



**APPROVED MINUTES TEMPLATE OF A MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE (HWC)
INVENTORIES, GRADING, AND INTERPRETATION COMMITTEE (IGIC) HELD ON THE 8th
November 2024, AT 09H00 VIA TEAMS**

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Mr. Ron Martin, opened the meeting at 9:11 and welcomed everyone present.

Mr Ron Martin recused himself and left the meeting @13:24 and Ms. Jenna Lavin took over as the Chairperson .

2. Attendance

IGIC Committee

Mr. Ron Martin (RM) Left 13:24
Ms. Laura Milandri (LM)
Ms. Jenna Lavin (JL)
Ms. Emmylou Bailey (EB)
MS. Robyn Humphreys (RH)
Prof. Leslie Witz (LW)

HWC Staff

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel (JW)
Ms. Cecilene Muller (CM)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee
Mr. Ruan Brand (RB)
Ms Emily Vowel (EjV)
Mr. Olwethu Dlova (OD)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)

Visitors

Ms. Maurietta Stewart
Mr Philip Smith
Ms. Mabeth Crafford
Dr. Antonia Malan

Ms. Harriet Clift
Mr. Shilo Hope
Ms. Sarah Winter
Ms. Matimba Baloyi

3. Apologies

Ms. Lynn Abrahams (LA)

Absent

4 Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

4.1 Declaration for members to re-affirm their commitment to the Code of Conduct

5 Approval of the agenda dated 8th November 2024.

5.1 The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 8th November 2024 with minor edits. L.M moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and J.L seconded.

6 Approval of the previous minutes dated 2nd of August 2024.

6.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 2nd of August 2024 with minor edits J.L moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and E.B seconded. 2024

7 Disclosure of conflict of interest

7.1 J.L 20.1

8. Confidential Matters

8.1 None

9 Appointments

9.1 None

10 Administrative Matters

10.1 Report back on Appeals, Tribunals. **PM**

10.2 UCT Conservation Framework-Heritage Agreement. CM

The current status quo remains, with the UCT Council still having to provide approval and sign the Heritage Agreement.

10.3 Elands Bay Cave Baboon Point-Signage. CM

A compulsory site inspection for potential service providers was undertaken in October 2024.

10.4 Call for PHS Nominations. CM

The call has been published on the HWC website on the 29th of October 2024.

10.5 Number system for Provincial Heritage Sites (Resources). CM

HWC staff at HOMs suggested that a number system be assigned to the processes pertaining to PHS nomination and declaration similar to the filing system used by SAHRA for declared sites.

10.6 Quick Response Code Unveiling Ceremony-Princess Vlei-19th of November 2024. CM

All arrangements for the QR Code Plaque Unveiling Ceremony for the Princess Vlei PHS to be delivered. The Provincial Minister, Ricardo Mackenzie, will deliver the keynote address.

10.7 Replacement of PHS Plaques. CM

This relates to PHS Plaques which have been vandalised or stolen. The following was discussed:

- Replication of plaques was considered, especially the old National Monuments Council plaque. However, sites that were previously National Monuments (NM) may not qualify as Provincial Heritage Sites in terms of the criteria outlined in the NHRA.
- The Review of previous NM was meant to be completed by 2005.
- The IGIC has the mandate to continue with this process.
- A good starting point would be to update the existing list of NM, and follow a process of grading these sites in terms of the criteria in the NHRA
- This process would assist with the "transformation of the heritage landscape" by de-emphasizing old NMs and highlighting PHSs that meet the criteria in the NHRA
- CM to circulate updated list to IGIC for review.

10.8 Exemptions Areas (report back). JW

The process for the exemption of 7 geographical areas in terms of S.34 and S.38 within Mitchells Plain, Ottery/Lansdowne, Airport Industria, Flamingo, a Portion of Voortrekker Road, Kuils River and Atlantis is completed and gazetted as such and is finalised.

10.9 Athlone Power Station (report back). JW

The APS has been provisionally protected until finalisation of the PHS declaration process.

10.10 Green Point Common PHS Nomination (report back). JW

The Green Point Common PHS is completed and gazetted. The only thing remaining is to put up the plaque.

10.11 Kasteelberg PHS Nomination (report back). JW

The Kasteelberg PHS nomination was supported by IGIC and approved by the Council on 30 August 2024. The owner of the site however appealed the Council decision to the Tribunal. The owner has requested that the matter be put in front of the Tribunal in Jan 2025.

The IGIC recommended that an archeologist join the Tribunal for this matter to assist in explaining the scientific value of the site.

10.12 Draft CBD Local Spatial Development Framework (to be discussed at IACom on 13 November 2024). JW

Members of IGIC to attend IACom on 13 November to hear this item.

10.13 Fagan Nomination for Noting. SJ

A thirty-minute presentation was given by Ms. Jhupsee regarding a possible serial nomination of three Fagan Properties. It was noted that one of the three properties is already graded as IIIB by the approved City of Cape Town Inventory. The following feedback was given by the Committee:

HWC IGIC Minutes 8th November 2024.

- The nomination of architectural sites in affluent areas is a questionable use of HWC's resources, given the current need to diversify the types of sites that are nominated/proclaimed.
- The controversial nature of Gabriel Fagan's past conservation methodologies (eg. Approach to Tulbagh restoration) was noted for the record.
- The Provincial significance of the sites (as opposed to local significance) must be clearly articulated in the nomination dossier.

IGIC must evaluate a submitted nomination proposal before any consultation on this matter can be undertaken.

11 Standing Items

11.1 Report back on Council Meetings. RM

11.1.1 None

11.2 Site Inspections Undertaken & Report

11.2.1 None

11.3. Proposed Site Inspection

11.3.1 None

12 Policy Matters

12.1 Policy and Procedure including Heritage Register documents. JW

Invitation be circulated via email.

The committee agrees to respond to JW with any comments by the 15th of November 2024.

12.2 Delegation of powers i.e. S30 of the NHRA to the IGIC. PM

PM presented her submission to Council for the amendment of the delegation for IGIC.

The IGIC supports the submission.

RECOMMENDATION

The delegations of the Council of HWC be amended as per the attached annexure.

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 Proposed nominations of Provincial Heritage Sites

13.1 Battle of Muizenberg, Muizenberg. (MA)

S27 Nomination Form & Motivation

Ms Cecilene Muller gave the presentation.

Ms Maurietta Stewart and Mr Philip Smith (City of Cape Town) was present and took part in the discussion

HWC IGIC Minutes 8th November 2024.

DISCUSSION

The following was discussed:

- The matter was previously heard at the IGIC Committee meeting on the 2nd of August 2024 wherein IGIC agreed that this is a Grade II resource.
- The 30-day formal consultation process with the owner, occupier was undertaken and has concluded with the City of Cape Town providing a letter of support for the declaration of the site as a PHS.
- It was noted by the City of Cape Town representative that the 60-day broader public participation process can only start in January 2025 due to City of Cape Town policy regarding consultation during the festive period .

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee recommends that the 60-day broader public participation consultation process in terms of s27(8) of the NHRA be undertaken.

CM

13.2 Javia Street Masjid, 43 Market Street, Strand. (MA)

Proposed Provincial Heritage Site Nomination

Ms Cecilene Muller gave the presentation.

DISCUSSION

The following was discussed:

- The matter was previously heard at the IGIC Committee meeting on the 2nd of August 2024, where additional motivation for PHS status was requested
- Although no new information was provided, members of the Committee have undertaken additional reading regarding the site. In light of their findings, the
- Committee agrees that the Javia Street Masjid is a Grade II heritage resource.
- A rich intangible heritage is associated with the Masjid.
- That the s27(8) 60 – day broader public participation process be undertaken keeping in mind that the City of Cape Town processes can only start in January 2025 due to City of Cape Town policy regarding consultation during the festive period .

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee recommends that the 60-day formal public participation consultation process in terms of S27(8) of the NHRA be undertaken.

CM

13.3 **Hen and Chicken Rocks, corner of Upper Bebington and Monterey Avenue
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WYNBERG/BISHOPSCOURT AND CONSTANTIA**

Proposed Provincial Heritage Site Nomination.

Ms Cecilene Muller gave the presentation.

Dr Antonia Malan was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

The following was discussed:

- The dossier proposes that the significance of the site relates to its scientific significance as a beacon and as an extraordinary landmark, and in relation to its association with "Van Riebeeck's Hedge."
- It was noted that Van Riebeeck's Hedge has gone through a thorough evaluation process in terms of the criteria of the NHRA and the cultural value of this site has been amended in a revised statement of significance as follows (dealt with of a previous IGIC meeting).
Recent historical research has proved that the hedge, envisaged by Van Riebeeck in 1660, never materialized. It has also been clarified that the intention of the hedge was not to keep indigenous tribes out of the Cape settlement, but to protect crops and contain livestock. The bitter almond trees were not planted by Van Riebeeck but were proclaimed a National Heritage Site in 1936 based on deception and misinformation. For decades writers, journalists and historians were duped by the myth of the so-called hedge, reinforcing the ideology of colonial division, exclusion and racism. This site is significant as an example of the power of mythmaking and thus the importance of thorough, accurate historical research in the process of identifying and declaring heritage sites is essential.
- The dossier contains a number of statements of conjecture with qualifying statements such as "most likely" and "would have been" which require evidential support or should be removed from the nomination dossier.

COMMENT

The Committee notes that based on the information provided the site does not satisfy the criteria to be designated Grade II heritage resource.

CM

14.1 Provincial Heritage Site plaque replacement

14.1 None

HWC IGIC Minutes 8th November 2024.

15 Sections 27, 28, 29, 30 & 31 Formal Protections

15.1 None

16. Section 29: Proposed provincial protection for discussion

16.1 None

CM

17. Proposed Exemptions

17.1 None

18. Conservation Body Registration

18.1 None

19. Amendment of conservation body boundaries

19.1 None

20. Surveys/Inventories

20.1 Draft Napier Heritage Inventory Report

S30(6) Draft Documents

Ms. J.L recused herself from the meeting as a member of the IGIC Committee.

Ms. Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

The following was discussed:

- The matter was previously heard at the IGIC Committee meeting on the 2nd of August 2024, where the Committee endorsed the report and encouraged the applicant to proceed with the public participation process.
- The Committee noted that the public participation process was advertised to all relevant interested and affected parties, and included a workshop in Napier.
- The proposed Heritage Area is enlarged, as a result of the Public Participation Process.
- The report's recommended practice of placemaking is a good initial beginning for recognising significant intangible and living heritage and the committee commend the applicants for addressing this and encourages an ongoing process of involving the public in finding the most effective and sustainable ways to identify and acknowledge this heritage.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the inventory in terms of S30(5) and S31 and the public participation process as submitted as fulfilling the criteria set out by the NHRA and HWC.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee recommends to Council:

1. That the 159 sites that have been identified as conservation worthy (Appendix 2) are formally protected through placement on the Heritage Register.
2. That the proposed Heritage Area mapped in Figure 7.8 is formally protected and the recommended Zoning Scheme provisions are implemented and adopted in the Cape Agulhas Municipality SDF (Table 7).
The Committee recommends to the Cape Agulhas Municipality:
3. The decision-making criteria (Section 7.5) and guidelines (Appendix 4) are adopted and implemented.
4. A heritage advisory committee is established for Napier
5. The identified opportunities for heritage celebration and placemaking are implemented by the Cape Agulhas Municipality (Section 8)
6. The committee recommends that the Municipality, together with the proposed Heritage Advisory Committee for Napier, continue with the iterative process of including and recognising the intangible and living heritage of Napier through further open public consultation. This process and its outcomes should be iteratively included in the Napier Heritage Inventory in a manner that reflects and promotes the conservation of the significance of these heritage resources.

CM

21. Other

21.1 None

22. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

The Committee unanimously adopted the decisions and resolutions, with EM proposing and LM seconding the proposal.

23. Date of next meeting:

26th November 2024

24. CLOSURE: 13:56

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON



DATE

15 May 2025

SECRETARY _____ DATE _____

APPROVED