No: 21051302SB0608E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Dr Mackay.

Dr Alex Mackay (Applicant) was present and took part in the discussion. Dr J Orton took part in the discussions and then recused himself for the decision and left the meeting.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The permit is for the destructive analysis of 151 ostrich eggshell fragments and two bead preforms from VR003.
- The ostrich eggshell fragments will be couriered from the Archaeology Department at UCT to the University of California for the analyses and dating.
- The aim of the dating is to resolve some internally inconsistent ages within the site and to refine the palaeo-environmental sequence.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit application by Dr Mackay of the university of Wollongong (Australia) for the destructive analyses of 151 ostrich eggshell fragments and two bead preforms.

SB

- 16.5 Proposed export and analysis of sediment samples for crypto-tephra analysis Erf 347 & 298 Vleesbaai, Mossel Bay: NM HM/GARDEN ROUTE/ MOSSEL BAY / ERVEN 347 & 298**
Case No: 21062204SB0724E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Dr Curtis Marean.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The permit is for the analyses of crypto-tephra from the archaeological and geological site of Vleesbaai Area C near Mossel Bay.
- The tephra refer to glass shards and pumice produced by volcanic eruptions and they can be used for dating.
- The analysis will be undertaken at the University of Las Vegas in Nevada and the Arizona State University.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit application by Dr Marean of the Arizona State University for analyses as described in the permit application.

SB

17. SECTION 35 PERMIT REPORTS

17.1 Archaeological test excavation: Erf 24639, 209 Main Road Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 24639 Case No: 20200505SM0511E

Interim permit report and letter for noting by Dr Jayson Orton.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Gideon Malherbe was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The monitoring report by Dr Orton provided information on the remnants of a late 19th/early 20th century house on the erf.
- Further monitoring was not possible since the footprint area had been cleared of all historical material and lowered to sterile bedrock due to a miscommunication (letter dated 1 July 2021).
- However, there was still an opportunity to examine a ceramic concentration in the north-eastern corner of the property later in the year when landscaping work commences.

COMMENT

The Committee noted the interim report by Dr Orton of ASHA Consulting dated 25 June 2021 and his letter of the 1st of July 2021. A final report will be submitted once work on the site has been completed.

SB

17.2 Report for destruction of ostrich eggshell fragments for stable isotope analysis from Varsche Rivier 003 Rock Shelter: MA HM/WEST COAST/MATZIKAMA/VREDENDAL/FARM VARSCHRIVIER 260 Case No: 16031609GT0330E

Permit application report for noting by Dr Jayson Orton.

Dr Alex Mackay was present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The report was for stable isotope analysis of shell from the site.

COMMENT

The Committee noted the permit report no 16031609GT0330E.

SB

- 17.3 Report for destruction for dating of samples of ostrich eggshell from VR003 located on Varsche Rivier 260, Knersvlakte:MA
HM/WEST COAST/MATZIKAMA/VREDENDAL/FARM VARSCHRIVIER 261
Case No: 15072402GT0724E**

Permit application report for noting by Dr Jayson Orton.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Dr Alex Mackay was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The report was for dating of shell from the site.

COMMENT

The Committee noted the permit report no 15072402GT0724E.

SB

18. SECTION 35 REGISTRATION OF REPOSITORIES

- 18.1 None

19. SECTION 36 PERMIT APPLICATION

- 19.1 None

20. SECTION 36 PERMIT REPORT

- 20.1 None

SB

21. SECTION 38 WORKPLAN APPLICATIONS

- 21.1 Proposed Sand Mine on Portion 30 Of Farm Klein Soebattersvlakte 369, Riversdale Magisterial District, Western Cape Province: MA
HM/EDEN/HESSEQUA/STILL BAY/PTN 369/30
Case No: 20111808SB1119E**

Dr Jayson Orton took part in the discussions and then recused himself during the decision process and left the meeting.

Workplan prepared by ASHA Consulting.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The workplan application is for a sand mine between Riversdale and Still Bay.
- Two large scatters of stone tools will be sampled, KSV1 and KSV2. It is proposed to set up a grid of 2m x 2m and to hand collect artefacts with sieving undertaken where this is possible;
- Apart from surface collections, at least six test excavations will be undertaken depending on the condition of the soil.
- The final report will indicate whether any minor changes have to be made to the proposed methodology due to soil conditions.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the Work Plan application by ASHA Consulting dated 1 June 2021 using the methodology described.

SB

22. SECTION 38 WORKPLAN REPORT

22.1 None

23. Section 34 - ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS/PARTIAL DEMOLITION

23.1 **Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 5553, 30 Waller Way, Betty's Bay, Overstrand:NM**
HM/OVERSTRAND/ OVERBERG / BETTY BAY / ERF 5553
Case No: 21060701SB0621E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Katie Smuts (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Most of the alterations to structures on this property are internal changes and the only significant change is the deck on Building B.
- The Committee noted the proximity of the property to other shell middens in the vicinity and the possibility of uncovering archaeological remains.

COMMENT

The Committee endorsed the report by Ms Smuts of Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects dated June 2021 and the recommendations on page 44:

- The construction of the deck to Building B to be monitored by an archaeologist and should midden material be discovered; work must stop while an archaeologist investigates.

SB

24. SECTION 38 (1) Notification of Intent to Develop (NID)

24.1 Proposed fibre-optic installation, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ BO-KAAP

Case No: 21031204SB0618E, 21031206SB0618E, 21031207SB0618E, 21031208SB0618E

NID and associated documentation by Q Samie.

Ms Quahnita Samie was present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee was of the opinion that a single Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) was preferable to several different HIA reports in order to assess the overall impacts
- The trenching may uncover historic fabric including old road surfaces such as cobbles and possibly informal burials associated with Tana Baru.
- The potential for impact to underground historical archaeological remains is a possibility especially in sensitive areas and a targeted monitoring programme will likely be required.
- Fibre optic boxes attached to old buildings may have a limited visual impact.

DECISION

The Committee agree that a single HIA must be conducted with a specialist historical archaeological study.

SB

25. REQUEST FOR EXEMPTION/OPINION/ADVICE

25.1 Review of earlier Archaeological Heritage Study and an Archaeological Site Inspection, Farm Vaalevalley 219, Mossel Bay:NM HM/GARDEN ROUTE/ MOSSEL BAY / ERF 219

Case No: 18052803HB0530E

Previous application and report prepared by Peter Nilssen

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Dr Peter Nilssen, Mr Stefan Delpont and Andre Le Roux were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Dr Nilssen commented that the Archaeological Impact Assessment (AIA) had been undertaken in 2005 and that the significance of observations made during that time may have changed.
- Dr Nilssen reported that he had been to site recently and that the graves had been fenced and were protected.
- A few stone artefacts have been found but he did not believe that full time monitoring was required as per the requirements of the EA related to the 2005 study.
- He asked whether sites which had been identified and assessed in 2005 should be revisited and re-evaluated for their significance and mitigation.
- PM noted that as the EA had been issued, it was not possible to go back to the original report and re-do it.
- The Committee discussed the need for monitoring and agreed that Dr Nilssen could make the decisions as required.

COMMENT

The Committee was satisfied that the requirements of the EA were being complied with.

SB

**25.2 Proposed rezoning on Erf 7614m Knysna:NM
HM/EDEN/BITOU/KNYSNA/ERF 7614**

Case No: 21030213SB0316E

NID and appeal pack tabled for discussion.

Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The NID decision by HOMs to require an HIA was appealed by the applicant. The Appeals committee had requested input from the APM committee.
- It was noted that the NID documentation did not include any information on heritage resources.
- The Committee felt that due to the size of the development and the paleo sensitivity of the area, a field based palaeontological study was essential.
- They discussed the potential for Stone Age archaeology and historical archaeology and the majority of the Committee supported a specialist archaeological study as well.

COMMENT

The Committee recommends a full HIA comprising specialist archaeology and palaeontology studies.

CAP

26. **SECTION 38 (8) TO OTHER AUTHORITIES - Refer to agenda for 16 July 2021**
27. **SECTION 27: PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE - Refer to agenda for 16 July 2021**
28. **REPORT BACK FROM OTHER MEETINGS WHEN RELEVANT - Refer to agenda for 16 July 2021**
29. **OTHER MATTERS - Refer to agenda for 16 July 2021**
30. **ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions. CM moved to approve and rectify the decision and RR supported.

31. **CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at: 15:06

32. **DATE OF NEXT MEETING:** **16 July 2021**

CHAIRPERSON *L. E. Webley* DATE 16 July 2021

SECRETARY: **A Brown** DATE **16 July 2021**