

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held via MS Teams
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 9 April 2025**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr David Gibbs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr David Gibbs (DG) (Chair)
Dr Antonia Malan (AM)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Ms Katie Smuts (KS)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH)
Mr Chefferino Fortuin (CF)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Mr Graham Jacobs (co-opted)

Staff

Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJh)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel (SVMB)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Emily-Jane Vowles (EJV)
Ms Chiara Singh (CS)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)

Observers

None

Visitors

Ms Alida Pople
Mr Clive Theunissen
Ms Katherine Robinson
Mr Andre Wiehahn
Mr Bruce Wilson
Mr Daryl Sher
Mr Chris Snelling
Ms Juliette Souchon
Mr Bruce Eitzen
Mr Shilo Hope
Mr Charles Jordaan
Ms Nina
Mr Neil Moir
Ms Vanessa von der Heyde
Snr Chief Ewold Smith
Ms Nazeema Duarte
Mr Kevin Maart

Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Mark Bell
Ms Charlotte Chamberlian
Ms Cindy Postlethwayt
Ms Jeanne Goodall
Ms Heidi Newton-King
Ms Ursula Rigby
Mr Neil Basson
Ms Emmylou Bailey
Mr Etienne Coetzer
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Myron Carolus
Mr Rudi Botha
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue
Mr Lawrence van Wilgen
Mr Brett Arendze

Mr William Pulles
Mr Stefan Vermeulen

Ms Zharon
Mr Rian Gedenhuys

3. Apologies

Ms Samantha Lee (SL)

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 9 April 2025

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 9 April 2025 with minor changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 10 March 2025

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 10 March 2025 and resolved to approve them as circulated without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest and acceptance of the code of conduct

- KS: item 13.2
- DG: item 13.2
- SW: item 13.2

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None.

8. Appointments

None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 56314, 64 Newlands Road, Claremont
- Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 168487, 124 Waterkant Street, Cape Town
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1397, Bonne Esperance Boutique Guest House, 17 Van Riebeeck Street, Stellenbosch

9.2 IACom in-person meeting

The Committee resolved to hold the in-person meeting on 11 June 2025.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections/Virtual Assessments undertaken:

- Proposed Development on Erf 16502, 16503-RE, 16507-RE, 16508-RE, 16510-RE etc., Welgevallen, University of Stellenbosch, Stellenbosch
- Ptn 28 Farm Welmoed 468, Lynedoch Village, off R310, Stellenbosch
- Farm 845 Portion 5, Drakenzicht 3, Wemmershoek Road, Paarl

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

Nothing to report.

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

For discussion.

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Construction of a Packing Shed on Erf 42368, 12 Cecilia Street, Goedemoed Farm, Paarl
- Proposed Development on Erf 26439, Alexandra Road, Oude Molen Eco Village, Pinelands
- Erven 1502329-RE; 156138 (Erven 178896; 178895), 122 Boyes Drive and 7 Carisbrooke Steps, St. James
- Erf 878, Fontein Street, Riebeek Kasteel, Swartland

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 None

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 Proposed Development on Erf 16502, 16503-RE, 16507-RE, 16508-RE, 16510-RE, Welgevallen, University of Stellenbosch, Stellenbosch: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 16502, 16503-RE, 16507-RE, 16508-RE, 16510-RE

Case No: HWC24112203CH0218

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 4 April 2025.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant) and Ms Alida Pope were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Area 4b is the priority area for now.
- The development framework follows a Package of Plans approach.
- Historical archaeologist and palaeontologist included in the study.

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee endorsed the general heritage indicators as well as the area specific indicators (area 4) as indicated in sections 6 and 7 of the Heritage Statement, dated 17 January 2025 as prepared by ARCON to enable the design development to proceed. The area specific heritage-related development indicators are to be read in conjunction with Diagrams SESR 0.1. The site-specific heritage-related development indicators for area 4 are to be read in conjunction with SESR 4.1 and SESR 4.2.

CH

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

**13.1 Proposed Construction of a Packing Shed on Erf 42368, 12 Cecilia Street, Goedemoed Farm, Paarl: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 42368**

Case No: HWC24080128CN0814

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (CF, DS, AM and KS).

CN

**13.2 Proposed Development on Erf 26439, Alexandra Road, Oude Molen Eco Village, Pinelands: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / PINELANDS / ERF 26439**

Case No: 21022615SB0330E/ 21012506TZ0126E

DG, SW and KS recused themselves and logged off from MS Teams. The Committee nominated DS to chair this item.

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 25 April 2025 (DS, CF, GJ, AM and IGIC member).

SB

**13.3 Erven 1502329-RE; 156138 (Erven 178896; 178895), 122 Boyes Drive and 7 Carisbrooke Steps, St. James: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ST. JAMES / ERVEN 1502329-RE; 156138 (ERVEN 178896; 178895)**

Case No: HWC24050602EJV0324

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, DG and KS).

EJV

**13.4 Proposed Redevelopment on Erf 31990-RE, 23 Main Road, Mowbray: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MOWBRAY/ ERF 31990-RE**

Case No: HWC24071109CN0717

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Mark Bell (CoCT), Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) and Ms Charlotte Chamberlain (RAMPAC) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT supported the proposal.
- RAMPAC did not support the proposal.
- IACom noted concern with the proposal in its current form.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Explore the street condition noting the constraints
2. The Main Road/ Rhodes Avenue corner be addressed.
3. Excessive Use of face brick on Rhodes Avenue façade.
4. Sheer massing of Rhodes Avenue edge. Setback required to address overbearing massing
5. Setting back of top three floors to address (mitigate) issue of inappropriate and looming massing.
6. Address the sheerness and overbearing massing of the corner of the proposed building. There needs to be an acknowledgement in terms of massing of the scale of the heritage buildings on the other three corners

CH

**13.5 Erf 3715, St Cyprian's School (New Art Block), 4 Gorge Road, Oranjezicht: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 3715**

Case No: 16041101KR0420M

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The City of Cape Town and CIBRA approve the proposal and the revised SDP.
- The replacement building is well designed and appropriate to the site.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the proposal, as being substantially in accordance with the HWC approval dated 24 May 2018, as per the drawings numbered SC19_S4 1.001, SC19_S4 1.002, SC19_S4 1.003 and SC19_S4 1.004, Revision A, dated 25 February 2025, and prepared by Meyer & Associates Architect and Urban Designers.

The existing building to be demolished is deemed not conservation-worthy and the Committee supports its demolition.

CH

14 SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15 SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

15.1 None

16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

**16.1 Farm 845 Portion 5, Drakenzicht 3 on Wemmershoek Road, Paarl: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / FARM 854 PORTION 5**

Case No: HWC23101707SB1018

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 4 April 2025.

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This is a new NEMA process.
- The current proposal is generally in accordance with the previously approved proposal.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee endorsed the HIA as meeting the requirements of Section 38(3) of the NHRA and supports the recommendations and mitigation measures of the HIA titled "Pre-Application Phase Heritage Impact Assessment: Proposed Redevelopment of Portion 5/Farm 845 off R301 Paarl: Drakenzicht 3", prepared by Cindy Postlethwayt, dated to February 2025 as follows:

1. The development is generally in accordance with, and only in so far as it relates to heritage related aspects, the layout and associated guidelines and documents described in this report as the Preferred Alternative,
2. The mitigation measures described in this Report and already included in the development plans are to be implemented in full in all important respects. To accompany the development proposal, the following drawings as per the planning, design and detail considerations described in this document and which already show the mitigations are to accompany the planning application: Landscape Development Plan (prepared by a SACLAP - registered Professional Landscape Architect), indicating the position and hierarchy of all public open spaces as well as tree planting. Landscape Details (prepared by a SACLAP - registered Professional Landscape Architect):

- a. indicating the proposed landscaping treatment of the 30m wide buffer strip interface with the R301 including a detailed section (minimum 1:100)
 - b. indicating the proposed landscaping treatment of the interface with the ecological corridor to the south
 - c. indicating suggested plant species list for trees, shrubs and groundcovers (including total areas, planting - out sizes and planting - out ratios),
 - d. details of proposed security / boundary treatment (visually transparent, welded mesh fence recommended)
 - e. no continuous solid masonry walls;
 - f. rather visually permeable, non - obtrusive farm fences),
 - g. details of proposed footways (including suggested materials),
 - h. indication of lighting and signage and/or (discreet) way - finding system
 - i. positions to be included on plan,
 - j. storm water strategy (open, planted channels and swales recommended), and
 - k. details of parking including screening (berming / planting - again no kerbs, paving of parking to reflect in - situ soil colours, include list of suggested materials)
3. Construction phase: Careful environmental management measures must be enacted to prevent damage to surrounding soil, vegetation and drainage lines. Dust control measures must be put in place. The use of heavy machinery must be minimised to prevent scarring and erosion of the site and cut and fill operations must be minimized.
 4. Operational phases: Although the proposed buildings need to be further developed in terms of typology criteria within their landscape context, additional landscaping and screen planting will reduce the visual impact further and help to settle and anchor the new buildings into their context. Screen and shade planting will also help to reduce the visibility of buildings, and to provide a greater degree of privacy. Careful consideration must be applied to the parking of vehicles – as far as possible visiting vehicles should be parked in the shade, or screened behind berms or hedges, to prevent reflected glare from wind shields. Parking areas must be unobtrusive and surfaced with exposed aggregate or clay brick rather than asphalt.

EJV

16.2 Farm 1006 Portion 4 of Portion 1, Meerlust, Huguenot Road, Stellenbosch: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / FARM 1006 PORTION 4 OF PORTION 1

Case No 21070811AM0723E

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

Ms Katherine Robinson (Stellenbosch Municipality) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The revised proposal is greatly improved both architecturally and in its connection to context.
- Positive response to concerns previously raised by the Committee noted.
- Stellenbosch Municipality also supported the revision.
- Roof form, fragmentation, articulation and materiality are deemed appropriate.
- Detail of hard landscape and paving materials required (lacking on landscape plan).

- (hard landscaping materials need to be appropriate to context – extensive asphalt surfaces will not be supported by HWC).

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee supports the revised proposal on condition that a hard landscaping and paving/paved surfaces plan is submitted to HWC for approval prior to construction.

EJV

16.3 Ptn 28 Farm Welmoed 468 Lynedoch Village, Off R310, Stellenbosch: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / PORTION 28 OF FARM 468

Case No: HWC23040509AM0411

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 4 April 2025.

Ms Katherine Robinson (Stellenbosch Municipality), Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant), Ms Emmylou Bailey (heritage consultant), Mr Etienne Coetzer, Ms Vanessa von der Heyde, Mr Rudi Botha and Ms Nina were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee was concerned with the scale and typology of the development and its impact of the cultural landscape context.
- It is seen as a large suburban intervention in a significant rural landscape of regional significance.
- The 2019 SDP indicates a limited expansion of Lynedoch Village and appropriate uses. The SDP recommends that the majority of the area remains 'green'. The Committee endorses this recommendation.
- SIG and Stellenbosch Municipality comments are noted.
- The context is the 'agricultural foreground' leading to Stellenbosch as expressed in the Stellenbosch Municipality vision.
- Committee to review supply of external services.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee does not support the proposals in the current form. The proposals should be revised in accordance and alignment with the SDP to reduce negative impact on the cultural landscape and Lynedoch Village.

SB

**16.4 Mining Permit for Farm 1029-RE, Malmesbury, Saldanha Bay: NM
HM / WEST COAST / SALDANHA BAY / MALMESBURY / REMAINDER OF FARM 1029**

Case No: HWC24101601CSI1022 & 24101526

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

Ms Nazeema Duarte (Saldanha Bay Municipality), Mr Kevin Maart (Aikonese Cochoqua Tribal Council), Snr Chief Ewold Smith, Mr Brett Arendze, Mr Charles Jordaan and Ms Zharon were present and took part in the discussion.

HELD OVER:

The Committee requires the EAP to be present at the next meeting to clarify the public participation process that was followed and the heritage related comments that were received.

Csi

**16.5 Erf 878, Fontein Street, Riebeeck Kasteel, Swartland: MA
HM / WEST COAST / SWARTLAND / RIEBEECK KASTEEL / ERF 878**

Case No: 20030413SB0603E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (heritage consultant), Mr Bruce Eitzen (VIA specialist), Mr Neil Moir (I&AP) and Mr William Pulles (Riebeeck Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection and requested cross section to orient the project (SW, AM, KS, DG and DS).

SB

**17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF
INTENT TO DEVELOP**

17.1 None

18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT

18.1 None

19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT

19.1 None

20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

20.1 None

21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT

21.1 None

22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT

22.1 None

23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES

23.1 None

24. SECTION 47 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLANS

24.1 None

25. ADVICE

25.1 None

26. SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS

26.1 None

27. OTHER

27.1 None

28. Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above.

29. CLOSURE:

The meeting adjourned at 14:30

30. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

14 May 2025

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: