

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held via Microsoft Teams,
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 10 February 2021**



1. Opening and Welcome

The IACOM Chair, Mr David Gibbs, opened the meeting at 09h00 and welcomed everyone present via Microsoft Teams. The Chair thanked Mr Mike Scurr for Chairing the previous meeting.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Mr Mike Scurr (MS)
Mr Sphiwo Mavumengwana (SM)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Mr Rashed Fataar (RF)
Mr Jason Knight (JK)
Mr David Gibbs (DG)
Mr Gaarith Williams (GW)

Staff

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Hendro Hugo
Ms Ameesha Sanker
Dr Janine Maske
Ms Ulrich Feiter
Mr Alison Turner
Mr Deon Steyn
Mr Lourens Blignaut
Mr Gus Van Der Spek
Ms Louise Hyde

Ms Berta Hayes
Mr Andre Vercuil
Mr Lance Del Monte
Mr Lesley Armstrong
Ms Kate O'Dowd
Ms Giselle Courtney
Mr John Armstrong
Mr Gerhard Swart
Mr Alexis Van der Merwe
Ms Edna Blignaut

3. Apologies

None

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 10 February 2021

The Committee resolved to approve the Agenda dated 10 February 2021 without changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 13 January 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 13 January 2021 and resolved to approve them with no amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- DG: item 13.2 (potentially) and 13.4
- DS: item 24.1
- SW: item 24.1
- MS: item 24.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Appointments

8.1 None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM provided the committee with a reported back on the outcomes of the following Appeals and Tribunal matters for noting:

- Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 86617, 16 Wherry Road, Muizenberg
- The Proposed Alterations and Additions of Erf 649, 19 Torbay Road, Greenpoint
- The Proposed Mixed-Use Development on Erf 8019. Sir Lowry Square, Woodstock
- RE of Erf 49306, Cannon Brewery, Newlands

9.2 Committee starting time

The Committee resolved to remain with the starting time of 09:00 for IACom meetings.

9.3 Draft Heritage Protocol

The matter has been set aside for next meeting.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections/Virtual Assessments undertaken:

None

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

PM presented a verbal report which was noted by the Committee.

CM also provided feedback pertaining to new appointments for the Appeals, BELCom and IGIC Committees from the Council meeting dated the 18th January 2021

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

- Item 11.1 Proposed Pedestrian Bridge and Ramp along the Eerste Rivier, Erven 5667 and 7587 (Pedestrian Bridge) and 5667 (Pedestrian Ramp), Stellenbosch

- Item 13.2 (with Mr Mike Scurr as Acting Chair, due to DG having recused himself) Proposed Redevelopment of the Site on Erf 56421 1 Torquay Avenue, Claremont

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

- Item 13.3: Proposed Rezoning, Construction of a Conference Venue, Restaurant, Spa and Associated Infrastructure, Glenhof, Erf 50339, 12 Glenhof Road, Claremont
- Item 15.1: Proposed Boutique Hotel Development, Franschhoek Pass Winery, Farm No 1545 Paarl, Franschhoek

10.5 HWC and DEA&DP Standard Operating Procedure (SOP)

Nothing to report.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 Proposed Pedestrian Bridge and Ramp along the Eerste Rivier, Erven 5667 and 7587 (Pedestrian Bridge) and 5667 (Pedestrian Ramp), Stellenbosch: NM HM/ CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH/ ERVEN 5667, 7587, 5667

Case No: 21011803SB0120E

Notification of Intent to Develop (NID) and associated documentation prepared by Graham Jacobs were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Graham Jacobs (Heritage Consultant), Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Mr Hendro Hugo (Architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The bridge position has been corrected in the revised HIA.
- Level changes are noted, and pedestrian ramp designed according to previously approved plans.
- The intervention does not change the character of the site which is greater than 5000sq/m.
- The intervention is contained within a heavily treed area.
- The proposed intervention will provide amenity value.

RESPONSE TO NID:

The Committee supports the recommendation that S38 is not triggered and therefore no further heritage studies are required.

SB

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 None

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

13.1 Proposed 'Seven Oaks' Retirement Village on Erven 103, 104 and a Section of Rotterdam Street, Wittedrift, Bitou Municipality: MA HM/EDEN/WITTEDRIFT/ERVEN 103, 104 AND A SECTION OF ROTTERDAM STREET

Case No: 19090401AS0927E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr Andre Vercuil (Heritage Consultant), Ms Ameesha Sanker (Sharples Environmental Services) and Mr Lance Del Monte (Town and Regional Planner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The identification of heritage resources needs to include and address the cultural landscape (which incorporates the townscape), settlement pattern and built-form character of the area.
- Figure-ground relationships, scale, grain, texture, and typology of buildings was assessed.
- Assessment of significance, both in terms of grading of the buildings individually and of the cultural landscape (village and its setting) accumulatively and holistically was not conducted.
- Extent to which the current proposal is at variance with settlement character.

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee noted that S38(3) requirements have not been fully met. The following needs to be included in the submission:

1. Analysis of the cultural landscape, including the built form.
2. Assessment of the significance of the heritage resources identified, including the grading of individual buildings and the cultural landscape as a whole.
3. Development of a set of heritage indicators which will inform the design response (and against which the design response may be assessed).

TZ

13.2 Proposed New Residential Development Farm 4722, Wellington:MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/WELLINGTON/FARM 4722

Case No: 17080109ZK0122M

Heritage Impact Assessment Supplementary Report prepared by ARCON, specialist architectural and heritage consultants dated 23 November 2020 was tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

The Chair, Mr David Gibbs disclosed prior involvement with the site in providing visual impact assessment in 2018. In light of this Mr Gibbs volunteered to recuse himself from the item, however neither the applicant, heritage consultant nor the Interested and Affected Parties (I&APs) objected to Mr Gibbs Chairing the item.

Mr Graham Jacobs (Heritage Consultant), Dr Janine Maske (Blouville Action Group), Mr Lesley Armstrong (Objector), Mr John Armstrong (Objector), Ms Ulrich Feiter (Objector), Ms Kate O'Dowd (Objector), Ms Alison Turner (Objector), Ms Giselle Courtney (Land owner and member of Blouville Action Group), Mr Lourens Blignaut (Objector), Mr Gerhard Swart (Town Planner), Mr Deon Steyn (Objector) and Ms Edna Blignaut were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HWC is a commenting authority in this case
- Complexity around the Heritage Protection Overlay Zone (HPOZ) and urban edge impacting on the site
- Noting that the proposal has gone through several iterations overtime, towards an appropriate proposal.
- The role of the site within an urban- rural transition zone
- Seeking an appropriate agricultural or rural settlement pattern, as opposed to a suburban typology.
- Balancing conservation with development within the site.
- While the proposed density has been reduced, the pattern of the development proposed remains largely suburban.
- Given all of these concerns, the Committee feels that further mitigation measures are required.
- These measures are to ensure that a clearly defined and appropriate interface between the urban environment and the rural (urban edge) is not only created, but sustained.

INTERIM COMMENT/FURTHER REQUIREMENT:

In order to address these concerns, the Committee recommends the following:

1. A green, planted buffer be established
2. That buffer is to be collectively managed and maintained
3. That to create this buffer, the two large erven should be removed
4. Views from the Blouville Road scenic route along the development edge and represented by 2 and 4 quadrants, including the 10-meter setback, should be illustrated using 3D designs.

TZ

13.3 Proposed Rezoning, Construction of a Conference Venue, Restaurant, Spa and Associated Infrastructure, Glenhof, Erf 50339, 12 Glenhof Road, Claremont: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CLAREMONT / ERF 50339

Case No: 19022808HB0524E

Heritage Impact Assessment and associated documentation prepared by Claire Abrahamse were tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (DS, CM, MS, SW and RF).

SB

13.4 Proposed Redevelopment of the Site on Erf 56421 1 Torquay Avenue, Claremont: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56421

Case No: 20081705KB0718E

DG recused himself and joined the participants to hear the matter. The Committee nominated and confirmed MS to chair this item.

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Alexis Van der Merwe (The Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association) was present and took part in the discussions.

HELD OVER:

The Committee referred the matter back to the legal advisor to confirm the correct legal process in order to take the matter forward.

KB

14 SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15 SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

**15.1 Proposed Boutique Hotel Development, Franschhoek Pass Winery, Farm No 1545 Paarl,
Franschhoek: MA
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / FRANSCHHOEK / FARM1545**

Case No: 20012313AS0225E

Revised Heritage Impact Assessment and associated documentation including Archaeological Impact Assessment (AIA) prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue were tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (DS, MS, SW and RF).

SB

16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

16.1 None

**17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF
INTENT TO DEVELOP**

17.1 None

18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT

18.1 None

19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT

19.1 None

20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

20.1 None

21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT

21.1 None

22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT

22.1 None

23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES

23.1 None

24. ADVICE

**24.1 RE of Erf 49306, Cannon Brewery, Newlands: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/RE ERF 49036**

Case No: 17022304AS0306E

DS and SW recused themselves and logged off from MS Teams. MS recused himself and joined the participants.

PM introduced the case.

Tribunal decision and way forward.

Mr Mike Scurr (Heritage Consultant), Mr Gus Van Der Spek (Applicant) and Mr Alexis Van der Merwe (The Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussion.

ADVICE:

The Committee considered the Tribunal ruling and referred this matter to the legal advisor for clarity.

WD

25 SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS

25.1 None

26. OTHER

26.1 None

27 Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above. CM moved to endorse and adopt the resolutions and decisions and DS seconded.

28. CLOSURE:

The meeting adjourned at 13:45

29. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

10th March 2021

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: