

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 18 September 2024 via MS
Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Siphiwo Mavumengwana (SM)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)

Members of Staff:

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Emily-Jan Vowles (EJV)
Ms Chiara Singh (CSi)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)

Visitors:

Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Frederick Jantjes
Mr Richard Perfect
Mr Shilo Hope
Mr Chris Heunis
Mr Chris Snelling
Mr Johan Malherbe
Mr Philip Smith
Ms Dana Buys
Mr Hassan Asmal
Mr Jan Groenewald
Ms Elize Mendelsohn

Mr Tyrone Engel
Ms Berta Hayes
Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Nicolene Visser
Ms Uryke du Preez
Mr Jaco Coetzer
Ms Larisa Brody
Ms Cindy de Bruyn
Mr Andre Willem Carstens
Mr Mujahied Barnes
Ms Tracey Chalmers

Apologies

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 18 September 2024.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 18 September 2024.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 28 August 2024

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 28 August 2024 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

None

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matter:

- Farm 1796, C'est La Vie, Olyvenbosch Road, Wellington

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.

For noting.

8.5 Erf 653-RE, 41 Lourens Street, Somerset West

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee supports the application for rezoning of Erf 653-RE, 41 Lourens Street, Somerset West to the new zoning LB2 (Local Business) as not impacting heritage resources.

8.6 Feedback on online attendance register, claim forms and editing of minutes.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 922, 34 Durbanville Avenue, Durbanville
- Proposed Additions and Alteration Erf 232, 134 Beach Road, Gordons Bay

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Alterations, Additions & Partial Demolition on Erf 16489, 25 Shannon Street, Salt River
- Proposed Addition on Farm 950-Re, Vrede & Lust Farm, Simondium

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Deviation from previous approval on Farm 774-RE, Rose Garden, Vergelegen Estate, Lourensford Road, Somerset West (unauthorized demolition): MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ FARM 744-RE

Case No: HWC24041609SJ0423

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Stuart Hermansen (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- An HWC Permit was issued in June 2024 for three buildings associated with the Rose Garden Precinct, being, a conversion of the existing ablutions to a Garden Shop, upgrading the Picnic Pavilion, and a new Ablution block building.
- The heritage consultant explained that upon closer inspection the Picnic Pavilion was found to be structurally unstable, hence the decision to demolish the structure and rebuild as per approved plans was made.
- This was done without informing the Vergelegen Heritage Oversight Committee or HWC.
- While the unauthorised work only affects the Picnic Pavilion, the permit includes all three.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to revoke the permit issued for additions and alterations as approved on 3 June 2024. The applicant is to submit a new application, this application is to include mitigation arguments to address illegal demolition of the building.

SJ

**11.2 Proposed Addition on Farm 237, 48 Boom Street, Elim: NM
HM / OVERBERG / CAPE AGULHAS / ELIM / FARM 237**

Case No: HWC24080125SJ0717

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Tyrone Engel (architect) and Mr Frederick Jantjes (I&APs) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site falls in Elim Zone 2 which is the 'transitional' zone.
- The proposal is for a gabled forward extension of an early 1900s cottage.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. The forward-facing gable is a foreign element in Elim, the precedent is for flat roof extensions to the front façade.
2. Clarification as to the number of similar extensions to Boom Street is to be presented. These dwellings should be marked on the layout plan of Elim. Annotated photographs to be provided.
3. Revised drawings and requested information to be submitted to HOMs for consideration.

SJ

**11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4849, 82 Ryneveld Street (Section 2), Stellenbosch: NM
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / ERF 4849**

Case No: HWC24081920CN0819

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group), Mr Richard Perfect (architect) and Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site forms part of Proteahof, a collection of highly significant row houses dating from the 1860s.
- The site is a PHS and graded IIIA.
- The proposed work is for extensive interior alterations, which was not supported by Stellenbosch Interest Group and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Ground floor: while the Committee is concerned about the extent of demolition of the internal and rear walls, the remodelling would be acceptable provided that overall structural stability will not be affected.

2. The structural engineer's report is required.
3. The front façade should not be altered in any way.
4. The rear façade first floor modifications are not consistent with the character of the row houses.
5. Compatible materials to be used throughout including lime renders and mortars.
6. Revised drawings must be circulated to I&APs for comment when submitted to BELCom.

CN

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 922, 34 Durbanville Avenue, Durbanville: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DURBANVILLE/ ERF 922**

Case No: HWC24072215CH0813

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Thursday, 10 October 2024 at 12:30.

CH

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alteration Erf 232, 134 Beach Road, Gordons Bay: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GORDONS BAY/ERF 232**

Case No: HWC24022305SB0319

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Thursday, 10 October 2024 at 11:00.

SB

**13.2 Proposed Addition on Farm 950-Re, Vrede & Lust Farm, Simondium: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / SIMONDIUM / FARM 950-RE**

Case No: HWC24071907SJ0726

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 11 September 2024.
See attached annexure SI1.

Mr Johan Malherbe (architect), Mr Dana Buys (representing owners) and Mr Hassan Asmal were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HWC does not condone unauthorised work. The current work has significantly negatively impacted on the heritage resource. The applicant has admitted that he has continued with the work despite the issuing of a stop works order. The application is accordingly refused.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The application is refused, and the Committee recommends HWC press criminal charges.

SJ

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 19, 10 The Bend Road, Pinelands: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / PINELANDS / ERF 19

Case No: HWC23040304RG0425

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and in the Pinelands HPOZ, with a mid-20th c (c.1935) house described as a 'fairly good architectural example'.
- Given the site's location on the edge of the HPOZ facing the railway line, a more pragmatic approach is being taken by CoCT towards the proposals for double storey additions. These have been revised and are now supported by CoCT.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as detailed on drawings numbered 2021013 Pages 1 and 2, prepared by S.M.W Consulting, dated July 2024 as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

EJV

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 179757, 3 Royal Road, Muizenberg: MA HWC/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MUIZENBERG/ ERF 179757

Case No: HWC2408131SJ0729

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Philip Smith (CoCT), Mr Mujahied Barnes (architect), Mr Jan Groenewald (neighbour) and Ms Tracey Chalmers (neighbour) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and is located in between two immediately adjacent HPOZ areas.

- There is a long history of unauthorised work at this site.
- Further revisions have been presented.
- CoCT and Muizenberg Historical Society support the revisions, but with conditions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee acknowledges the large amount of work done to the design however certain design refinements are required. The staircase on Royal Road remains a contentious issue. The applicant is requested to consider I&APs comments, incorporate changes, if necessary and submitted to BELCom.

SJ

**13.5 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 16489, 25 Shannon Street, Salt River: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SALT RIVER / ERF 16489**

Case No: HWC24041607CN0408

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 11 September 2024. See attached annexure SI2.

Mr Hassan Asmal (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Located inside the Salt River triangle, the site is graded IIIC and not in an HPOZ.
- The subject building forms part of a unique collection of single-story Cape Revival row houses, set in a mixed-use area that includes several large buildings. The back of the subject building borders on the historic buildings of the Wesley Training School.
- The proposal is for a vertical extension, set back from the front and stepping up to two and then a third level right at the back.
- The impact of a three-story high blank wall facing the school grounds was discussed.
- Other houses in this collection have added vertical extensions, with the criteria for these to be set back and flat roofed so as not to impact the view line from the street.
- The Committee proposed the double storey/roof deck configuration and strong edge, the application to pursue such. HWC would approve this version.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as detailed on drawings numbered A101, A102 - Revision A, prepared by AC from ACG Architects dated 29 June 2023 as not negatively impacting the heritage resources.

CN

**13.6 Erf 5789, 34 Jan Van Riebeeck, Wellington: NM
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / WELLINGTON / ERF 5789**

Case No: HWC24072501SB0726

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Cindy de Bruyn (representing the owner) and Mr Andre Willem Carstens (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This semi-detached house is graded IIIC and falls in the Special Character Protected Area of Wellington.
- Discussion concerned minor alterations that were not on previously approved plans, and a proposal for alteration to an existing loft studio. The studio extension is located at the back of the house and would not be visible from the street.

RECORD OF DECISION:

HWC does not condone illegal work however considers that there has been no impact on heritage resources with the enclosure of the patio and construction of the fireplace. The vertical extension applied for and detailed on drawings numbered 1084 Rev A prepared Andre Carstens Architecture dated 26 October 2023 is approved as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

SB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. OTHER

22.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 13:25

24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

23 October 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____



DATE 23-10-2024

SECRETARY _____



DATE: 23 October 2024