

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 26 February 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport	(Chair)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Mr. Reagon Fortune (RF)	(Admin)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	(Assistant Director: Professional Services)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)	(Assistant Director: Legal)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr. Matthew Fourie
Mr. Steve Kretzmann
Mr. Matthew Hirsch
Mr. Mike Scurr
Mr. Philip Smith
Ms. Katy Smuts
Ms. Wendy Wilson

3. Apologies

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

5.1. 26 February 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
SJ moves to adopt the agenda and CH seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 6.1 12 February 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes. CH moves to adopt the agenda and SB seconds.
- 6.2 19 February 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes. SB moves to adopt the agenda and SJ seconds.

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site inspections undertaken.

9.1.1 Erf 36, 2 Vredehoek Avenue, Oranjezicht: 22 February 2024 (HWC23032211RG0404) (SJ)

- For noting – to be tabled at HOMs 4 March 2024

9.1.2 Erven 554/6 & 1/554, Yzerfontein Road, Yzerfontein (SB)

APP site inspection to the two-lime kiln both are provincial heritage resource on subject site. The primary purpose of the lime kiln was to produce lime from seashells, which had diverse uses in the region. Lime was essential for making mortar and plaster in construction, as well as for agricultural purposes such as soil amendment and crop fertilization. Additionally, lime found applications in various industries, including metallurgy and chemical manufacturing.

9.1.3 Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point (HWC23061909SB0826) (SB)

Site inspection report to be table at next meeting, verbale feedback was provided.

No new proposed work is underway, City Council informed the new owner since the permit was activated by the previous permit. There was no needed for a new permit unless new proposed work planned. The current application is for additional work that did not form part of the original application.

9.2 Proposed Site Inspection

9.3 Site Inspection Reports

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1 BELCom – 28 February 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

9.6.1 Erven 115, 116 & 205, Field House, 205 Queen Street, Belvidere Estate (HWC22101204SJ1021)

- Held over as it is under investigation.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

- Item 13.12
- Item 13.14
- Item 13.20
- Item 14.1
- Item 14.2
- Item 14.3

- Item 14.5
- Item 14.7
- Item 14.8
- Item 14.9
- Item 14.11
- Item 14.14
- Item 14.16
- Item 14.21
- Item 14.22
- Item 14.26
- Item 14.29
- Item 14.30
- Item 14.33

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

9.10 Permit

10. Administrative Matters

10.1. Updated delegations (WD)

- Agreed process regarding the updated delegations: If there are objections received, all parties to be invited to following meeting and matter to be discussed at the meeting and ventilated. If the committee is satisfied that there is no heritage impact a decision is taken.

10.2. Portion 1 Remainder of Farm 159 Meerendal, Durbanville: Query and Confirmation about need for NID submission or other heritage studies (SB)

- The application triggers section 38(3), A formal NID submission to be made.

10.3. Farm 275, Farm 269, And Remainder of Farm 187, Papendorp, S38(8)-NID-Development Case No: HWC24011602SB0202 (SB)

- Ratification of email decision dated 21 February 2024.
- Endorse the AIA prepared by ACRM dated November 2022 and the Brief Palaeontological Assessment prepared by John Pether dated September 2020 with the following recommendation:
- No archaeological mitigation is required prior to construction excavations commencing.
- Appointment letter of the professional archaeologist & Palaeontologist and CV to be circulated to HWC
- Community graves must be clearly demarcated as indicated by the professional archaeologist during excavations for the Rising Main pipeline.
- Excavations for the Gravity Sewer and Rising Main (Ebenezer Kolonie Re/187) must be monitored by a professional archaeologist.
- Should any unmarked human remains, and ostrich eggshell water container caches, for example, be uncovered or exposed during construction operations, work must immediately cease, and the archaeologist must be contacted to inspect the site. HWC to be noticed via email about any finding.
- The Chance Fossil Find Procedure must be followed (Pether 2022). The above recommendations must be included in the EMP for the proposed development.
- There are no identified NO-GO sites and paleontological concern do not influence the planned development.
- The paleontological sensitivities of the preferred rising main route and the alternative initial route are not different.
- The rescue of fossils during earth works critically depends on spotting them as they are

uncovered during digging i.e. by monitoring excavation activity. As it is not feasible for a specialist monitor to be continuously present, the earth works personnel must be involved in mitigation by watching for fossils. A basic Fossil Find Procedure is provided, for incorporation into the Environmental Management Programme for the project. An additional recommendation is a request that images of the Pump Station excavation exposure could please be forwarded to the author (jpether@iafrica.com), for research evaluation and archival purposes, regardless if any fossils were noticed or not. Furthermore, the ECO/Site Manager is most welcome to contact the author with any queries about potential fossils or matters of interest that might arise during the digging of excavations.

11. Monitoring by practitioner

Erf 1585, 303 Main Road, Bertville, Paarl Museum, Paarl (CH)

- The Committee supports the appointment of Mr. Malherbe as the heritage practitioner.

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 MATTERS ARISING

13.1 Erf 3437, 1 Herschell Street, Strand, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC23112319CH1124

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 7 December 2023.
- The proposal is to convert the existing garages into guest rooms. New doors and windows will be added, and the roof height will be increased.
- The work has not started.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT declined to comment.
- HRF did not comment within 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.2 Erf 3785, 71 Dr. Euvarad Street, Malmesbury, S34-Additions and Alterations Case No: HWC23112806CH1129

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information was received on 7 December 2023, 11th and 22nd February 2024.
- The proposal is to raise the existing roof to accommodate a two-bedroom loft space. The gable ends will be rebuilt to match the height of the new roof. The pitch of the roof will be changed from 28 degrees to 40 degrees. Additional work includes the installation of a new main entrance

door, an external staircase leading to the loft area and the replacement of the loft door with two windows.

- The work has not started.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Swartland Municipality supports the proposal.
- FoBCA did not comment within 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.3 Erf 1485, 181 Lady Grey Street, Paarl, S34-Total Demolition Case No: HWC23111617CN1130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 21 February 2024
- The proposal is for the total demolition of the building.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Drakenstein Municipality objects to the demolition, as the building contributes to its context and larger townscape as a landmark and a unique example of its typology within Paarl. They further recommend that the building be retained, DOCOMOMO be consulted as part of the heritage process and that the building be graded 3B.
- DHF is reluctant to support the demolition, but they might re-evaluate their comments pending the submission of a replacement building.
- Paarl 300 states that the demolition of the building within the HPOZ of central Paarl can only be evaluated in terms of the applicant illustrating what the future planning will be for the property. The application needs to respond to the broader upgrading of the lower portion of Lady Grey Street and look at the context of buildings opposite the street and the major Boulevard intersection. The refurbishment of the Rembrandt Mall is opposite this property, and has a similar Art Deco facade, which illustrates the architectural development pattern of this section of the streetscape. The applicant is requested to prepare a heritage statement that will answer the questions above, as well as illustrate the broader development rights and how these together with the SDF and HPOZ will be interpreted.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Heritage statement that includes an updated photo record prepared by suitably qualified heritage practitioner to be submitted to HWC.

CN

13.4 Erf 50785, 22 Marne Avenue, Claremont, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC23110911KB0119

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 16 and 21 February 2024.
- The proposal is for a new family room, living room, extensions to the main bedroom and internal alterations.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports. However, it must be noted that they assessed the application before the work had started and been completed.
- GLCA states that they cannot comment on work already in progress/completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

13.5 Erf 925-RE, 285 Beach Road, Unit 604, Sea Point, S34- Minor Works Case No: HWC24011819KB0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 21 February 2024.
- The proposal is to change the timber windows and doors to aluminum, refurbish the floors and changes to the bathroom and scullery. Some internal walls will also be demolished.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.6 Erf 953-RE, 23 Chesterfield Road, Oranjezicht, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24010822KB0110

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 21 February 2024.
- The proposal is for a new double garage, swimming pool and deck, outdoor shower, en-suite extension and internal alterations.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

13.7 RE of Erf 2737, Whalers Way, Simon's Town, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23121806CN0108

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Corne Nortje.

Mr. Phillip Smith was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- HOMS previously requested all I&AP to be invited to the meeting.
- The proposal was for internal alterations that included a bathroom extension and a basement.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT does not support the completed bathroom addition nor the issuing of a section 51 letter without mitigation measures being investigated and implemented.
- Simon's Town Historical Society has no objection.
- The Committee is of the opinion that the bathroom addition can be remedied. The addition in its current form does not impact the fabric of the heritage resource.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

13.8 Erf 2155, Corner Truter and De Jager Street, Riversdale, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24011802KB0118

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed total demolition of the existing house and the outbuilding,
- Not graded
- Outside HPO
- Simon Van Der Stel Foundation supports the proposal.
- Hessequa Municipality the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

13.9 Erf 32, 55 Voortrekker Street, Piketberg, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC2401180KB0131

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 February 2024.
- Minor works application
- The Committee notes that work has started.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

13.10 Erf 5338, 25 Mills Street, Strand, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23112812KB1129

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 20 February 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- HRF supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

13.11 Erf 68092, 27 Wargrave Road, Kenilworth, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23111502KB1121

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application to replace the timber windows with aluminum and for a galvanized boundary fence.
- The work is complete and was done by the previous owner.
- 3C inside HPOZ
- The Lower Kenilworth Improvement District supports the proposal.
- CoCT supported the replacement of the timber windows with aluminum but objected to palisade fence stating that it detracts from the buildings interface with the street. The City referenced to an earlier photograph of the structure with a low picket fence stating that the existing palisade fence should be replaced with one that's more sympathetic to the building and its context and that it must be painted.
- The Committee is of the opinion that the palisade fence retains a degree of permeability and does not detract from the street interface and the significance of the IIIC structure.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

- 13.12 Erf 35508, Bergenhof, Carolina Road, Paarl, S38(8) - NID**
Case No: HWC23022007SJ0306

COMMENT

Under investigation due to lack of information regarding previous applications and scope.

SJ

- 13.13 Erf 2373, 22-24 Burg Street, Cape Town, S34-Alterations**
Case No: HWC23112117SJ1124

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Bruce Wilson and Ms Jone Kros was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 February 2024.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal with conditions.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work.
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work.
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant.

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

SJ

- 13.14 Erf 2222, 3 Venus Close, Constantia, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC23120814SJ0116

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

FoCVGB comment required.

SJ

13.15 Erf 415, 12 Du Toit Street, Stanford, S31-Additions, Alterations & New Dwelling
Case No: HWC23110723SJ1218

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr. Mathew Fourie, Ms. Robyn and Ms. Katie Smuts were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 20 February 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Work has not started.
- OHAC supports the proposal.
- SHC supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.16 Erf 4269, 13 Main Road, Somerset West, S34-Maintenance & Restoration
Case No: HWC24011601SJ0117

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 19 February 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- HRF has no objection.
- Methodology statement does not satisfy the committee in terms of materiality and method to be used. Full statement on works already completed required.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Revised methodology statement with detailed photographs of the unauthorized work and the materials used and to be used.

SJ

13.17 Erf 1236, 41 Rottingdean Road, Camps Bay, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23120803SJ0124

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 February 2024.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.18 Erf 14207-Re, 103 Mountain Road, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24011804KB0125

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- WRA has no objections.
- The Committee notes work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.19 Erf 911, 97 Fagan Street, Strand, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24013012KB0131

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 19 February 2024.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT declined their opportunity to comment.
- HRF had no objections.
- The Committee notes that work has commenced.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.20 Erf 59531, 12 Denver Road, Lansdowne, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24010807KB0118

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Transferred from KB to SJ.

SJ

13.21 Farm Gabriels Baken 2 and Remainder of Schietkuil 3, Murraysburg, S38(8)-HIA- Proposed iNyanga Emoyeni Powerline
Case No: HWC23082415CN0919

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposed development includes a switching substation, a powerline, and an access track.
- HIA FINDINGS: Archaeological sites found include a house ruin, small stone features, a stone cairn, an LSA scatter, a scratched dolerite boulder, and a possible grave. The Gabrielsbaken and Schietkuil farmsteads are also heritage resources. The landscape has scenic qualities but has been compromised by existing substations and high voltage powerlines. The substation will impact one stone-walled feature of low significance, and the powerline is not expected to significantly impact the landscape.
- Consultation: no objections on heritage grounds received.

FINAL COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse HIA prepared by ASHA consulting dated October 2023 and the recommendations on page 39:

1. No-Go signage must be erected at the site at waypoint 107;
2. No stones may be removed from any archaeological sites;
3. Visual mitigation and dust suppression measures must be implemented at all times;
4. Signage on public roads should be of modest proportions; and
5. If any archaeological material or human burials are uncovered during the course of development then work in the immediate area should be halted. The find would need to be reported to the heritage authorities and may require inspection by an archaeologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution.

SB

13.22 Gabriels Baken 2 and Remainder of Schietkuil 3, Murraysburg, S38(8)-HIA- Proposed solar photovoltaic. (PV) energy facility and access road
Case No: HWC23082414CH0831

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposed development includes solar panels, a substation, a battery energy storage system, electrical cabling, access roads, offices, and a temporary laydown area.
- HIA FINDINGS: Fossils were found in a few places, but only one was in the proposed development area. Several archaeological sites were found, including an old farm complex, historical ruined structures, stone artefact scatters, possible graves, and the current Gabrielsbaken farmstead. The landscape is a heritage resource with scenic qualities but has been compromised by existing substations and high voltage powerlines. The preferred development footprint will impact one fossil site and one small stone-walled feature, both of low cultural significance. The alternative development footprint will impact many historical stone-walled sites and will be too close to the current Gabrielsbaken farmstead.
- Consultation: no objections on heritage grounds received.

FINAL COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse HIA prepared by ASHA consulting dated October 2023 and the recommendations on page 63:

1. It is recommended that the proposed solar energy facility be authorised using the preferred development footprint. The alternative development footprint is not supported due to the many impacts to significant heritage resources that would occur. Approval of the preferred development footprint is to be subject to the following recommendations which should be included as conditions of authorisation:

2. No-Go signage must be erected at the sites at waypoints 008 and 013;
3. A preconstruction archaeological survey should be commissioned to focus on the proposed access road and any as yet unsurveyed areas in the final PV layout;
4. No stones may be removed from any archaeological sites;
5. Visual mitigation and dust suppression measures must be implemented at all times;
6. Signage on public roads should be of modest proportions; and
7. If any archaeological material or human burials are uncovered during the course of development then work in the immediate area should be halted. The find would need to be reported to the heritage authorities and may require inspection by an archaeologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution

SB

13.23 Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23061909SB0826

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received 10 December 2023.
- Work strat as per previous approval. CoCT conditional approves -"All these elements contribute to the significance of the property and should remain intact. The removal of the timber floors and ceilings are a great concern. Although the plans suggest that these will be retained, they will need to be removed with the utmost care and will need to be skilfully reinstated.
- GPRRA support the proposal.

HELD OVER:

Case officer to compile a site inspection report, obtain engineer reports as per city comment and revised indicating previous approved work and proposed work.

SB

14. NEW MATTERS

14.1 Erf 1353, 11 Papegaai Street, White City, Saldanha, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23092207CH0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title deed/deed search, SG diagram, internal photographs, streetscape photographs, section A of application form to be completed.

CH

**14.2 Erf 180295,74 Milner Road, Rondebosch, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24020118CH0208**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photographs and company resolution.

CH

**14.3 Erf 2&4, Church Street, Wittedrift, Plettenberg, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23092206CH0209**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal photographs, contextual photographs, title deed/deed search and SG diagram

CH

**14.4 Erf 29138, 5 Hilton Road, Mowbray, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24012606CH0214**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application for internal alterations which include the removal of built-in-cupboards, doors and walls. The proposed work has not started.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- RAMPAC supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**14.5 Erf 465, 16 Stephens Road, Pinelands, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24013018CH0213**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT comment and streetscape photographs

CH

**14.6 Erf 493, 99 Park Street, Greyton, S34-deviations
Case No: HWC24021001CH0213**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The application is for deviations from the previously approved plans dated 17 May 2023.
- Proposal is for restoration to the original cottage, minor alterations and additions. The proposed work includes: replace existing thatch roof with new thatch and new supported poles; replace

reed ceiling/wall in the existing bedroom to allow for access to the attic space; repair existing fireplace; convert existing braai into study/solarium by constructing new parapet walls; new roof over existing bathroom and the new solarium; omitting the low street boundary wall; replace damaged ceilings in kitchen and lounge to expose the thatch roof; and new floor finishes in place of the damaged terracotta floor tiles.

- The work has not started.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- Theewaterskloof Municipality supports the proposal.
- Greyton Conservation Society supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work.
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work.
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant.

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

CH

14.7 Erf 51,66 Voortrekker Street, McGregor, S27- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24011810CH0208

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Applicant to sign form, confirmation is the work is complete, internal photographs, streetscape photographs and drawings indicating the proposed work.

CH

14.8 Erf 98820,13 Stuart Road, Claremont, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24021209CH0213

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT comment required.

CH

14.9 Erven 51, 52 & 56, 13 Horne Street, Albertinia, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC23092202CH0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal and streetscape photographs, title deed and SG diagram

CH

14.10 Farm 62, 62 Kromme Rhee Road, Koelenhof, Stellenbosch, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24021421CH0214

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for internal and external alterations to the Kromme Rhee Provincial Training Institute.
- There are various buildings on the site. The manor house built in 1759 and the outbuilding in 1825.
- The proposed work is to the campus buildings that were constructed in 1999.
- The proposed work includes new ramps to existing internal stairs; alterations to external sloped walkways and the addition of handrails; alterations to bathrooms and kitchenette; alterations to fire equipment, fire exit doors and door thresholds; improving the parking area with related signage. The courtyard passage tiles between the outbuilding and the campus will be removed and replaced with new tiles. The work has not started.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO

DECISION:

A letter of no trigger to the NHRA be issued.

CH

14.11 Farm 840, 21 Klaasvoodgs Farm, Robertson, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23092204CH0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal photographs, contextual photographs, title deed/deed search and SG diagram

CH

14.12 Farm 733, Bokkerivier, Malmesbury, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24020806CH0209

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The NID is submitted for the proposed extension of the farm managers house (security billet) and additions around the structure.
- A braai area and screen deck will be added to the existing security billet, a garage for 6 vehicles, staff accommodation with 2 bedrooms, en-suite bathrooms, lounge and kitchen area; and a workshop area that includes an office, bathroom, laundry and drying yard.
- The Bokkerivier farm is 1077ha and was declared a national monument in 1971 for its scientific, historical, architectural and aesthetic value.
- The site is embedded within the natural and cultural landscape comprising of a grouping of late 18th and early 19th century structures located adjacent to a rocky and sandy shoreline.
- The proposed construction will have a visual impact on the cultural landscape setting of the historic werf. The development site is elevated on a dune above the historic werf and therefore is likely to have a visual impact.

- Pre-colonial and colonial archaeological resources could be impacted by ground excavations.
- Site falls within the low paleo sensitive area.
- Heritage Consultant recommends an HIA with AIA, cultural landscape assessment and a visual study to assess the impacts on the cultural and natural landscape and the provincial heritage site.
- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. AIA
2. Cultural assessment
3. Visual study

CH

14.13 Erf 1424, Tafelberg School, 353 Main Road, Sea Point, S38(4)-NID Case No: HWC24020910SJ0209

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Mike Scurr, Ms Kate Smuts, Amozelle Lamberecht and Mr Steve Kretzmann were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Grade II
- Sea Point HPOZ
- NID trigger is that the site is over 5000sqm and rezoning of a site over 10000sqm.
- The property is earmarked for development, including a component of affordable/inclusionary housing. The proposal is yet to be determined but will impact built heritage, cultural and living heritage, historic townscape and possibly archaeology. The proposal would be intended to maximise use of the site, and impacts could be extensive if not informed by heritage indicators.
- The site was first developed in the early C19th, and was occupied by a large homestead, Ellerslie, by the mid-late C19th which became the Ellerslie Girls School in the last decade of that century. The school expanded over the years, and the original homestead was demolished in 1935. In the 1970s the school acquired the neighbouring properties with their villas and houses which were demolished for sports fields and a swimming pool, as well as Wynyard Mansions which remain standing. In 1990 Tafelberg Remedial School took over the facilities until it relocated in 2010; the buildings have been vacant since. Wynyard Mansions has been vacant since 2014.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Architectural analysis
2. Desktop Archaeological Impact Assessment
3. Townscape study
4. Socio-historical study
5. Visual impact assessment.

6. Extensive public participation.

SJ

**14.14 Erf 173153, 1 Bree Street, Cape Town, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23072611SJ0213**

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for the retention, additions and alterations of the Farber's building and the construction of an apartment/hotel building behind and above up to 131 meters.
- Application form notes the Farber's building is Grade II, as stipulated by HWC in previous applications. This was not formally declared.
- Graded IIIA
- Central City HPOZ
- CoCT EHM: conditional support comment on 22.09.23 – "E&HM is in principle supportive of the proposal, subject to the further consideration of deeper setbacks of the podium levels from the existing Farber's building facades; no comment on revised proposal".
- CIBRA: supported (06.11.23)
- CTHF: supported (07.11.23)
- CIFA: no comment provided
- DocomomoSA: comment 29.09.23, objection 01.12.23

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 14 March 2024.

SJ

**14.15 Erf 19440, 25 Dreyer Street, Rugby, Cape Town, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24012206SJ0209**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

SG, title deed, locality map, annotated pictures.

SJ

**14.16 Erf 29123, 18 Kew Road, Mowbray, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23120808SJ0209**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form, streetscape photos, locality plan, CoCT EHM and RAMPAC conservation body comments

SJ

14.17 Erf 325 & 326, Hugo Naude Art Centre, 86 Tulbagh St, Bergsig, Worcester, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23092203SJ0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal & streetscape photographs, title deed, SG diagram.

SJ

14.18 Erf 41392, 82 Hadley Street, Bellair, Bellville, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24020114SJ0209

UNDER INVESTIGATION

The applicant submitted under the incorrect section. A Section 38 application to be submitted.

SJ

14.19 Erf 47535, 21 Lochiel Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24021208SJ0214

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for a new loft and enclosure of patio area. Stair relocation, internal reconfiguration and minor door and window adjustments.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.20 Erf 529, 42 Fairbairn Street, Swellendam, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24020702SJ0209

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal reconfiguration and conversion of uses of spaces as well as movement of carport toward rear of driveway.
- Swellendam Municipality: see advisory committee's comment.
- Swellendam Heritage Association: no objections
- Swellendam Aesthetics & Conservation Advisory Committee: supported and approved (plans stamped).

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

- 14.21 Erf 68883-Re, 31 Batts Road, Wynberg, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24011004SJ0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Indicate all proposed work in colour on latest set of plans; streetscape photographs, Wynberg East Civic Association comment.

SJ

- 14.22 Erf 89871-Re, The Outspan, 148 Clairvaux Road, Kalk Bay, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24012305SJ0208

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Consultation comments required.

SJ

- 14.23 Erf 945, 8 Trafalgar Square, Sea Point, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24021424SJ0214

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for demolition of staff quarters, new scullery, new addition, internal alterations, new windows and doors.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT EHM: supports the proposal.
- SFB: no comment received.
- SFA: no comment received.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.24 Portion 2 of Farm 977, Slangkop Lighthouse, 72 Lighthouse Road, Cape Farms, Kommetjie, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24021210SJ0213

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Approvals required to regularise existing telecommunication antennae.
- The antennae of the rooftop base station infrastructure have been attached to the lighthouse below the lens and lantern and have been painted white to match the lighthouse. The antennae are small in comparison to the rest of the lighthouse and are not particularly noticeable. Thus, they have had fairly limited impact on the visual and heritage significance of the lighthouse.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- CoCT support S51
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

14.25 Erf 125640, 47 Claredon Crescent, Brooklyn, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24020906SB0215

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed main house extension, maids quarters, car port and swimming pool.
- Additional info recieved 23 February 2024
- Municipality supports.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

14.26 Erf 14507, 40 Ritchie Street, University Estate, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24021305SB0215

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Municipality's heritage departments comments (City of Cape Town) and comments from registered conservation body, Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group.

SB

14.27 Erf 438, R43 Between Stanford & Gansbaai, Stanford, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24021419SB0219

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed residential development, close to wetland but within the municipal urban edge which has been flagged for future residential development.
- Archaeology: Very high sensitive according to the screener report.
- Palaeontology: Very high to low (50/50) sensitive according to the screener report.
- Visual: Would change the landscape and modern residential could have an impact.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Palaeontological Impact Assessment
2. Archaeological Impact Assessment
3. Visual impact on the cultural landscape assessment

SB

14.28 Erf 474, Main Road or Curlew Street or Pelican Street, St Helena Bay, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23091918SB0213

HELD OVER:

To next HOMs meeting as information was received late.

SB

14.29 Erf 524, 51 Forest Drive, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24020801SB0215

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Locality plan, conservation body comments.

SB

14.30 Erf 56105, 101 Zion Road, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24021416SB0215

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape images – images physically taken from the street that shows the site in its context.
Registered conservation body comment, Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association

SB

14.31 Erf 6114, 59 Nelson Street, Goodwood, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24021413SB0215

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Demolition plan required.

SB

14.32 Remainder of Riet Poort 9, Remainder of Driefontein 8 & Murraysburg, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: HWC22121416CM0209

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The project entails constructing a 132 kV powerline on monopole or lattice towers, a service/access track, and a switching station.
- HIA FINDINGS: No fossils. However, the area contains several archaeological resources, notably a ruined historical farm complex with features such as a walled graveyard, graves, engravings, artefact scatter, stone-mounded precolonial grave, historical dams, and a cultural landscape. While the line may pass over some historical dams, significant sites have been avoided, and no impacts are currently anticipated. However, poplar trees may need to be removed, but this is not a major concern given the complex's ruined state. The final alignment is not yet surveyed, so some lower-significance sites may be impacted, but these can likely be managed through micro-siting of pylons and the access track. Impacts to the landscape are deemed acceptable, and the placement of the powerline near an already authorized but unconstructed line is seen as advantageous from a landscape perspective.
- Consultation: A comment on the Visual Impact Assessment (VIA) for the PV projects was received from the Mountain Zebra Camdeboo Protected Environment (MZCPE). The MZCPE consists of properties managed sustainably, including National Parks, private nature reserves, private game reserves, and commercial farms. The nearest farm is 15 km from the Padloper PV4 project. Since these farms are not formal reserves or parks, any potential visual impacts are not considered significant.
- No other comments on heritage grounds were received.

FINAL COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse HIA prepared by ASHA consulting dated September 2023 with the following recommendation on page 51:

1. The powerline may not be constructed closer than 30 m from the graveyard. It is preferred that no pylons or service track are placed within 50 m of the graveyard, but the cables may span the area between 30 and 50 m from the graveyard.
2. WESTERN CAPE ONLY: The graveyards at PL_06 must be flagged as a No-Go area;
3. WESTERN CAPE ONLY: The powerline service track may not go over dam walls;
4. A pre-construction archaeological survey must determine whether any further impacts might occur;
 - Any further no-go areas must be flagged on site prior to development starting;
 - No stones may be removed from any archaeological site;
 - The fossil Chance Finds Protocol must be included in the EMP and implemented in the event that fossils are found;
5. WESTERN CAPE ONLY: The removal of trees from within the servitude at the historic

Driefontein farm complex and on the current Rietpoort farmlands must be minimised;

SB

- 14.33 Portion 13 of Farm 168, Portion 3 of Farm 180 and Erf 2053, Corner of Pastorale Avenue and Klipheuwel Road, Fisantekraal, S38(8)-NID**
Case No: HWC24020206SB0214

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

SG Diagram required.

SB

- 14.34 Remainder of Erf 16533, Rem of Erf 16515 and Erf 16515, Stellenbosch, S38(8)-NID**
Case No: HWC24020508SB0213

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Archaeology: low sensitive according to the report.
- Palaeontology: unknown and moderate sensitive according to the SAHRIS
- Visual: given the nature of the development, the anticipated impact as low.
- Consultant recommends no further studies
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds procedure to be included.

SB

1. Other Matters

2. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

SJ moves to adopt and CH seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

3. Closure: 10:55

4. Date of Next Meeting

4 March 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners	ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society	ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association	BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement	CBCRA - Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers' & Residents Association	CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CoCT - City of Cape Town	CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CTHT - Cape Town Heritage Trust	CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CRM - Cultural Resources Management	CMP - Conservation Management Plan
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association	DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
Docomomo South Africa	DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
DHS - Durbanville Heritage Society	EMPr - Environmental Management Program
EHM - Environmental Heritage Management department	FHRA - Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoBCA - Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area	FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
FE - Friends of Elim	GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GLCA - Greater Lynfræe Civic Association	GVHAG - Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association	GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HVA - Harfield Village Association	HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay	HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association	HPO - Heritage protects overlay
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association	HWC - Heritage Western Cape
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment	IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa	IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association	KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association	MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District	NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society	NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NCW - Not Conservation Worthy	NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)	NRA - Newlands Residents Association
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop	OCA - Observatory Civic Association
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association	OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage	PPP - Public Participation Process
Paarl300 Foundation	PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association	RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation	SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency	SPFA - Sea Point for All Group
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society	
SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association	
SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town	
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society	SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation	SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust	SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
GHT - George Heritage Trust	OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association	TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society	UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa	WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group	Ward 2 Forum
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council	WCC - Whale Coast Conservation
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee	WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society	WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association	