

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Tuesday, 30 April 2024 at 10:00,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms. Sneha Jhupsee officially opened the meeting at 10:02 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)
Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	(Admin)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	(Assistant Director: Professional Services)

Legal Advisor

Observers

Elaine Lamb

Visitors

Dimitri Jacobs (Owner)	Item 14.1
Garth Pool (Project Manager)	Item 13.11
Mr & Mrs Ryklief (Owners)	Item 13.7
Nicoline Jongens (Heritage Practitioner)	Item 13.2
Uryke du Preez (Observe)	Item 14.1
Robbie (Observe)	Item 14.2
Jonathan Kaplan (ACRM, consultant)	Item 14.38
Nicolene Visser (DHF)	Item 14.30

3. Apologies

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)	(Assistant Director: Legal)
Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

- 5.1.** 30 April 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
EJV moves to adopt the agenda and CH seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 6.1.** 22 April 2024. Held over to next meeting.

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site inspections undertaken

9.2 Proposed Site Inspection

9.3 Site Inspection Reports

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1. Joint Committee Meeting: 3 May 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

9.7. Incomplete Applications

14.3	14.9	14.10	14.11
14.13	14.15	14.16	14.17
14.20	14.26	14.29	14.31
14.34	14.39	14.41	

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.8.1. Kagga Kamma Pot

9.8.2. St Helena Bay Engagement: 9 July 2024

9.8.3. Swellendam Engagement: 16/17 May 2024

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

9.9.1. Concerns regarding increased unauthorized work within Drakenstein area to be discussed with the Drakenstein municipality.

9.10 Permit deadline: Friday, 3 May 2024 - 09:00

10. Administrative Matters

10.1 Oudtshoorn: Painting of Sandstone

HWC to request an application for the works carried out: materials used, specify the nature of what was proposed as well as the building use.

10.2 HOMs May Dates

Wednesday, 08 May 2024 – 08:30 (SJ)

Tuesday, 14 May 2024 – 10:00 (CN)

Tuesday, 21 May 2024 – 08:30 (CN)

Tuesday, 28 May 2024 – 08:30 (CN) – MA/NIDs only

11. Monitoring by practitioner

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 MATTERS ARISING

13.1 Erf 45682, 18 Bemont Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions

Case No: HWC24032801CH0403

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 18 April 2024
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- The proposal is to demolish and rebuild the boundary wall at the Rondebosch United Church. The existing low stone boundary wall will be replaced with a new low stone boundary wall and palisade fence above.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- CoCT advises that an alternative be explored to repair and maintain the existing stone wall.

HELD OVER:

All parties be invited to next HOMs meeting.

CH

13.2 Erf 437, 9 Darling Street, McGregor, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23061202CN1117

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

Ms Nicoline Jongens was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for extensive additions and alterations to the house.
- Langeberg Municipality noted that an application to HWC is required before building plan can proceed.
- McGregor Heritage Society indicated support and non-support. Part 1 covers work noticed in the photos of which one point is noted to be on heritage grounds and they state that the altering of the gable edges has a negative impact on the heritage resource in terms of its period identification. By altering the gable edges to suit a modern interpretation of gable edges, the heritage resource now reads as if it is from a more contemporary time period, which is incorrect. The historical narrative of the heritage resource has been altered. Part 2 of their comments covers the existing proposal as per the drawing submitted and they support most of the alterations and additions, apart from the external staircase balustrade and state that the north facing external steel staircase as seen on the North Elevation is not supported. Recommendation: construct this external staircase as a masonry staircase with a solid balustrade wall leading up. The balustrade for the roof terrace above may be half solid and half steel, so that the view over the Krans is still appreciated when seated.
- HOMS previously requested a Heritage Statement:
 - Construction work began in June 2023 on the heritage property without obtaining the required Section 34 permit. This included additions like a new lean-to roof, columns, sunroom extension, kitchen alterations and laundry addition.
 - The McGregor Heritage Society and Aesthetics Committee initially provided conditional support in 2023 based on recommendations, but later realized unapproved deviations had occurred on site in 2024.
 - While extensive, the 2023-2024 alterations and additions are largely subordinate to the

pre-1942 thatched house core. The heritage significance remains clearly identifiable despite the new extensions.

- The heritage assessment finds the structure architecturally, historically and contextually significant, graded IIIB worthy of conservation.
- Most of the initially proposed 2023 works with 2024 adjustments have been constructed, except remaining items like pergolas, roof terrace balustrade and dressing room stone cladding requiring HWC approval.
- The Aesthetics Committee recommended the plans after their initial requirements were met, providing support across two rounds of comments in 2023.
- Updated architectural plans, photos and annexures document the current status and outstanding work requiring heritage permitting.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

13.3 Erf 13000, 142 Douglas Place, Woodstock, S34-A&A Minor Works **Case No: HWC24032605CSI0328**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 1st of March and additional information received on the 12th of April and the 18th of April. Plans showing the completed work were received on the 23rd of April and uploaded to One Drive.
- This application was heard at last week's HOMs but the committee could not approve the S51 permit because the 30 day period for CB comment had not yet lapsed which it now has.
- The applicant confirmed in an email that work has been started and is nearing completion and provided photographs showing the work.
- The building is graded IIIC and within and HPOZ.
- The proposed additions were for the insertion of a dividing brick and plaster wall between a seating lounge area and games room and the installation of fire safety and mechanical ventilation in order to comply with municipal health and fire safety regulations.
- Comment has been provided by the City of Cape Town and they support the application. Proof of request for comment from Woodstock Residents Association has been provided.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter.

CSI

13.4 Erf 7856, 26 Morkel Street, Somerset West, S34 Additions & Alterations **Case No: HWC24031404CSI0319**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 15th of February 2024 and submitted as an emergency application. The work applied for did not qualify for an emergency application as there were major renovations and restorations proposed on the plans.
- The applicant resubmitted the application as an S34 A&A, however, without the City's official comment. Comment has been provided by HRF who noted that the additions are over scaled in relation to the existing heritage resource but have no further formal objections and support the application.
- Comment from the City of Cape Town was received on the 19th of April. The City do recognise

that the plans are over scaled but do not have any objections and support the application.

- The building is not formally graded and not within an HPOZ.
- The proposed work is for a complete restoration and renovation of the existing structure as well as adding an extension to that structure which will comprise of a garage, two bedrooms with en-suites, a laundry room, entrance foyer, entertainment room, and kitchen. "

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.5 Erf 8925, 34 Bridgewater Street, Somerset West, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24031812EJV0319

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 11, 18 and 19th April 2024.
- Graded NCW outside an HPO
- Applicant received a permit in 2023 (HWC23031509RG0327) for additions and alterations for a carport that was not built according to the plan. The 2024 plan indicates that they now seek to add a covered patio and shade-net carport; however, the plan also indicates the existence of a second dwelling flatlet addition that is not in the photographs of the property. Michelle Bruyn (Exact Plan) provided the correct application form on 11.4.2024 confirming that this flatlet was built without authorisation and work has been completed.
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

EJV

13.6 Erf 971, 38 Woodside Drive, Pinelands, S34-Alterations Case No: HWC24022714EJV0319

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 19 April 2024
- Significant expansion of the footprint of the dwelling, including new scullery, store, and domestic staff quarters on the east boundary; new bedrooms on the south boundary; an additional storey with a new roof in a style consistent with the existing roof; a new covered stoep extending from the existing stoep.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- PRRA does not support.
- Work has not started.
- All parties were invited to attend but no parties joined the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.7 Erf 68810, 7 Kent Road, Wynberg, S34 - Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24032615EJV0405

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

Mr Mogamad Ryklief and Mrs Shanaaz Ryklief was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 10th and 15th of April
- In August 2023 the dwelling was damaged beyond repair, as confirmed by the structural engineer's report. The owner intends to demolish the structure entirely and has no plans to develop the property in the near future.
- CB Approves; CoCT does not approve as they note that it was the applicants who allowed the dwelling to fall into disrepair. CoCT states that the applicants have not been forthcoming with their intentions for the property and recommend that, given the character of the surrounding properties and proposed HPO status, heritage-based design indicators need to be provided by the applicant that can be included as conditions for future development as part of the S34. Upon completion of this requirement, they will approve the demolition.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT was invited to join but did not join the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

EJV

13.8 Erf 28044, Groote Schuur Creche, Mowbray, S34 – Maintenance

Case No: HWC23121106EJV0412

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 24 & 29 April 2024.
- Proposed works include maintenance to the Groote Schuur Creche. Maintenance refers to replacement of the malthoid roof sheeting on the lean-to-roofs within the two courtyards of the historic structure to be replaced by aluminum sheeting. Replacement of damaged or missing timber shutters and replacement of asbestos gutters. Repainting of external wall surfaces in the original color.
- Ungraded
- Within proposed Observatory HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as minor works as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.9 Erf 29357, 18 Raleigh Road, Mowbray, S34 – Additions

Case No: HWC24030530EJV0405

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 22 and 23 April 2024.
- Additions of a new carport and existing garage extension, four new dormer windows to be added to the roof and a change of the western aspect of the roof from pitch to gable end.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside the Lower Rosebank Proposed HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.10 Erf 52943, 17 Crescent Road, Claremont, S34 – Minor Works

Case No: HWC24022603EJV0326

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 and 24 April 2024.
- The proposed works include the construction of an additional storey consisting of a new main bedroom and bathroom, with a new staircase to connect the ground and upper floors. A new corrugated roof sheeting will be installed with a new balcony over a newly extended carport structure. A new garden storeroom and covered yard structure are also to be constructed.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.11 Erf 3233, 2 Jufferbrunch Street, Stellenbosch, S34-Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24032617SJ0328

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Garth Pool was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8, 9, 19, 23 & 26 April 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Previous structure on site, a small building used a medical room, was demolished without authorization.
- Proposal is for demolition of remaining boundary wall. Construction of new boundary wall and new structure (24 units, student housing).
- Stellenbosch Muni: Municipality has requested they obtain permit to be procedurally correct.

- SIG: no objection to demolition, concerns about replacement structure. Old picture of previous structure on site.
- SHF: no comment received.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

SJ

13.12 Erf 55784, 5 Selborne Road, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24010816KB0116

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 21 April 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Proposal for new entertainment area and replacing window frames with aluminum.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT EHM: support.
- UCRRA: does not support.
- UCRRA maintains that the windows should not be replaced with aluminum, and it does not matter if the facade is obscured by a high wall - the intrinsic historic elements should remain.

HELD OVER:

All parties to be invited to the next HOMs meeting to discuss the changing of the window material.

SJ

13.13 Erf 191, 12 Broadwalk Street, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23062103MS0822

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 19 April 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Proposal for new front boundary wall.
- CoCT EHM: support.
- PRRA: no objections

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.14 Erf 46300-Re, 19 Alfred Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24021501SJ0227

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 23 April 2024.
- The work has been completed.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- The work completed is a loft area comprising of a study and bathroom. It is built within the existing roof structure.
- CoCT EHM: not support, HRS does not condone unauthorized work.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.15 Erf 325 & 326, Hugo Naude Art Centre, 86 Tulbagh St, Bergsig, Worcester, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23092203SJ0209

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 12 & 24 April 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Proposal is for replacement of roof sheeting as well as gutters and downpipes. Timber roof battens and ceilings are to be replaced where water damage has occurred. All replacements are to be undertaken with like-for-like replacement material to match the existing aesthetic of the structure.
- Unknown grading and HPO status

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.16 Erf 505, 11 A&B Graham Road, Sea Point, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012515SJ0125

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 24 & 29 April 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Proposal is for internal reconfiguration and 2 staircase additions in order to convert from existing flats to original single dwelling use. A staircase at the rear and a sculptural staircase at the front.
- CoCT EHM: support
- Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents' Association did not comment within the 30-days commenting period.
- Sea Point for All did not comment within the 30-days commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14

NEW MATTERS

14.1 Erf 1027, 77 Hospital Street, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24032606CN0415

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

Mr Jacobs and Ms Uryke Du Preez was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.
- The proposal is for a part of the covered stoep to become a scullery, garage conversion to a bedroom and en-suite and creating a new foyer.
- Drakenstein Municipality has no objection.
- DHF did not comment in 30-days.
- Paarl 300 does not support unauthorised work.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

14.2 Erf 10373, 1 Klaasens Road, Constantia, S38(4)-NID Case No: HWC24032507CN0415

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The property is approx. 54ha in extent. The current land use is a wine estate with a zoning of AG1 and the surrounding land uses are residential, and a farm to the south.
- The proposal is for a consolidation of Portion 4 (Erf 14120) with the Glen Dirk Estate (Erf 10373), and a subdivision and re-zoning for a new Portion 7 (new Erf), for the development of a house.
- Applicable Heritages:
- Buildings: There are no buildings on the affected portion of either the property or the adjacent subdivision that used to be part of the property.
- Historic settlements: No settlements, but the historic Glen Dirk homestead is not far from one of the portions involved.
- Cultural Landscape: The site is an historic agricultural anchor within the Alphen Constantia area.
- Archaeo & Palaeo: The applicant states that it's unlikely any such resources will be uncovered, and states the chance finds protocol is deemed sufficient.
- The consultant recommends that no HIA is required, as no negative impact expected to heritage resources.
- Numerous HIA's and approval processes have been done in the past from 2007 to 2014 with regards to subdividing portions of the Glen Dirk Farm.
- Recommendation is for NFS

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds protocol to be included.

14.3 Erf 1194, 14 Friars Road, Sea Point, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24041201CN0415

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

14.4 Erf 13004, Laborie Farm, corner Taillefer and Main Street, Paarl, S27-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24041210CN0415

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

Ms Nicolene Visser was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to enclose and extend an existing terrace to enlarge the seating area of the restaurant, as well as adding 2 built in fridges and 1 freezer.
- DHAC has no objection.
- DHF has no objection.
- Paarl 300 supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.
- A meeting between HWC, Malherbe Rust Architects and Drakenstein Municipality to be set up regarding the farm in terms of a CMP.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

14.5 Erf 1382, 3 Bradwell Road, Vredehoek, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24032603CN0415

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to enclose the lower ground storey to create an additional bed and bathroom and a braai area, the addition of a deck, extending the carport and minor internal alterations.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

**14.6 Erf 1525, Section 2 (Unit 7) Mogale Courts, 36 Davenport Road, Vredehoek, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24040906CN0422**

Item removed from the agenda - duplicated.

CN

**14.7 Erf 1538, Section 6 (Unit 8) St Margaret's Mansions, 27 St John's Road, Sea Point, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24041011CN0422**

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for replacement of the existing wooden floors, replacement of all window and door frames with aluminum and removal of one internal wall to improve the flow and the living space of the unit.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- The body corporate supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**14.8 Erf 2018-RE, via Helderberg Road, Riversdale, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: HWC24020706SB0306**

Item removed from the agenda – duplicated.

CN

**14.9 Erf 56930, 20 Cleveland Road, Claremont, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24041206CN0415**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Completed application form, internal and external photos required.

CN

**14.10 Erf 867-RE, off the R353, Prince Albert, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24040808CN0415**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Company Resolution, External and streetscape photos and SG diagram required.

CN

**14.11 Erf 94861, 81 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24041002CN0415**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title Deed, Locality Plan, External and streetscape photos, motivation, and SG diagram required.

CN

14.12 Erf 11786, Link Road, Nyanga, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24040421CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

All photographs, SG diagram

CSI

14.13 Erf 1788,12 Constantia Road, Gardens, S34 A&A - Partial Demolition

Case No: CSI0422

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Comment from CIBRA

CSI

14.14 Erf 2732, West Coast Road, Yzerfontein, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24040912CSI0416

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S38(8) NID application which triggers 38(1)(c) because it exceeds 5000sq. meters and 38(1)(d) as it is a proposal for rezoning exceeding 10 000sq. meters.
- Proposed development is a housing development which will be subdivided according to the plans provided.
- Archaeological and paleo resources are high. There are shell middens, pottery, and stone tools present in the area including a high fossil density.
- Paleo sensitivity is high on the SAHRIS paleo map.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies.

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment
2. Paleontological Impact Assessment

CSI

14.15 Erf 4028, 33 Gordon Road, Parow, S34 Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24032523CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Comment from the City of Cape Town

CSI

14.16 Erf 510, 7 Airlie Road, Bergvliet, S34 Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24040526CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CSI

14.17 Erf 741, 381 Lourensford Road, Stellenbosch, S34 Additions & Alterations

Case No: CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Proof of payment, title deed, company resolution, SG diagram, locality map, photographs, comments from the City of Cape Town and Helderberg Renaissance Foundation.

CSI

14.18 Erf 77451,175 Milford Road, Plumstead, S34 Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24031414CSI0416

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Building is graded IIC and not within an HPOZ.
- The proposed additions are for a new terrace, carport, and lounge and for renovations for the existing entrance, kitchen, and bathrooms.
- Comment has been provided by the City of Cape Town who support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.19 Erf 8609, 309 Main Road, Paarl, S34 A&A - Partial demolition
Case No: HWC24041506CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Company resolution and internal images required.

CSI

14.20 Erf 94671, 19B Upper Union Street, Gardens, S34 Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24041204CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Comment from CIBRA

CSI

14.21 Erf 25309, 8178, 8746, 8744, 1597 and 1591, St Marks, George S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24021911CSI0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

The Committee resolved to carry the case over to the following HOMs meeting.

CSI

14.22 Erf 373, 12496 / RE 1113, RE/15/766, 22/766, 24/766, 18/766, 8/766, 14/766, 10/766, Abbotsdale and Malmesbury, Swartland, S38(8) – NID S38(1)
Case No: HWC24030528CSI

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed work is for new overhead powerlines between Abbotsdale and Malmesbury across several erven and farms and will be completed as close as possible to property boundaries for minimal impact.
- The powerline will connect to an existing Eskom overhead powerline southeast of Abbotsdale running north to the new De Hoop Substation. 31m wide servitudes will be registered over affected properties to accommodate the proposed powerline.
- There are no notable archaeological resources present and the paleo sensitivity for the area on the SAHRIS paleo map is low to moderate.
- The consultant has recommended no further studies.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds protocol to be included.

CSI

14.23 Erf 1029, 64 Church Street, Citrusdal, S34 Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24040404CSI0419

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The building is not formally graded and not within an HPOZ.
- The proposed alterations are for the garage to be converted into a bedroom, demolishing and replacing an internal wall, repairing ceilings, and replacing wooden lintels with concrete lintels.
- Cederberg Municipality have provided comment stating that they do not believe the proposed work will have any significant impact on any heritage resources and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.24 Erf 1198, 23 Milner Road, Tamboerskloof, S34 – Minor Works Case No: HWC24032508EJV0418

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Insertion of new solar panels, and removal of non-protected tree species to create space for a single off-street parking bay with no pergola or structure proposed, simply the space. Removal of the Moroccan-style tiling and paving from the stoep and replacement with 'klompies'.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside Upper Table Valley HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.25 Erf 124, 115 Victoria Road, Camps Bay, S34 - Total Demolition Case No: HWC24041807EJV0418

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Total demolition of the existing structures to allow for the development of 10 apartments. Total demolition was originally approved in 2020 (HWC19102926KB1121E).
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT and CBCRA supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to

warrant retention.

EJV

14.26 Erf 125636, 55 Clarendon Crescent, Brooklyn, S34 - Partial Demolition and Additions
Case No: EJV0418

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requires application form, SG Diagrams, Company or Trust Resolution, Locality, all photographs, local municipality comment, and a heritage motivation

EJV

14.27 Erf 1459, Hout Bay Cemetery, Hughenden Street, Hout Bay, S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24040804EJV0417

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- The decision-making authority for this application is DEADP. The Recreation and Parks Department is looking to expand the Hout Bay Cemetery onto adjacent land triggering 38(1)(c)(i) as it exceeds 5000m². No vegetation or structures will be disturbed, and no structures are being proposed. The New Apostolic Church and Cemetery are located to the immediate north of the proposed expansion but will not be affected.
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

EJV

14.28 Erf 14589, 107 Baron von Reede Street, Oudtshoorn, S34 - Additions
Case No: HWC24030802EJV0418

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Construction of two lean-to structures and a lean-to store at the back of the dwelling
- Work has been completed.
- Ungraded and HPO status unknown
- Heritage Oudtshoorn and Oudtshoorn Municipality provided comment

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

EJV

14.29 Erf 15808, 66 Church Street, Wellington, S31 - Additions
Case No: HWC24032005EJV0418

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

HWC requires a signed application form, company or trust resolution, and local authority comment

EJV

14.30 Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl, S27 – Change of Planning Status

Case No: HWC24041102EJV0418

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Consultation period has not lapsed. DHF given to 12 May to comment.

EJV

14.31 Erf 4083, 305 9th Street, Voelklip, Hermanus, S34 - Deviation

Case No: EJV0422

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requires application form, internals, consultation, and a heritage motivation

EJV

14.32 Erf 49577, Blombos Cave, Still Bay, S35 – Destructive Analysis

Case No: HWC24032531EJV0418

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded II
- Work hasn't started
- Destructive analysis of 2x 100mg sediment samples (CA just under DUN; DUN D4) from the Dune Layer of BBC (2024 Field Trip) for quantification of the anions, cations and carbonates/bicarbonates to determine the characterisation of salts and granulometry of the samples to simulate the taphonomic impact of marine aerosols and wind erosion on rock art paintings produced on calcarenite through accelerated aging experiments. The aim of the study is to determine whether the absence of rock art in coastal MSA sites in southern Africa is more likely related to cultural choice or the action of taphonomic processes that eliminated the painted images from the archaeological record over time. Four previous applications for excavation and analyses of this site have been approved between 2021 and 2023. The study cannot be conducted in South Africa as the equipment required is located at the University of Basque Country in Spain. The sediment samples were collected during the 2024 field trip and are not part of an Iziko Collection of BBC DUNE Layer samples and as such the destructive analysis cannot be quantified in terms of a percentage of a collection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the Section 35 application.

EJV

14.33 Erf 68813, Unit 4 Chelsea Cloisters, 48 Durban Road, Wynberg, S27 - A&A and Landscaping

Case No: HWC23092101EJV0422

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Construction of a splash pool and paving in the ground floor garden, new external store on the rear elevation, insertion of new masonry planter, replacement of the masonry wall with glazing to match the existing, minor internal reconfiguration to accommodate new bathroom.
- Graded PHS
- Inside HPO
- Work has been completed.
- CoCT supports S51 and WRRRA supports

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

EJV

- 14.34 Erf 91807, 5 Hayes Road, Wynberg, S34 – Additions**
Case No: HWC24040402EJV0422

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form to be corrected.

EJV

- 14.35 Erf 98641, 2 Stuart Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24041603EJV0418

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Extensive additions and alterations of the dwelling. The original fabric will be completely swallowed by the additions, but is being retained within the new structure.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

- 14.36 Farm 151, Farm Tweedside, Matjiesfontein, S38(8) - NID**
Case No: HWC24041502EJV0416

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The application is in the evaluation phase with DMRE and triggers NHRA S38(1)(c)(i) as it exceeds 5000m² and G NR326 listing Notice 1, activity 21 of the EIA Regulation. The proposal is for Bomlingo Projects to continue quarrying for stone aggregate and gravel on a site previously quarried by Concor Infrastructure. A desktop and in-person Palaeontological Assessment conducted by Prof Marion Bamford revealed that the quarry site is located on the potentially fossiliferous Waaiport Formation that could contain trace fossils of invertebrates or early plant. A walkover study on January 17th 2024 revealed no fossils and confirmed rocks were well exposed from previous mining activities.
- McDonald Mdluli the EAP recommends no further studies and the implementation of a Fossil Chance Finds added to the EMP_r Protocol

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds protocol to be included.

EJV

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- A 723ha photovoltaic solar energy facility is proposed on the site. The solar panels will be installed in pockets of lower sensitivity and linked by roads and electrical cables. Ancillary infrastructure includes substations, access roads, laydown areas, offices, ablutions, guard houses. The proposed development necessitates excavations for foundations and/or services which may impact on archaeological and/or palaeontological remains, while all above-ground aspects might create potential visual (contextual) impacts to the cultural landscape and any significant heritage sites that might be visually sensitive. As such, an HIA (Jayson Orton) with complementary VIA (Stephen Stead) and specialist PIA (Graham Avery) were undertaken. The HIA Methodology included a literature and information survey and two field surveys. These revealed stone tools (primarily quartzite and silcrete) ranging from small flakes deemed NCW to large hammerstones and cores deemed IIIC; structures and dwellings forming part of the Doornfontein Farm complex deemed IIIA as a whole; a farm graveyard on Kruispad (assumed older than 60 years) deemed IIIA and a farm house on Kruispad (aerial photography confirms older than 60 years) deemed IIIB. Notably, the Langrietvlei farmhouse, located 7.4 km south of the study area, is a declared PHS and the Kersefontein farmhouse and an outbuilding, located 10.7 km southeast of the study areas are both PHSs. The PIA notes that the West Coast Fossil Park is located 20 km southwest of the study area is a declared Provincial Heritage Site (PHS) and National Heritage Site (NHS). The SAHRIS Palaeosensitivity Map shows the site to be of low sensitivity, but this sensitivity applies to the surface sediments. Beneath this lie the Langebaan and Springfontyn Formations which are “sediments ranging from the Middle to Late Pleistocene, which are known to include sparse fossiliferous sediments, palaeo land surfaces, with bones and ichnofossils (trace fossils). Avery concludes that while fossils are likely to be sparse, if found they could be of potentially high cultural significance and should be rescued from harm. The VIA (Stead) notes the key elements of the landscape to be: The Berg River; The R399 tourist corridor; The agrarian cultural landscape; and The coastal town of Velddrif. The kinds of impacts identified include: loss of landscape character, a massing effect in the landscape owing to a large-scale landscape modification and a cumulative impact related to setting a precedent for similar facilities to occur in the area. With mitigation in place, the cumulative impact to significance of the entire site would be low negative, and the socio-economic benefits outweigh this impact.

DECISION

The Committee endorses the HIA prepared by the ASHA Consulting Heritage, dated: 16 February 2024 as meeting the requirements of Section 38(8) with the following recommendations outlined in Section 10 (page 49 to 50) as follows:

1. Palaeontological monitoring is required. A Workplan is to be provided to Heritage Western Cape prior to work commencing so that any fossils found can be immediately studied and removed without delay to the project;
2. A Fossil Chance Finds Procedure must be included in the project EMP;
3. Training in the identification of fossils is to be given to workers at the start of construction;
4. A pre-construction archaeological survey of the site will be carried out to determine whether any further archaeological sites have become visible; ASHA Consulting (Pty) Ltd | Reg. no.: 2013/220482/07 iv
5. Test excavations and/or mitigation as required is to be carried out at all recorded sites where the potential for obtaining a meaningful assemblage is likely regardless of their visibility at the time of construction;
6. Fencing is to be placed around the various development footprints and not enclose larger areas of landscape;
7. Lighting mitigation such as downlighters and motion-detectors are to be employed throughout the project;

8. Where technically feasible, structures are to be painted in a mid-grey/brown colour;
9. Screening trees are to be planted per visual consultant specifications;
10. Low berms (2.5 m) to be constructed and vegetated with local Strandveld vegetation;
11. A landscape architect is to be engaged to design and oversee implementation of the visual mitigation measures;
12. If any fossils, archaeological material or human burials are uncovered during the course of development then work in the immediate area must be halted. The find must be reported to the heritage authorities and will require inspection by an archaeologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution.

EJV

14.38 Remainder of Farm 2018, alongside Heidelberg Road, Riversdale, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: HWC24020706SB0306

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Stephanie Barnard.

Mr Jonathan Kaplan was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed 10 megawatts PV solar energy plant and battery energy storage system. The proposal is planned to take place over three-phase, over three-year period.
- The archaeology aspect suggests potential impact on Early Stone Age tools, while palaeontology sees no expected impact; visually, there might be some impact on the Cultural Landscape Assessment (CLA). Consequently, the consultant advises conducting a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) with an Archaeological Impact Assessment (AIA), and the decision from the Heritage Western Cape (HWC) favors both AIA and CLA assessments.
- *Archaeological findings:*
- The walk down was done over two days over vehicle (mostly Werner Frehse Nature Reserve) and foot.
- The site being considered for development has scattered Early Stone Age (ESA) artifacts, mainly consisting of quartzite pieces used for toolmaking. These artifacts are spread thinly and unevenly across the landscape, mostly found in ploughed wheatfields. Some areas, especially in the eastern part, show patches of quartzite cobbles that were likely used as raw material for making tools.
- There are also piles of cobbles and stones stacked on field edges, suggesting past human activity. In the preferred location for a solar PV facility, a few tools were found, mostly chunks and flakes, with a few handaxes among them. Most tools are made from locally available quartzite, likely brought to the surface due to ploughing.
- Although the site has some Middle Stone Age flakes, there's no evidence of Later Stone Age artifacts or human settlement. The artifacts likely represent discarded pieces from toolmaking rather than evidence of continuous occupation.
- Finding was graded NWC given that it is out of context.
- *Paleontological findings:*
- In the southern part of the site, there's bedrock from the upper Bokkeveld Group, made up of marine mudrock shales and thin sandstones from around 385 million years ago. Moving northward, the bedrock changes to the lower Witteberg Group's Wagen Drift Formation, consisting of shallow-marine sandstones and mudrocks from about 375 million years ago.
- The higher ground on the site represents the old "High Coastal Platform" and is made up of Grahamstown Formation silcretes and high-level terrace gravels. However, the palaeontologist John Pether mentions that while the Bokkeveld Group generally contains unique fossils, in the Southern Cape coastal region, it's tectonized and weathered, making it hard to differentiate its formations. The same applies to the Wagen Drift Formation, and the Grahamstown Formation silcrete rocks have very few fossils. Due to long-term weathering and soil formation, fossils are unlikely to be preserved in the residual gravels and terrace surfaces, so no fossil finds have been

reported in these areas.

- Cultural landscape:
- The Overberg region is known for its agriculture, mainly dryland wheat farming, which covers almost all available arable land. It's a rural area with picturesque mountains and rivers flowing through the rolling landscape. The proposed PV Solar Energy Plant and BESS will be built within this agricultural setting.
- In the northeast, you'll find a mix of formal and informal housing, small-scale farming, and some light industry, including the Kwanokuthula Township and its surroundings. The Riversdale Cemetery is a prominent feature along Heidelberg Road.
- To the north, the Werner Frehse Nature Reserve sits adjacent to the gravel road leading to Still Bay and falls within the project study area.
- No other heritage resource where found on site.
- Public Consultation:
- No comment has been received on heritage ground, hence no objection.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The I&APs consultation needs to be concluded.

SB

14.39 Erf 90, 1 Peak Drive, Pinelands, S34-Restoration & Reconstruction
Case No: HWC24041901SJ0419

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plans required.

SJ

14.40 Portion 3 of Farm 1049, Brandwacht Manor House, Elsie Du Toit, Brandwacht, Stellenbosch, S34-Emergency Works for Restoration
Case No: HWC24041501SJ0416

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- Proposal is to replace the IBR roof sheeting that was blown off by the heavy wind and storms experienced. Sheeting and flashing to be replaced as well as masonry parapet walls to be repaired with lime mortar.
- No consultation undertaken for emergency works.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.41 Erf 10295, Loedolff House Annex, Church Street, Malmesbury, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24042402SJ0416

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Commenting period has not lapsed, outstanding comment from Friends of Blaauwberg.

SJ

14. Other Matters

15. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

CH moves to adopt and CSI seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

16. Closure: 13:20

17. Date of Next Meeting

8 May 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

SECRETARY:

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society
BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers & Residents Association
CoCT - City of Cape Town
CTHT - Cape Town Heritage Trust
CRM - Cultural Resources Management
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association
Docomomo South Africa
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department
FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area
FE - Friends of Elim
GLCA- Greater Lynfræ Civic Association
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association
HVA- Harfield Village Association
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
EMPr - Environmental Management Program
FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation
HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HPO – Heritage protects overlay

HWC – Heritage Western Cape
IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999

NID - Notification of Intent to Develop
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage
Paarl300 Foundation
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society
SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association
SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust
GHT - George Heritage Trust
RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society
VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

NRA - Newlands Residents Association
OCA - Observatory Civic Association
OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
PPP - Public Participation Process
PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
Ward 2 Forum
WCC - Whale Coast Conservation
WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association