

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held via MS Teams
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 24 January 2024**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr David Gibbs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr David Gibbs (DG) (Chair)
Dr Antonia Malan (AM)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Ms Katie Smuts (KS)
Ms Samantha Lee (SL)
Mr Chefferino Fortuin (CF)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH)

Staff

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJh)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)

Observers

None

Visitors

Ms Anne-Marie Fick
Ms Auriel Jordaan
Mr Stefan de Kock
Mr Ritz de la Bat
Ms Nicolene Visser
Mr Roel Louw
Mr Gcobani Sipoyo
Mr Robin George
Mr Lauren Buchanan
Ms Natasha Higgitt
Mr Stuart Hermansen

Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Rudi Botha
Mr Daniel Erasmus
Mr Rudi Botha
Ms Rene Maria
Mr T Coetzer
Ms Leane De Wet
Mr Helmet Orffer
Mr Matthew Hirsch
Ms Ayesha Price

3. Apologies

None

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 24 January 2024

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 24 January 2024 with minor changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 6 December 2023

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 6 December 2023 and resolved to approve them as circulated without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest and acceptance of the code of conduct

- KS: item 13.1 and 13.3
- AM: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Appointments

None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

NR reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 567 and 568, 31 Belvedere Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA
- Proposed Emergency Roof Replacement on Erf 1427, Voortrek Street, Swellendam: NM
- Proposed Total Demolition and Replacement Structure on Erven 977 & 978, 11 & 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek

9.2 General Elections

For noting.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections/Virtual Assessments undertaken:

- None

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

Nothing to report.

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

For discussion.

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 None

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 None

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

13.1 Zommerlust Residential Development on Erf 21875, 193 Main Street, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 21875

Case No: 22072610SB0827E

KS and AM recused themselves and logged off from MS Teams.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Anne-Marie Fick (heritage consultant), Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality), Ms Auriel Jordaan (I&AP), Mr Rudi Botha (Urban Designer), Mr Stefan de Kock (heritage practitioner obo Zommerlust Estate), Mr Daniel Erasmus (Zommerlust Estate Homeowners Association), Mr Ritz de la Bat (Zommerlust Estate Homeowners Association), Mr T Coetzer, Mr Roel Louw and Ms Rene Brett (landscape architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This is a matter arising with a revised Phase 1 HIA responding to previous concerns raised by the Committee and comments from I&APs.
- Objections had been received from the Zommerlust Estate and others.
- The issue of site access and whether permission would be granted for site access via Second Avenue was raised.
- The retention of mature trees is addressed in the tree management plan and the findings and recommendations thereof will need to be included in a landscape plan.
- The Urban Design Framework has addressed previous concerns raised around the carrying capacity of the site to accommodate new development from a heritage perspective in terms of future building envelopes, providing conservation-worthy structures with sufficient breathing space and retaining landscape elements.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that the further requirements previously issued have been addressed and that the conceptual urban design framework is appropriate in context. The urban design framework and landscape intent need to be translated into the SDP for phase 2 assessment. In addition, the Phase 2 HIA will need to address the architectural approach to the new development.

SB

**13.2 Proposed Development of Erf 157 (Pacaltsdorp), George: MA
HM/ EDEN / GEORGE / PACALSDORP / ERF 157**

Case No: 18082018SB0831E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Helmut Orffer (architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Matter Arising.
- The palisade boundary fence has already been constructed and has negatively impact on Mission Street and Memoir Street.
- The architectural approach should respond to the local vernacular in terms of scale, form and materials.
- The risk of encountering burial sites during excavations particularly in the south triangle of the site (between points C, D, E) and the need for archaeological monitoring.

COMMENT:

In fulfilment of previous condition 1, which requires the appointment of an archaeologist responsible for monitoring all work undertaken within the southern triangle of the site (between points C, D and E), the applicant must submit the letter of the appointment of an archaeologist to HWC by 30th January 2024 (to confirm date).

The Committee notes that the approved landscape plan dated 2020 indicates proposed tree planting along Mission Street and that the updated landscape plan omits this tree planting. The Committee recommends that the boundary wall treatment which impacts negatively upon Mission Street be mitigated through the implementation of the landscape plan as approved (2020), inclusive of the planting along Mission Street.

SB

13.3 Proposed Chapel Street Upgrade on Erven RE-8000, RE-8203, RE-8204 and RE-9869, Chapel Street, District Six: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DISTRICT SIX / ERVEN RE-8000, RE-8203, RE-8204 and RE-9869

Case No: HWC23060908CN1116

KS recused herself and logged off from MS Teams.

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- SAHRA comments regarding the mosque (grade I heritage resources).
- Social history well integrated into the concept of memorialization.
- Street as place of memory.
- Extensive advertising has taken place however few responses were received.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by Katie Smuts from Rennie Scurr Adendorff and dated 6 December 2023 as meeting the requirements of S38(3) of the NHRA as well of the recommendations of the HIA as follows:

1. This HIA should be endorsed as fulfilling the requirements of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act.
2. The proposed interventions should be endorsed as not negatively impacting the heritage resources of Chapel Street.
3. The design proposal as illustrated in the following drawings should be approved:
 - a. 124.21-3.5.1 Revision C (2023-08-17)
 - b. 124.21-3.6.1 Revision E (2023-08-17)
 - c. 124.21-3.6.2 Revision E (2023-08-17)
 - d. 124.21-3.6.3 Revision E (2023-08-17)
 - e. 124.21-6.3 Revision A (2023-08-02)
4. Final design details should be submitted for review and approval by the City in terms of the Chapel Street Heritage Protection Overlay Zone regulations.

The Committee resolved to endorse interventions and approve the design proposals.

CN

14 SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15 SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

15.1 None

- 16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT**
16.1 None
- 17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP**
17.1 None
- 18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT**
18.1 None
- 19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT**
19.1 None
- 20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP**
20.1 None
- 21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT**
21.1 None
- 22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT**
22.1 None
- 23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES**
23.1 None
- 24. SECTION 47 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLANS**
- 24.1 Goedeverwachting Estate, 43/45 Old Sir Lowrys Pass, Somerset West: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SOMERSET WEST / FARM 1262**

Case No: HWC23112314SJ1130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Stuart Hermansen (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Key issues have been addressed to the satisfaction of the Committee in the Heritage Management Plan, especially towards recovery of the heritage significance.
- Noting the grading of the site as grade III heritage resource and not a PHS, the plan is not a CMP in terms of S47 of the NHRA and public participation is accordingly not required.
- The submission of a Heritage Management Plan is sufficient and will form the basis of a Heritage Agreement between HWC and the property owner.
- The incorporation of exclusion of permitting requirements for routine maintenance can be addressed in the Heritage Agreement.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the application (prepared by HH Architects and dated 24 January 2024) as a Heritage Management Plan and recommends the incorporation of the HMP into a Heritage Agreement between HWC and property owner.

SJ

25. ADVICE

25.1 None

26. SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS

26.1 None

27. OTHER

27.1 None

28. Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above.

29. CLOSURE:

The meeting adjourned at 12:00

30. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

21 February 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: