

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 15 April 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Mr. Olwethu Dlova (OD)	(Admin)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)	(Assistant Director: Legal)

Observers

None

Visitors

3. Apologies

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	(Heritage Officer)
----------------------------	--------------------

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

- 5.1.** 15 April 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
CN moves to adopt the agenda and EJV seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

6.1 3 April 2024

6.2 8 April 2024

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site inspections undertaken

9.1.1 Erf 1755-RE, 4 Church Street, Durbanville (CH)

- Site inspection was conducted on the 10 April 2024.
- A City of Cape Town official contacted HWC on 10th to enquire whether a permit was obtained for work underway on site.
- Reasons for site inspection was to note the extent of work underway and to ascertain if an HWC permit was obtained.
- The owner was not present on site and not contactable for the duration of the week however the owner's business partner (Mr. Marcel de Villiers) assisted on site.
- No structural work done to the building.
- Internal wooden features/fixtures were sanded down and varnished.
- The following external work was noted:
 - Cracks within the walls were plastered.
 - Walls were painted.
 - A grass section was paved and converted into an open courtyard with outdoor seating.
 - Clearvu fencing was erected along the boundary perimeter.
 - Vegetation was removed to make way for a paved walkway.
 - The curved section of the boundary wall along Church Street was removed and realigned.
 - The existing steel palisade fencing above the low boundary wall, between the pillars, have been removed and was taken for galvanizing. Once completed, the steel palisade fence will be placed on its original position.
- According to the Mr. de Villiers, all planning and heritage approvals are in place and was done with guidance from the town planner (name not disclosed) and the appointed architect Ms. Nicolene Havenga.
- Case officer to obtain confirmation from the owner whether the completed work and work underway has been permitted by HWC.

9.2 Proposed Site Inspection

9.3 Site Inspection Reports

9.3.1 Erf 1755-RE, 4 Church Street, Durbanville (CH)

The committee notes the contents of the site inspection report as noted above under item 9.1.1.

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1 IACom- 17 April 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

9.6.1 Montagu Pass Weekly Report: Week 7 (HWC23080213SJ0802)

- The content of the report are noted by the committee.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

14.1
14.7
14.8
14.14
14.16
14.17
14.18
14.19
14.20
14.21

14.24
14.26
14.29
14.31
14.32
14.33
14.34
14.35
14.37
14.39
14.40
14.41
14.42
14.43
14.44

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

9.10 Permit deadline

17 April – 09:00

23 April – 13:00

10. Administrative Matters

11. Monitoring by practitioner

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 MATTERS ARISING

13.1 Erf 148971, 43A Chatham Road, Salt River, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24030525CH0313

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information was received on 9 April 2024.
- The proposal is for an additional storey.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Salt River Heritage Society did not comment within 30 days.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

13.2 Erf 1190, 10 Drostby Street, Swellendam, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24031502CH0320

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 April 2024.
- The proposal is to enlarge the existing bathroom to accommodate a shower.
- Work has not started.
- Swellendam Municipality supports the proposal.
- Swellendam Heritage Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.3 Erf 27991, 30 Lytton Street, Observatory, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24031901CH0320

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 April 2024.
- Proposal is for internal alterations, converting the existing roof space into a loft area for an extra bedroom and bathroom, increase the ceiling height in the dining room, addition of skylights in the roof for extra light and ventilation in the loft space and a new pedestrian gate to the existing boundary wall.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- OCA did not provide comment within 30 days.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.4 Erf 1477, 1 Coetzenburg Street, Stellenbosch, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23110712CH1214

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information was received on 15 Feb, 27 March and 10 April 2024.
- The proposal is to demolish internal walls, the addition of a scullery, extend the existing kitchen and a new freestanding carport.

- Majority of the work is complete. It is only the kitchen addition that still needs to be done.
- Stellenbosch Municipality supports the proposal.
- SIG supports the proposal.
- SHF supports the proposal

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CH

13.5 Erf 55356, 13 Mark Road, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24012207KB0126

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 12 April 2024.
- proposed laundry and storeroom addition.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- UCRRA commented extensively on previous unauthorized to various windows that was done by the previous owner and objected to that.
- UCRRA has no concerns with addition in the current application and believes that the addition will not impact the significance of the heritage building and its surrounds.
- UCRRA objects to the application entirely and believes that the unauthorized work needs to be addressed first.
- The Committee noted that the applicant will submit a separate application for the unauthorized alterations to the fenestration.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.6 Erf 501, 8 Long Street, McGregor, S27- Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC23100223KB0116

Ms SB introduced the item on behalf on KB.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 April 2024.
- Langeberg municipality suggest 3B grade.
- The application still incomplete.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Revised application form with both signatures of owners
2. SG diagram

3. Comments from McGregor Society
4. Locality plan

SB

13.7 Portions 27 & 28 of Farm Kleinplaasie 2591, Uniondale, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23112305CN1124

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 6 and 8 January, and 4 April 2024.
- The proposal is for extensive alterations and additions to the house on the farm.
- George Municipality acknowledged that a building plan has been submitted.
- SVDSF supports the proposal.
- HOMs graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.8 Erf 14796, 79 Victoria Road, Woodstock, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24012514CN0307

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 April 2024
- The proposal is for an existing shop to be refurbished & renovated internally to accommodate Hair and Nail beauty students. The renovations include installing a new aluminum window, replacing existing deteriorated timber framed windows, painting of internal walls, & converting an existing storage room to a new toilet.
- Graded IIIB and NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports and notes that the replacement of the timber shopfront is not included in this application and will not be supported.
- WRA supports the proposal
- WAAC supports the proposal.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

13.9 Erf 991, 29 Ninth Avenue, Fish Hoek, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No.: HWC24022806CN0325

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 April 2024
- The proposal is for internal alterations, extension to the rear of the house as well as extensions to the out building.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports and notes the grading as NCW.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.10 Farm 499 Portion 23, Farm Modder Rivier, Worcester, S38(8) – NID Case No.: HWC24031409EJV0328

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

Ms Asavela Siqangwe was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 April 2024.
- Ungraded and HPO status unknown.
- The application is in the pre-application phase with a Basic Assessment soon to be underway, DMR is the decision-making authority, and Ludgar Consulting the Environmental Assessment Practitioner responsible. The application triggers 38(1)(c)(i) as it proposes the development of the vacant land into a sand mine. J. Kaplan of ACRM recommends an AIA as the existing access road to the sand mine crosses a small portion of an historic wagon trail, and a modest number of LSA tools were recorded on portions 18 and 23 of farm 499 during an HIA for approved Afrimat Mining Right application in 2023 (HWC23041303). Consulting palaeontologist John Pether advises on low paleontological sensitivity.
- Since there is reason to believe heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies.

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment

EJV

13.11 Erven 62856, 62857, 61690, 61691, 4 Tanel Road and 20 Induland Avenue, Lansdowne S38(4) - NID

Case No.: HWC24032618EJV0328

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 April 2024.
- Ungraded and outside an HPO
- The application concerns Section 38(1)(c)(iii) of the NHRA as it involves the consolidation of four adjacent properties all operating as a single business in an industrial area; however, no development of said properties is proposed. Given that the trigger is development and not consolidation, the application was deemed not to trigger the NHRA.

COMMENT

Letter of no trigger to the NHRA to be issued.

EJV

**13.12 Erf 385, Off Seven Passes Road, Goerge, S38(8)-NID
Case No.:** HWC24030717SB0326

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 April 2024
- Proposed increase cultivated land.
- Archaeology: According to screen report low to high
- Palaeontology: low and a very small portion to the northeast high according to the screener report
- Visual: low
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**13.13 Farm Elgin Forest Reserve No. 295, Street Parcels ID: RE/1258, Street Parcels ID: 2/291
Street Parcel ID: 919, Street Parcel ID: 2651, Street Parcel ID: 2784, The Remainder of Farm
Jagersvlakte Annex No. 291, Portion 7 of Farm Jagersvlakte No. 292, The Remainder of Farm
Jagersvlakte No. 292, Farm Jagservalkte 929, Grabouw, S38(8)-NID
Case No.:** HWC24021503SB0311

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 9 April 2024.
- Proposed powerline along existing road
- The Remainder of Farm Jagersvlakte No. 292 (proposed residential development site) has been historically used for agricultural practices, in addition, most the powerline with be along existing road.

- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

13.14 Remainder of Farm 2018, alongside Heidelberg Road, Riversdale, S38(8) – NID Case No.: HWC24020706SB0306

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 9 April 2024.
- Proposed 10 megawatt PV solar energy plant and battery energy storage system
- Archaeology: EAS tool is likely to be impacted by the proposed development
- Palaeontology: According to Palaeontologist no anticipated impact.
- Visual: Possibly impact to the cultural landscape
- Since there is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies.

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment
2. Cultural Impact Assessment

SB

13.15 Erf 68298, 184 Rosmead Avenue, Kenilworth, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC23100206KB1003

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 April 2024 and 27 March.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- LWKD supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

13.16 Erf 95135, Delville Memorial Precinct, Company Gardens, Queen Victoria Street,

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on
- Maintenance for CWGC Unveiling: cleaning paving, signage, lighting. Landscaping work. Major repairs to memorials and statues.
- CIBRA: support
- CoCT EHM: support upgrades - conflict of interest so comment is void.
- Complete replacement of the retaining wall and relocation of 2 canons on either side of wall. The wall has extreme shear cracking and rising damp. Drainage is very poor around the area. Also: paving and rekerbing; bricked up fountain to be opened and reinstated as fountain upon assessment or used as a planter; lighting and electrical elements to be repaired; concrete bins to be replaced and furniture to be made good.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Case officer to liaise with CoCT to discuss provision of revised methodology and specific nature of replacements.

SJ

13.17 Erf 50594, 30 Stanford Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23120611SJ1208

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 April 2024.
- Extension of sunroom into a larger entertainment area, extension of kitchen, and new master bedroom on first floor. Internal reconfiguration for open plan dining space and improved circulation. The main entry door will be relocated, and a new canopy will be built over the main entrance door. New windows will be installed.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT EHM: support
- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association: no objection

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.18 ERF 173714-RE, East Quay Building, East Quay, Clock Tower Precinct,

V&A Waterfront, S38(4)-Amendment
Case No.: HWC24031810SJ0327

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Ms Ursula Rigby was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- > 5000sqm
- Proposal is two flanking buildings to be adapted for re-use - Building A (1920's I&J building, local historical, social and architectural sig) and Building B (1940s addition to NW).
- 2024 amendment to 2012 approved SDP.
- 2012: Original ROD 11 January 2012 - condition: "All future site development plans shall be submitted to and approved by HWC"
- IACom ROD 18 July 2012 supported
- 2019: Another amendment proposal to SDP, supported, condition: ""Final building plans for the proposed gantry were to be submitted to HWC HOMs to satisfy HWC that the impact to the original fabric is kept to a minimum.""
- Certain enabling work was implemented after the December 2019 ROD. It is mainly the gantry structure proposed in the 2019 proposal that has fallen away.
- 2024: Submitted as the condition of ROD 11 January 2012
- Referred to IACom for their expertise.

HELD OVER

Referred to IACom on 17 April 2024.

SJ

13.19 Erf 16531, 20 Beach Road, Fishhoek, S34 – Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24031411CSI0315

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 12 December 2023.
- Building is graded IIIB and not within an HPO
- The work applied for seems to consist of internal alterations only and the plan indicates that brick and plaster additions and drywalling to create cubicles is the alteration applied for.
- Comment provided by the City of Cape Town

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.20 Erf 75784, 173 Princessvlei Road, Southfield, S34 – Alterations & Additions

Case No.: HWC24031818CSI0319

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 April 2024.
- Building is NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- The proposed work applied for has not yet started. The proposed work is a second dwelling and internal and external alterations and additions.
- Comment has been provided by the City of Cape Town
- The external additions do not impact the heritage of the area or existing house.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

**13.21 Erf 7856, 26 Morkel Street, Somerset West, S34 – Alterations & Additions
Case No.: HWC24031404CSI0319**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Emergency application, building is not graded and does not fall within an HPOZ.
- Comment provided by the City of Cape Town indicated issues with the plans that they were not happy with and have asked the applicant to fix those issues.
- Issues with the plans were fixed in accordance with the plans provided.
- The owner states in the motivation that there are cracks in the walls which allow for water seepage and no roof structure in place to protect from harsh weather conditions. The securing of the property is challenging as the municipality has denied requests for the reconnection of electricity due to the unsafe conditions.
- The applicant has applied for maintenance, restoration, and repair under the minor works section.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Outstanding comments required.

CSI

14. NEW MATTERS

**14.1 Erf 3287, 21 Voortrekker Road, Piketberg, S34 – Minor Works
Case no.: HWC24040305SB0404**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title deed, locality, internal photographs, all comments from local authority and conservation bodies, SG diagram.

SB

14.2 Various Erf and Farms included Erven 582, 654, 658 and Farm Re/1/729, Cape Flats Aquifer,

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The pipelines, including residual pipelines, abstraction and MAR collector pipelines will be installed throughout the Philippi Horticultural Area and Hanover Park, intersecting numerous properties in the area as listed below. Many of them are road reserves. Project will start at Farm 815.
- This project part of the HIA agreement
- Cultural landscape: Most the work is underground and will not impact the PHA.
- Archaeologically: Possibility of ephemeral stone age shell scatters of low significance.
- Paleontologically: SAHRIS map indicate as moderate to low sensitivity but unlikely to be encountered recent Holocene period. Only noted one graveyard approximately 800m away which won't be impacted. No significant impact anticipated.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies required.

SB

14.3 Erf 10685,55 on Main Road, Fish Hoek, S34 – Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24032527SB0404

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work has completed.
- The city has indicated that there has been a permit in 2022, it is unclear if all the work currently indicated was included in 2022 application. The proposed application is done as a means of updating the previously submitted and approved HWC application Permit & drawing, specifically the Telkom telecommunication equipment to match our submitted buildings at the City of Cape Town. The antennae has not negative detracted from resource in question as not easily visible
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SB

14.4 Erf 13972, Off the M3/Simon van der Stell Freeway, Meadowridge and Constantia, S38(4)-NID

Case No.: HWC24032525SB0404

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed 32-unit double-story row housing in development. This will change the character as the site is currently vacant. Site assessment was conducted and concluded that no built environment elements only rubble on site, further no archaeological material was evident even though archaeological sensitivity is high according to the screener. Palaeontologically: low in the sensitivity according to the screener report. Consultant recommends NFS.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies required.

SB

**14.5 Farm 828, Cnr of Strandfontain Road and Boundary Road, Schaapkraal, S38(4)-NID
Case No.:** HWC24032504SB0405

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed rezoning and subdivision of subject property to allow for residential and micro farming.
- Site is located inside the PHA and HPO.
- Consultant recommends NFS.
- Given the nature of the application, unlikely to have negative impact to PHA.
- Since there is no reason to believe heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies required.

SB

**14.6 Erven 21023-RE, 21027, 21031, 43 Livingstone Avenue, Goodwood Cleansing Deposit,
Tygervally, S38(8)-NID
Case No.:** TBC

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form recommendation not completed, section F. Applicant needs to indicate, who has made the recommendation. Site photographs and POP.

SB

**14.7 Erf 173920, 99 Rodger Street, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.:** HWC24030515KB0305

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photos, motivation and POA required.

SB

14.8 Portion 26 of the farm Rietvalley, no 76 Middelplass, De Rust, S34-Additions & Alterations

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

The comments from de rust heritage conservation association and Simon van der steel foundation south cape is required.

SB

14.9 IRT Route, Wynerg Main Road: Wynberg Couplet Road Scheme, S38(4)-HIA
Case No.: 20081805SB0831E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The NID response required socio impact assessment, urban design assessment and architect analyses.
- Matter was previously at IACom and matter received an interim comment - The IACom Committee resolved to endorse heritage indicators and conceptual layout in principle but requires further design development in detail following an urban design and place making approach, as per recommendation contains in the HIA
- The revised HIA has addressed these concerns and fulfilled the requirements.
- Site is he W6 route is located on certain existing and proposed new roads in Wynberg Central Business District (CBD), that include the Wynberg Main Road and roads west of the Wynberg Main Road.
- The City of Cape Town (CoCT) wants to expand its Integrated Public Transportation Network (IPTN) across the city, which includes main and feeder routes. One part of this is the Lansdowne Wetton MyCiti route. The goal is to better connect residential and commercial areas with public transport.
- For the W6 proposal, they plan to change Wynberg Main Road by creating a new road alongside it. Wynberg Main Road will stay two lanes, with traffic going one way, and the new road will be two lanes going the other way. Both roads will have paths for walkers and cyclists, and the plan includes landscaping with new plants and materials along the roadsides.
- The guidelines for heritage design take into account the historical importance of the areas, considering factors like the local community, urban layout, and social impact. They cover different aspects such as:
 - Improving the appearance of the townscape and preserving heritage sites.
 - Designing road infrastructure to support the character of Main Road and local businesses.
 - Adapting road infrastructure around specific areas like the Library and Brodie Road.
 - Considering the needs of the residential and commercial areas near Piers Road.
 - Preserving culturally significant buildings and structures.
 - Creating paths for non-motorized transport like walking and cycling.
 - Designing appropriate bus stops.
 - Managing undeveloped land next to the route.
 - Defining new boundaries for private and public properties.
 - Evaluating social impacts of the design choices.
- Public consultation:
- City support on conditions – they stated that the landscape plan does not consider the urban design study.
- Wynberg East Civic Association had concerns about the one road been a cul-de-sack and the cemetery.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

HIA under investigation, HO to lease with the Heritage Consult whether these concerns have been address adequately. The committee noted the response are noted on page 344 and archaeological concerns raised have been address. Difficult to see how the CoCT concerns have been address without some graphic or meeting with the consultant. Matter to be referred to IACom after CoCT concerns need to be addressed.

SB

**14.10 Erf 386,61 Third Avenue, Sandbaai, Hermanus S34-as built structure
Case No.: HWC23121206CH0405**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The application is submitted with as-built plans for the existing structure. No work is proposed on site and the intention is to record the building in its current form.
- OHAC supports the proposal.
- Ungraded (the Overstrand Heritage Survey notes the building as not conservation worthy)
- Outside HPO

COMMENT

No trigger letter to the NHRA to be issued.

CH

**14.11 Erf 7999, Lemm's Corner, 72 Main Road, Hermanus, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032705CH0404**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- There are four structures on the Erf namely the Sidewalk building, Hamman's cottage, Fisherman cottage and the Rossouw Modern Art Gallery.
- Graded IIIC (Hamman's cottage)
- Graded IIIB (Rossouw Modern Art Gallery)
- Outside HPO
- The proposal includes:
 - Rossouw Modern Art Gallery - A new sun stoep.
 - Hamman's Cottage - Minor internal alterations. Enclosing the street side stoep (new masonry wall and columns on NW elevation to match existing. Existing fenestration on NW elevation to be changed to frameless glass). Repurpose a sash window on the NE elevation.
- Work has not started.
- OHAC supports the work proposed to both structures.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.12 Erf 9192, 73 Meyer Street, George, S34-Minor Works (rezoning)

Case No.: HWC24030506CH0405

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is to rezone the property from single residential zone 1 to general residential zone 1.
- George Heritage Trust supports the proposal.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

COMMENT

No trigger letter to the NHRA to be issued.

CH

14.13 Erf 1122, 12 Wisbeach Road, Sea Point West, S34-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24031920KB0328

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for internal alterations and replacement of windows and doors within their original openings.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- SFB supports the proposal.
- SFA did not provide comment in 30 days commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.14 Erf 12897, 23 Upper Keppel Street, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24030715CN0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Locality Plan, External and Streetscape photos, WERRA comments required.

CN

14.15 Erf 1523, 5 Escombe Road - Marshall Court Unit 1 & 7, Vredehoek, S34-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC23120804CN0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Completed application form and streetscape photos required.

CN

14.16 Erf 156017, 18 Norton Way, Rondebosch, S34-Minor Works

Case No.: HWC24031807CN0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title Deed, Trust Resolution, Locality Plan, Streetscape photos and SG diagrams required.

CN

14.17 Erf 29113-RE, Le Joubert Wine E, Paarl, S38(4)-NID

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Company Resolution required.

CN

14.18 Erf 351, 21 Sunny Way, Pinelands, S34-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24032613CN0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

2023 Application form, POP, Plans, Locality Plan, All photos, motivation required.

CN

14.19 Erf 7747, 5 Riesling Street, Constantia, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24021905CN0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

2023 Application form, Company Resolution, Locality Plan, Streetscape photos, CoCT comments required.

CN

14.20 Erf 8735, 263 Main Road, Paarl, S34-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24032612KB0328

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

2023 Application form, Trust Resolution, Streetscape photos required.

CN

14.21 Erf 918-RE, 7 Chelsea Avenue, Vredehoek,
Case No.: HWC24031401KB0405

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for to remove a few internal walls and new beams over the openings.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.22 Erven 10010-RE, 117891-117898, 117965, Constitution Street, District Six, S38(4)-HIA

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for the Phase 5 redevelopment project is concerned with the restitution of families forcibly evicted from District Six under the Group Areas Act in the 1960s and 1970s. It is intended to build 184 houses on erven 10010-RE, 117891-117898, 117965 and 177362 as part of the current restitution project that encompasses two other parcels; of these, the Phase 4 HIA is concluded, and Phase 6 still underway. The architectural design was based on the guidelines set out in the District Six Court Orders Implementation Plan. In addition to the design of houses, blocks and street layouts, significant design elements that have been factored in.
- Heritage Resources Identified:
 - Archaeological sites exposed during the removal of overburden in 2020, including a cobbled surface, remnant fabric along Horstley Street linked to forced removals, excavated house footings, and the in-situ Hotel Tafelberg boiler.
 - Historic street fabric, alignments, and granite curbstones, which are recognized as archaeological heritage resources.
 - The overall socio-historic significance of the District Six area, recognized as a Grade 1 heritage site, with its sense of place rooted in the memory and trauma of forced removals.
 - Elements contributing to this sense of place, such as the public street culture, materiality of streets, historic character of Hanover Street, religious and educational activities, leisure spaces, and community events.
 - Graded historic properties in the immediate vicinity, including Art Deco terraces, Trafalgar High (a National Heritage Site), De Waal Drive Flats, Moravian Church and Parsonage, and terraced houses along Justice Walk.
 - Ungraded but significant elements like the Ellesmere Mosque, schools, the new play park, remnant street grid, and mature trees on site.
 - Visual impacts on recognized scenic routes (Philip Kgosana Drive and Nelson Mandela Boulevard), neighbouring Heritage Protection Overlay Zones, tangible and intangible heritage resources contributing to the sense of place attached to District Six.
- Anticipated Impacts on Heritage Resource:
 - Archaeological Material and Street Fabric Destruction: Due to the extensive cut and fill required for construction, it is highly likely that all surviving archaeological material, sites, features, deposits, and street fabric (except for the cobbled yard at Erf 7490 and Lewis Street) will be destroyed.
 - Social Impacts: Social impacts could arise if the development fails to preserve and integrate remnants of built form, acknowledge the loss and devastation of forced removals, or involve community-led memorialization processes with ongoing engagement. However, if community engagement is observed, social impacts are unlikely to be high, especially considering the restitution process.
 - Townscape Elements: Insensitive redevelopment could impact the character and qualities conveyed by existing site features and those generated by the redevelopment, resulting in a neighborhood that fails to achieve its indicators, does not serve the community, and is unsafe, unwelcoming, and not integrated into its context.
 - Visual Impacts: The anticipated visual impacts of the proposed development are likely to be of low significance without mitigation, with the most pronounced impacts within a 500m radius around the site. The magnitude of the impact on views, scenic routes, or cultural resources is considered low, and it is important to note that this development is not the first of its kind in District Six and forms part of a significant redevelopment

process, allowing previously removed residents to return to their community.

- Extensive public Consultation was undertaken, and the below bodies were consulted - District Six Museum, District Six Reference Group, District Six Working Committee, District Six Foundation, District Six Civic Association, Reclaim the City, Ndifuna Ukwazi, CIBRA, CIFA Heritage Committee, City of Cape Town Environmental and Heritage Management and SAHRA. Formal comments received were from City of Cape Town, SAHRA and the District Six Museum.
- CoCT supports the HIA overall and had some recommendations that were included into the SDP.
- SAHRA supports the HIA.
- District 6 Museum supports the HIA.
- The applicant lists various mitigation measures to limit impact to archaeological resources, provisions to be implemented for socio-historic significance and visual impacts, construction phase mitigation measures, provisions to limit townscape impacts, public spaces and street, historic sites and land use, street interface and design and architecture provisions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee notes the HIA and the specialist studies however required the following additional information:

- An appointment letter for the professional archaeologist who will undertake the monitoring and mitigation work must be provided."
- The tracklog or previous report must be included in the Archaeological Impact Assessment or included as an appendix including the section 35 application, not only the permits.

CN

14.23 Erf 29662, 8 Hillview Road, Sybrand Park, S34- Minor Works Case No.: HWC24040524CSI0408

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S34 A&A minor works application, work has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed external work is for the replacement of timber windows with aluminium windows, a new dormer window, a new boundary wall, and a carport with garage façade. Proposed internal work is for the replacement of bathroom and kitchen finishes.
- City of Cape Town have provided official comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.24 Erf 370, 10 Grey Street, Greyton, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24040408CSI0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

- New application form submitted and streetscape photographs, locality plan, title deed, PoP and comment from Theewaterskloof Municipality or Ward 2 Forum which is the conservation body

14.25 Erf 415, 51 East Way, Pinelands, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24040409CSI0408

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S34A&A, work applied for has not started
- The building is graded IIIC and within an HPOZ
- The proposed addition is a sunroom
- Comment has been provided by the City of Cape Town and the Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association who support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.26 Erf 4633, 13 Disa Avenue, Hermanus, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: CSI0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form and PoP required.

CSI

14.27 Erf 50762, 13 St Patricks Road, Claremont, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24020517CSI0402

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S34 A&A application, work applied for has not started.
- Building is graded NCW and not within an HPOZ.
- Proposed work is for a new covered patio, new garage, new pool, and new roof for an existing covered patio, new aluminium stacking door, and replacing the old windows with aluminium windows.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- The City of Cape Town and The Greater Lynfræ Civic Association have provided official comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.28 Erf 7, 27 Exeter Avenue, Bishopscourt, S34- Total Demolition
Case No.: HWC24021412CSI0402

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Total demolition, work applied for has not started.
- The property is graded NCW and not within an HPOZ.
- Proposed demolition is for all structures older than 60 years located on the erf including the house, outbuildings, and pool structures.
- The most up to date plan which was submitted was from 1978.
- The applicant's motivation for a total demolition is to provide accommodation that is more consistent with modern living standards.
- Comment has been provided by the CoCT and the Cape Town Heritage Foundation who support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CSI

14.29 Erf 70345, 19 St Joan Street, Plumstead, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24040302CSI0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Motivation to be obtained.

CSI

14.30 Er 748-E, 92 High Level Road, Greenpoint, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032530CSI0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

CSI

14.31 Erf 76592, 5 Jan Smuts Street, Southfield, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032609CSI0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Locality map/plan, SG diagram, motivation for proposed work, Request for new application form as current one didn't scan properly, Request for drawings to be sent as separate PDF

CSI

14.32 Erf 66211, 4 De Villiers Road, Wynberg, S34- Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24020519CSI0328

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT indicated work has already started, application form does not state that.

Applicant has been emailed requesting clarity. No streetscape photographs.

CSI

- 14.33 Erf 1067, 14 Finchley Road, Camps Bay, S34-Retain**
Case No.: HWC24040503EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application Form, plans, streetscapes, and consultation comments are required.

EJV

- 14.34 Erf 29357, 18 Raleigh Road, Mowbray, S34 - Additions**
Case No.: HWC24030530EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title deed, SG Diagram, consultation comments, and motivation are required.

EJV

- 14.35 Erf 68810, 7 Kent Road, Wynberg, S31 and S34 - Total Demolition**
Case No.: HWC24032615EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Site plan, as-built plan, and consultation comments are required.

EJV

- 14.36 Erf 1052, 20 Rosmead Avenue, Gardens, S34 – Additions & Alterations**
Case No.: HWC24022001EJV0405

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC inside an HPO
- The rear of the house is currently under construction authorized by a previous permit HWC23051501RG0516. The proposed works include the addition of a first storey above the ground floor consisting of an ensuite bedroom, study and balcony all within the existing footprint of the dwelling. The additions will keep in the style of the original structure so as not to detract from its historical character.
- CoCT and CIBRA supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

- 14.37 Erf 11238, Rembrandt Mall located on the corner of Lady Grey and Bergrivier streets, Paarl, S34 - Minor Works**
Case No.: HWC24040417EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internals, externals, and plans are required.

EJV

14.38 Erf 157830, 191 Main Road, Kalk Bay, S34 – Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24022711KB0328

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed works include redoing the kitchen and bathrooms as they are not currently functional, and lowering their floor level back to the original level as previous tenants raised them. The old kitchen window will be removed and reused as a bay window in the new study. A new stair will be installed to access the loft in which three dormer windows will be added. The asbestos roof is to be removed and replaced with Victorian profile coastal quality galvanized metal. The fixed glazed glass on the stoep will be replaced with frameless glass to not impinge on the timber work, the timber screen will be replaced with more appropriate framed fixed glass windows and door. Staff quarters are to be extended to include a new bathroom. The single garage will be converted to a double and a wheelchair lift will be discretely installed to access the ground level. The courtyard will be converted into a sanctuary.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Work has not started
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.39 Erf 3587, 151 Arum Road, Table View, S34 - Total Demolition
Case No.: HWC24040415EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Company/trust resolution, motivation, and as-built plans are required.

EJV

14.40 Erf 78409, 116 Myburgh Street, Diepriver, S34 - Additions
Case No.: HWC24040525EJV0408

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Correct application form, internals, company/trust resolution, plans, conservation body comments, and motivation are required as well as clarity as to whether work has started and whether the fabric is indeed older than 60 years.

EJV

14.41 Erf 7952, 14 Drakenstein Street, Somerset West, Unknown
Case No.: HWC24032007KB0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form, plans, streetscapes, conservation body comment, and heritage motivation are required as well as clarity as to whether work has started or been completed.

EJV

14.42 Erf 85415, 15 Hants Road, Lakeside, S34 – Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24040315KB0408

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title deed, SG Diagram, plans, locality, photographs, consultation comments, and motivation are required.

EJV

14.43 Farm RE/150, Karoetjies Kop 150, Vanrhynsdorp, S38(8) – NID
Case No.: HWC24031902EJV0405

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application, title deed, company/trust resolution, PoA, SG Diagram, locality, topographical map, palaeosensitivity map, photographs, motivation, heritage information are required.

EJV

14.44 Erf 178079, Platteklip Upper Wash House, Van Riebeeck Park, Oranjezicht, S27-Alterations
Case No.: HWC24022801SJ0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title deed, door schedule and plans as separate document.

SJ

14.45 Erf 45889, 24 Lovers Walk, Rondebosch, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24022610SJ0402

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Both owners must sign the application form.

SJ

14.46 Erven 66844-Re, 66845, 91794 & 91795, 53 & 59 Durban Road and 16 Mortimer Road, Wynberg, S27- Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24022103SJ0404

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for change in planning status of PHS (cadastral boundary adjustment).
- Owners of the properties intend to subdivide off and transfer lands along common boundaries to regularize cadastral and physical boundaries.
- Transfer of land is to ensure that existing fence line becomes cadastral line. There will be no physical impact to heritage fabric.
- Erf 66844-Re & 66845, Long Cottage, 53 Durban Road: PHS
- Erf 91794, Vredenhof, 59 Durban Road: PHS
- Wigmore
- Erf 91795, Wigmore, 16 Mortimer Road: constructed 1980s, requires further invest.
- Consultation: N/A
- CoCT EHM: support

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

15. Other Matters

16. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

CH moves to adopt and CN seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. Closure:

18. Date of Next Meeting

22 April 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society
BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers & Residents Association
CoCT – City of Cape Town
CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust
CRM - Cultural Resources Management
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association
Docomomo South Africa
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department
FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area
FE - Friends of Elim
GLCA- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association
HVA- Harfield Village Association
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
ABHC - Associated Bibbys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
CBCRA - Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
EMPr - Environmental Management Program
FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation
HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HPO – Heritage protects overlay

HWC – Heritage Western Cape
IACom - Impact Assessment Committee

KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage
Paarl300 Foundation
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society
SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association
SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust
GHT - George Heritage Trust
RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society
VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association
IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NRA - Newlands Residents Association
OCA - Observatory Civic Association
OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
PPP - Public Participation Process
PHCT - Priel Heritage and Cultural Trust
RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SPFA - Sea Point for All Group
SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
Ward 2 Forum
WCC - Whale Coast Conservation
WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association