

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 11 November 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Mr Ruan Brand officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr Ruan Brand (RB)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)
Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Xola Mlwandle (XM)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Sofia Briel (SVB)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	(Admin)
Ms. Yusrah Hoosain (YH)	(Intern)
Mr. Shicavo Austine Vhukeya (SAV)	(Intern)

Legal Advisor

None

Observers

None

Visitors

Ms Josephine MacRobert
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Jonathan Kaplan
Mr Ron Martin
Mr John Biernacki
Ms Laura Milandri

3. Apologies

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM) (Deputy Director: Legal)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda of 11 November 2024. CN moves to adopt the agenda and CH

seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

6.1. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of 4 November 2024. EJV moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1. Site inspections undertaken.

None

9.2. Proposed Site Inspection

9.3. Site Inspection Reports

9.3.1 Erven RE 357, 739, RE 77, Elands Bay (SB)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the site inspection report.

9.3.2 Erf 66, Elands Bay (Hailstone midden), Elands Bay (CSI)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the site inspection report.

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1 IACom – 13 November 2024

9.4.2 BELCom – 20 November 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

None

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

9.6.1 Erf 754, 8 Cheviots Place, Green Point, Cape Town (Report 4) (19102335SB1106E) (SB)

- Item removed from the agenda.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

13.15, 13.20, 13.21, 14.2, 14.4, 14.5, 14.6, 14.7, 14.8, 14.9, 14.14, 14.15, 14.16, 14.18, 14.19, 14.20, 14.26, 14.27, 14.30, 14.31, 14.32, 14.34, 14.36, 14.37, 14.38, 14.40, 14.41, 14.43, 14.44, 14.48, 14.49, 14.54, 14.56, 14.58, 14.65, 14.66, 14.67, 14.69, 14.70, 14.71, 14.73, 14.74, 14.75

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.8.1 Multiple farms inland of Doringbaai, Vredendal (21071902SB0728E) (SB)

DISCUSSION:

In 2021, HWC endorsed Kaplan's Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), which covered areas initially proposed for prospecting, with a condition requiring additional field assessment for new prospecting areas. ASHA Consulting was engaged to evaluate archaeological resources in these additional areas east of Doringbaai.

New field survey of specific farm portions to inform drilling for subsurface samples.

Methodology: Literature review and field survey in October 2024.

Findings: The survey identified Middle Stone Age (MSA), Early Stone Age (ESA), and Later Stone Age (LSA) artifacts, mainly in exposed dorbank areas, and previously documented shell scatters, middens, and MSA artifacts, many of which have been disturbed by mining.

Overall, while the area holds scattered archaeological resources, only a few identified sites merit preservation. Four sites near waypoints 444, 446, and 390 require protection. Avoid drilling directly on these sites to prevent damage, though driving over them may cause minimal impact.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse the Archaeologist specialist study prepared by ASHA Consulting dated 28 October 2024 and the following recommendation:

1. The locations of the sites at waypoints 444, 446 and 450 should be avoided with a buffer of 20 m from the waypoints being adhered to. No activity (drilling or driving) may occur in these areas; and
2. If any archaeological material or human burials are uncovered during the course of development, then work in the immediate area should be halted. The find would need to be reported to the heritage authorities and may require inspection by an archaeologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution.
3. It should also be noted that this assessment considers only the possibility of drilling core samples. Should any larger scale work (bulk sampling or mining) occur then a new assessment of those activities should be conducted.

9.8.2 Erf 64, Elands Bay Cave, graffiti removal (SB)

- The permit was approved under the ASD delegation, the graffiti removal will take place on the 2 December. The committee awaits the final report after the removal of the graffiti.

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

None

9.10 Permit deadline.

12 November 2024 at 10:00

10. Administrative Matters

11. Monitoring by practitioner

11.1 Portion 2 of Farm 40, Main Street, Saron - HWC24091915SB0923 (SB)

- The committee endorsed the appointment of Ms Anne Marie Fick to monitor the proposed work.

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13. MATTERS ARISING

13.1 Erf 88327, 56 Main Road, St James, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24082802RB0910

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding Information received on 14 October and 1 November 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Property is graded as IIIB.
- Inside the Muizenberg, St James, Kalk Bay HPOZ.
- Proposal is for the installation of 2 Nutec dormer windows.
- The design thereof has gone through extensive revisions with the CoCT HRS team.

- CoCT HRS supports.
- Kalk Bay and St James Ratepayers & Residents Association & Kalk Bay Historical Association have no objection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

13.2 Erf 3360, 35 Lourens River Road, Strand, S34 - Additions & Alterations **Case No: HWC24090207RB0903**

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 5 November 2024
- Work has not started.
- Property is ungraded on the city map viewer, but the provided CoCT HRS comment proposes it as a IIIC.
- Property does not fall within any HPO.
- Proposed work is for extensions to the front and rear of the building.
- HRF says the building is NCW and declined opportunity to comment.
- CoCT HRS supports the proposed work on condition that the gable facing onto Lourens River Street is retained.
- The building plans show that this gable is retained.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

13.3 Erf 8290, 110 Church Street, Strand, S34 - Additions & Alterations **Case No: HWC24101704RB1017**

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 6 November 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Structure is graded as NCW.
- Outside of an HPO.
- Proposed work is for internal reconfigurations as well as additions to the garage and a new boundary wall.
- CoCT declines to comment as they consider the structure to be NCW.
- HRF offered a comment of no objection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

13.4 Erf 1529, 8 Frederick Crescent, Tamboerskloof, S34 - Additions, Alterations & Partial Demolition
Case No: HWC24092503RB0926

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 18, 21 October 2024, and 7 November 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Property is ungraded, although a provided CoCT comment states that it has limited architectural significance and as such is a 3C/NCW.
- Outside of any HPO.
- The proposal is for large changes to the structure and to consolidate changes made to the house before it triggered S34 of the NHRA.
- The specific proposed new work entails adding a second storey, new pergolas, decks, and outbuildings, and changing the existing entrance of the house.
- The applicant had approval for some of this work in 2014 but that has since lapsed, and the structure is now older than 60 years.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

13.5 Erf 14653, 43 Kylemore Road, University Estate, S34 - Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24093015CSI0910

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 1 November 2024 for streetscape photographs, CoCT comment, proof of correspondence from Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group and Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
- Work applied for has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for the total demolition of the two structures on site
- CoCT and Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association provided comment and support the application. Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group did not provide comment within 30 days (initial email sent 30 Sept).

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CSI

13.6 Erf 2702 and Various Roads, Onrus, Hermanus, S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24082109CSI1015

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 5 November 2024 for the title deed and power of attorney
- Proposed development is for pumping stations structures and associated infrastructure
- There is no visual impact expected

- The pumping stations and associated infrastructure are expected to be implemented in a residential area so there are no archaeological impacts expected
- Palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is a mixture of low and high

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon. Chance Finds Protocol to be included into the approval.

CSI

13.7 Erf 29102, Groot Parys Deli, off Jan Van Riebeeck Drive, S34 - Additions & Alterations **Case No: HWC24101503CSI1016**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 5 November 2024 for signed application form, streetscape images, and coloured up plan.
- Work applied for has not started
- IIIB / Proposed PHS – Has not officially been declared (BELCom 2012)
- Outside HPO but inside the proposed Paarl HPO
- Proposed work is for a new roof to an existing wine cellar structure
- Drakenstein Municipality, DHF, Paarl 300 provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.8 Erf 337, 17 Silveroak Avenue, Thornton, S34 - Additions & Alterations **Case No: HWC23111607CSI0910**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 4 November 2024 for new internal photos
- Work applied for has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for a new garage and internal alterations
- CoCT provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.9 Erf 489, 5 Church Street, Prince Albert, S34 - Additions & Alterations, Restoration **Case No: HWC24101110CSI0930**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 25 October 2024 and 5 November 2024 for comment from the municipality and Simon van der Stel Foundation.

- Outstanding information received on the 11th of October for PoP, comment from the Prince Albert Cultural Foundation, and the approximate ages of the structures on site
- Work applied for has not started
- Not Graded
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for the restoration of the existing dairy building and barn, the addition of a new bakery to the existing barn by enclosing the afdak, new staff facilities and ablutions, a new kitchen, the expansion of the existing parking area, and for a new low stone wall to be added to the werf to define the parking area, and a new storage shed.
- The Prince Albert Cultural Foundation had heritage recommendations which were revised accordingly on the plans but supported the application. The Prince Albert Municipality provided comment stating that they were in agreement with the Prince Albert Cultural Foundation. SvDS provided comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.10 Erf 524, 5 Ixia Avenue, Devil's Peak Estate, Vredehoek, S34 - Minor Works **Case No: HWC24101008CSI0913**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 6 November 2024 for streetscape photographs
- Work applied for has started but stopped to allow for the necessary S34 process.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for a new garden shed with timber screen

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit plans indicating what work is completed and what work must still be completed.

CSI

13.11 Erf 9013, 29 Morgenster Avenue, Somerset West, S38(4) - NID **Case No: HWC24092511CSI1016**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 7 November 2024 for the SDP
- Proposed development is for the demolition of the existing guest house and the construction of 39 residential flats of 2 blocks over three storeys in height
- There might be visual impacts but difficult to tell. The buildings proposed might impact views from the Morgenster Werf.
- The applicant has stated that they do not know the age of the guest house to be demolished and there is no further information available through the municipality.
- No impact is expected for any archaeological material
- The palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is moderate

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Visual Impact Assessment on the cultural landscape.

CSI

13.12 Portion 10 and 129 of Farm 468, Welmoed Estate, Annandale Road, Stellenbosch, S38(4) - NID Case No: HWC24092516CSI0925

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 4 November 2024 for the company resolution
- Proposed development is for a new off-stream dam on the Portion 10 of Farm Welmoed. An area has been identified as a suitable clay borrow area on Portion 129
- There are no negative visual impacts expected or impacts to the cultural landscape
- There are 5 historical buildings situated on the farm, but the proposed development is located more than 250m away from any of them and there are no impacts anticipated to any of the buildings
- In terms of archaeology, despite the overall archaeological sensitivity of the Cape Winelands, the area proposed for development has been subject to intense agriculture for many years and as such, it is unlikely that significant archaeological heritage will be impacted by the proposed development.
- The area proposed for development is underlain by sediments of moderate to zero palaeontological sensitivity according to the SAHRIS Palaeosensitivity Map. The proposed development is underlain by Granite from the Kuils River Batholith Formations which has insignificant or zero palaeontological sensitivity. The area which is depicted as having moderate sensitivity on the SAHRIS Palaeosensitivity Map, is underlain by Quaternary Alluvium which has low palaeontological sensitivity.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

CSI

13.13 Portion 4 of Farm 174, Farm Woodville, off Seven Passes Road, George, S38(4) - NID Case No: HWC24100718CSI1017

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 7 November 2024 for clarification regarding the impact of the development
- Proposed development is for the establishment of tourism accommodations and associated facilities – a tourism centre and parking
- The existing agricultural building is to be demolished, and the tourism centre will be built within the existing footprint
- The height of the proposed tourism centre is in keeping with the agricultural structure which it will replace.
- The land has been heavily farmed so there is no anticipated impact on any archaeological materials
- The palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS map is grey

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

CSI

13.14 Erf 272, Le Bon Vivant Restaurant, La Rochelle Street, Franschhoek, S34 - Partial Demolition **Case No: HWC24101407EJV1015**

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 1 November 2024.
- Demolition of the thatched rondavel on site constructed in the 1950s as an outbuilding for staff quarters
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO; Inside Scenic Route
- Work has not started
- The municipality, SHF, and the Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayers Association did not respond in 30 days; SIG confirmed that the property is outside of their zone of interest

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.15 Erf 1031, 5 Stellendal Road, Audas Estate, Somerset West, S34 - Additions, Alteration & Restoration **Case No: HWC24091613SB0710**

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Title deed, company resolution required.

SB

13.16 Erf 33030, 43 Cressy Road, Athlone, S38(4) - NID **Case No: HWC24101108CN1014**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 11 November 2024.
- Map Viewer notes intangible heritage.
- The site was previously a formal burial ground used by the Anglican Church, with burials dating back to 1867. The last recorded burial occurred in 1951.
- Cultural Significance: The site holds associative significance for the Black River community and is linked to the history of slavery in South Africa, particularly concerning the descendants of enslaved people.
- Archaeological Potential: There is a chance of encountering human remains during development, necessitating monitoring and archaeological assessments.
- Possible Impacts to Heritage Resources
- Graves and Burial Grounds: Although graves have been exhumed, there is potential for human remains to be discovered during construction. Monitoring is proposed to mitigate impacts on any remaining heritage resources.
- Cultural Heritage: The site may be associated with oral traditions and living heritage that require further investigation to assess their significance.

- Historical Context: The development could alter the character of the site, which has historical importance due to its use as a burial ground for various congregations across Cape Town, potentially impacting local community sentiments and cultural identity.
- Consultant recommends: HIA

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment
2. Cultural assessment
3. Socio historical study

SB

13.17 Farm 811, Portion 32, Wilderer Distillery, R45, Simondium, Paarl, S38(4) - NID **Case No: HWC24090218SB0910**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 31 October 2024.
- Converting family farm to tourism accommodation along a scenic route.

DECISION

The proposal does not trigger the NHRA. A letter of no trigger to be issued.

SB

13.18 Remainder Farm 847, Hartebeeskraal, Paarl, S38(4) - NID **Case No: HWC23112415SB0611**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Mr Clive Theunissen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 11 November 2024.
- Proposed consolidation and subdivision of the subject farm
- Palaeontological moderate according to SAHRIS
- Consultant recommendation: NFS

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit photographs.

SB

13.19 Erf 1353, 11 Minserie Street, Stellenbosch, S34 - Alteration **Case No: HWC24091803SB1016**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Mr Stuart Hermansen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 6 November 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started, proposed internal rearrangements of the house, expanding the kitchen,

relocating the laundry, and converting dining room to bedrooms. External changes include replacing the monopitch veranda with a bell-curve roof and timber brackets, switching out aluminium and steel windows with timber sash windows and doors, adding a glazed wind lobby on the western side, and installing a pergola in the courtyard on the eastern side. The existing roof layout will remain unchanged, and there will be ample off-street parking without obstructing the street view of the house.

- Stellenbosch municipality: support
- SIG required clarification on the drawings, stating not accurate which were respond to noting that the roof configuration will remains, budget constraints and use of corrugated sheets, there is a revised elevation that addressed the boundary wall concern (wall height match now).
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation did not comment within 30 days (email sent 18 August).
- SIG concerns addressed.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

13.20 ST681-3, 4 Croydon Avenue, Stellenbosch, S34 - Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24091622SB0918

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

locality map, streetscape, comments, SG Diagram required.

SB

13.21 Erf 285, 13 Avenue Normandie Road, Fresnaye, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24080625XM1010

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

SFB comment required.

XM

13.22 Erf 31530, 6 Langton Road, Mowbray, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24072208XM0725

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 27 September, 9 October and 4 November 2024
- Proposal: as-built plans an addition of a new covered pergola, patio, new carport, swimming pool and change the door by the patio with a sliding door.
- Work has been completed; patio is as built and the pool and carport not yet built.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT comment: Partial works have already commenced. HRS does not condone unauthorised work on a heritage resource. The work shown is of such a nature that it will not have a negative impact on the associated levels of significance of the resource, nor on any nearby resources. supports
- RAMPAC stamped the plan and support.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

XM

13.23 Erf 5041, 5 Vygeboom Crescent, Eversdale, Vygeboom, S34 - Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24092005XM0710

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 30 October 2024
- The proposal is for total demolition in order to develop the site.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- The Durbanville Heritage Society has no objection
- The CoCT did not provide comment within 30 days

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

XM

13.24 Erf 10861, Flat 1, Kingston Court, 12 Sunray Road, Fish Hoek, S34 - Minor works

Case No: HWC24081914XM0913

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 4 November 2024.
- The proposal is for renovations to the existing dwelling
- Work has started
- NCW
- Outside HPO

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit plans indicating what work is completed and what work must still be completed.

XM

13.25 Portion 9-RE of Cape Farms 159 (CA159-9-RE), 36 Westerdale Road, Westerdale, S38(4) - NID

Case No: HWC24101401CN1014

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 5 November 2024.
- The property measures approx. 2.2ha in extent, with a current land use of farming and a zoning of rural. The surrounding land uses are agricultural and residential.
- The proposal is for a new ClearVu boundary fence and piers that will surround the entire property boundaries.
- CoCT comment states that they do not support the approval of the building plan until the heritage process has concluded. S38 required
- Applicable Heritages:
 - Landscapes: The only resources listed was the grade IIIA landscape which has visual qualities and forms part of the Durbanville Hills Cultural Landscape.
 - Palaeo: According to the SAHRIS palaeo map, the property is located in the blue zone, indicating a low sensitivity.
 - Impact: The applicant states that there will be no impacts to the historical significance of

property.

- Consultant does not recommend an HIA.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

CN

14. NEW MATTERS

14.1 Erf 10541, 31 Third Avenue, Fish Hoek, S34 - Additions, Alterations & Partial Demolition Case No: HWC24101413CSI1028

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work applied for has not started
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for an extension to the kitchen area and for a new dwelling to the rear of the property
- CoCT provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.2 Erf 11340, 54A Burg Street, Wellington, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24102204CSI1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Clarification regarding why this was submitted to HWC, all photos, all completed and ongoing work is to be annotated accordingly on the plans required.

CSI

14.3 Erf 141437, 2 Church Street, Rondebosch, S34 - Minor Works Case No: HWC24102201CSI1023

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work applied for has not started
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Proposed work is for the addition of a bedroom to the rear of the current dwelling
- CoCT provided comment and support the application. Rustenburg Valley Residents Association did not provide comment within 30 days

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14.4 Erf 39829, 12 Old Oak Road, Bellville, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102304CSI1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Clarification regarding whether any work is to be done to the main building (The Hollow Tree Restaurant and Tavern), new application form required

CSI

14.5 Erf 730, 5 Freesia Avenue, Vredehoek, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102404CSI1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Internal, externals, and streetscape photographs required.

CSI

14.6 Erf 9651, 30 Main Road, Hout Bay, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24101513CSI1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Internal, externals, and streetscape photographs required.

CSI

14.7 Erf 97575, 58 Main Street, Newlands, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102209CSI1023

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

New application form, company resolution, CoCT, NRA comments required.

CSI

14.8 Farm 1029-RE, Off the R45, Saldanha Bay, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24101601CSI1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

AIA and PIA documents and clarification as to why two applications were submitted required.

CSI

14.9 Farm 1029-RE, Off the R45, Saldanha Bay, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24101526CSI1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

AIA and PIA documents and clarification as to why two applications were submitted required.

CSI

14.10 Farm 1066-RE, Basse Provence Farm, 45 Main Road, Franschhoek, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24101612CSI1028

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed development is for a boutique hotel comprising arrival offices, a spa, hospitality suites, breakfast terrace, hotel shop, hotel bar with deck area and parking for guests and staff and a new farmyard werf with vegetable garden, greenhouse, processing/market shed, possible future farm shop, boutique hotel gym, yoga deck, farm offices, farm shed, stores, workshop and staff parking.
- There are various buildings on the farm including the homestead and its outbuildings. The werf

as a whole has architectural, aesthetic and historical significance.

- The werf can be considered a historic settlement in its own right, dating back to the mid-19th C. As a composite, the werf has, in previous HIA's involving the same property, been graded Grade IIIA.
- The site falls within the scenic Franschhoek Valley Cultural Landscape even though the werf itself is largely shielded by tree canopies from the R45 apart from the homestead, which does have some landmark status. Basse Provence falls within an area recommended as a Grade IIIA landscape in terms of the Tangible Heritage Resources Inventory of the Stellenbosch Municipality (March 2018).
- An archaeological study of the property was conducted by Dr Ute Seeman in 2006/2007. Various items of cultural/historical significance were identified for further study at that stage including some water channels and a well. Those have been flagged as heritage hot spots should development be proposed in or near those areas. Taking that into consideration, it is recommended that no further archaeological studies be undertaken unless archaeological material, including industrial archaeological material comes to light during the course of the work. Should that occur, then an archaeological monitoring brief would need to be exercised, employing a suitably qualified and experienced archaeologist in terms of HWC's standard protocols for unexpected archaeological finds in accordance with S.35 of the NHRA.
- The palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is low. Furthermore, The Malmesbury Group is known to not contain significant fossil records due to extensive metamorphism to which its rocks were subjected hundreds of millions of years ago. This typically destroys fossil evidence.
- The consultant has noted that a historical study has been commissioned and should such significance come to light, that will be addressed as part of the HIA that has been recommended.
- The consultant recommends an HIA with VIA and a tree survey, should the new development be located at, or near to established mature trees (especially oaks) on the property.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Visual Impact Assessment on cultural landscape including tree survey
2. Architectural analysis
3. Desktop Archaeological Impact Assessment

CSI

14.11 Portion 5 of Farm 918, Farm Gustrouw, Somerset West, S38(8) - NID Case No: HWC24062620CSI1028

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

Mr Jonathan Kaplan was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed development is for a 103 low-density residential housing units, internal roads, and associated infrastructure
- There are two structures on site which are not older than 60 years, one of the structures is to be demolished
- There are no visual impacts expected as the proposed development is not located on a scenic route.
- The Committee advised that the proposed development is located on the cultural landscape and a Visual Impact Assessment will be required to understand the impact of the proposed development.
- In terms of archaeology, scattered ESA lithics were discovered with no associated finds
- The palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is a mixture of low and moderate

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Visual Impact Assessment on the cultural landscape

CSI

14.12 Portions 125, 126, 127, 128, and 4 of Farm 444, Plettenberg Bay, S38(4) - NID Case No: HWC24100804CSI1025

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed development is for a new sewer rising main pipeline (75mm diameter, approximately 470m long) in the Rietvlei Road reserve. New outfall sewer pipeline (250mm diameter, approximately 445m long) in the N2 road reserve where it will connect to the existing Goose Valley main pump station. The existing 75mm diameter pipe in Rietvlei Road reserve needs to be upgraded to a 110mm diameter pipe (extending approximately 220m long).
- There are no visual impacts anticipated
- There are no negative impacts to any archaeological material as the proposed development is in a road reserve
- The palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is unknown (palaeo map is in the report)

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon. Chance Finds Protocol to be included into the approval

CSI

14.13 Erf 1238, Paternoster North Midden, Paternoster, S35 - Destructive Analysis & Dating Case No: HWC24102916EJV1028

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The destructive analysis of five marine shell samples and one charcoal sample from PNM (1986 excavations) through radiocarbon dating to determine the chronological detail of precolonial settlement and subsistence strategies. At least 50% of each sample will be destroyed for the sake of AMS dating, but the total percentage of the collection is less than 1.0%
- Unknown grading and HPO status
- Work has not started
- Charika Tilbury (WCA council) supports
- UCT Archaeology Department supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the Section 35 permit application prepared by Antonieta Jerardino dated 28 October 2024.

EJV

14.14 Erf 282, 53 Bezuidenhout Street, Stanford, S31 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24102905EJV1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Consultation comments required.

EJV

14.15 Erf 2924, Cherry Lane, Welbedacht, Knysna, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24102906EJV1030

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Comment on the paleontological sensitivity and photographs required.

EJV

14.16 Erf 3195, 7 Linnet Way, Pinelands, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102408EJV1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

City of Cape Town comment; streetscape photographs; plans to indicate where work has started required.

EJV

14.17 Erf 424, 26A De Bruyn Street, Stanford, S31 - Deviation

Case No: HWC24102506EJV1028

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Inaccuracies between the plans and the SG diagram have resulted in an amendment to the boundary by 950mm. The ramp is being decreased in size, the covered stoep will extend to the other dwelling, and the visitor's suit will include a change in the doors and window to accommodate the changed ramp. The previous permit was actioned, and a minor unauthorised deviation has occurred as is indicated on the revised plans.
- Ungraded
- Inside HPO
- Work has started (both in accordance with the previous permit and aspects of the deviation unauthorised)
- OHAC supports the proposal.
- Stanford Conservation supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.18 Erf 47489, Cape Town Film Studios, Blue Downs, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24102306EJV1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Locality plan; screening tool; photographs; confirmation that the site is over 5000m² required.

EJV

14.19 Erf 48, Atlantic Hills Business Park, Durbanville, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24102307EJV1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Locality plan; screening tool; photographs; confirmation that the site is over 5000m² required.

EJV

14.20 Erf 50721, 44 Keurboom Road, Claremont, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102910EJV1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

CoCT comment required.

EJV

14.21 Erf 55909, 8 Foyle Street, Claremont, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102207EJV1028

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Internal and façade changes to accommodate a third bedroom, en-suite bathroom, storeroom, open plan kitchen and dining area, as well as replacing windows and doors and the pergola. Since getting comments, the plans have been amended to include re-use of a timber window on the street facade to improve this interface, replacement of a door with a window, and a minor internal alteration to reposition an opening in the scullery. The amendments are substantially in accordance with what I&APs supported.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started
- CoCT support; UCRRA believe the proposal will have no impact

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.22 Portion 7 of Farm 197, Port of Saldanha Plant, Saldanha, S38(8) - NID

Case No: HWC24102507EJV1030

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Trigger s38(1)(c)(i). Proposal is for the installation of a 22MW output dual fuel generator and associated infrastructure for the Port of Saldanha. The site has largely been transformed by surface excavation and alterations from the construction of the port infrastructure.
- The area has an extensive history of AIAs and PIAs that detail stone age, pastoral and colonial histories.
- There are no structures on site older than 60 years.
- The heritage sensitivity screener indicates low sensitivity due to the history of disturbance, while the palaeontological sensitivity screener indicates medium to high sensitivity; however, Prof. Bamford has stated that development and sea level fluctuations would make any significant fossil finds unlikely within the development footprint.
- Unknown grading
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started
- Nelius Kruger recommends No Further Studies

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

EJV

14.23 Farms 306 & 390, Birdfield and Klipheuwel, Klawer, S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24102907EJV1028

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Extension of the Klawer WEF environmental authorisation which necessitates confirmation to the DFFE that potential impacts have not changed thus necessitating a NID.
- The WEF undertook an HIA in 2010 that was then updated in 2016.
- Palaeosensitivity is indicated as high however Webley and Halkett (2016) note that the presence of the non-fossiliferous Peninsula Formation makes possible significant palaeontological impact low.
- Archaeologically, Jenna Lavin states that if the proposed development layout adheres to the recommendations of the 2016 HIA, that impact to archaeological heritage will be unlikely
- Unknown grading and HPO status
- Work has not started
- Jenna Lavin recommends No Further Studies

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as the proposed development work is still substantially in accordance with the previous record of decision.

EJV

14.24 Erf 149294-Re, Time Ball Tower, 35 Alfred Street, V&A Waterfront, Foreshore, S27 - Minor Works
Case No: HWC24030710SJ0515

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Ms Laura Milandri was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Graded II
- Outside of an HPO but within a proposed HPOZ.
- Proposal is for maintenance, repairs and internal alterations to the dilapidated structure. The tower was identified during the CMP process as a high priority site for repair and restoration.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that,

1. A close out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

SJ

14.25 Erf 77, 10 Church Street, Stanford, S31 - Deviations
Case No: HWC24102117SJ1022

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr John Biernacki was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Graded IIIB
- Within the Stanford HPOZ.
- Proposal is a deviation from an existing approved permit application (permit issued 01 August 2024).

- The proposal has been reduced to alleviate building costs and thus heritage impact has been lowered.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.26 Portion 9 of Farm 1579, Kleinbosch Farm, Kleinbosch Road, Dal Josaphat, Paarl, S27 - Restoration Case No: HWC24101609SJ1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Locality Map; Plans; HIA clarity required.

SJ

14.27 Erf 1247, 43 Regent Road, Sea Point, S34 - Emergency Application Case No: HWC24110659SJ1106

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Revised plans indicating correct scope of emergency work required.

SJ

14.28 Erf 1827, 34 Elizabeth Avenue, Pinelands, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24101107RB1024

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed work is for minor internal alterations for a live-in domestic worker. Full thatch and asbestos roof replacement with concealed fixed sheet metal roof coverings and new rainwater goods.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIC.
- Outside of any HPO.
- HWC issued a permit for the replacement of the asbestos roof in 2018 with the condition that the thatched roof may not be replaced.
- This decision was appealed, and the appeal was upheld, dated to 14 August 2018.
- However, this permit has since lapsed and as such a new permit application has been lodged.
- The CoCT comment notes that the removal of the thatched roof will impact the significance of the resource itself but not in its current context.
- As such, CoCT supports the re-application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

14.29 Erf 20898, 99 Davidson Road, George, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24102118RB1024

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work has not started.
- Property has two buildings, one of which is less than 60 years of age and another which is older than 60 years.
- It is ungraded.
- Falls outside of any HPO.
- The proposed work is for additions/extension to the first-floor level of the street facing elevation.
- George Municipality and Simon van der Stel did not provide comment within 30 days.
- George Heritage trust supported with conditions related to the boundary wall which is not older than 60 years and landscaping - neither of which fall under the ambit of the NHRA.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

14.30 Erf 21127, 147 Main Road, Somerset West, S34 - Minor Works
Case No: HWC24101520RB1024

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Power of Attorney and/or company resolution required.

RB

14.31 Erf 3390, 11 Plato Lane, Gordons Bay, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: RB1024

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Clarity on whether work has started, POP, Power of Attorney, internal and streetscape photographs, local authority comment, conservation body comment, and heritage motivation required.

RB

14.32 Erf 47776, 87 Sandown Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082707RB1030

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

POA or other owner's signature as per the title deed required.

RB

14.33 Portion 2 of Farm 300, Farm de Doorn Rivier, Heidelberg, S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24102403RB1024

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- This is a 38(8) NID for a proposed bentonite and zeolite prospecting on farm de Doorn rivier near Heidelberg.
- DMRE is the authorising authority.
- Proposed order of operations is phase 1 being the field mapping and surveying phase.

- Phase 2 being the literature review phase.
- Phase 3 being the auger drilling and sampling phase.
- Phase 4 being the sample analysis.
- and Phase 5 being the reserve and resource modelling phase to produce feasibility reports.
- HWC issued a NFS for the same activities 2km from this site in 2015.
- SAHRIS Palaeo is mainly red, high and a little bit of yellow, moderate.
- However, the targeted deposits consist of weathered shale and as such, if any fossils are present, these would be quite weathered.
- Applicant recommends NFS.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

RB

14.34 Portions 7 and 35 of Farm 25, Farm Rondheuwel, Hermon, S34 - Minor Works Case No: HWC24101701RB1024

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

SG diagram, coloured up to scale plan, clear locality map, internal, external, and streetscape photographs required.

RB

14.35 Portion 27 of Farm 277, Farm de Zoetmelks Rivier, off the N2, Riversdale, S38(8) - NID Case No: HWC24101504RB1031

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for another mining right on a farm for an existing borrow pit.
- This borrow pit would be mined for stone aggregate and gravel.
- The site is not visible from the N2 and is not near any other scenic routes.
- SAHRIS Palaeo has the proposed area as red, very high, however, it is part of a weathered shale deposit so any incorporated fossils would also be weathered.
- A letter from a palaeontologist was included in the application motivating for just a chance finds procedure being attached to the EMP.
- A walkover archaeology survey showed that the area is mainly cultivated land with some insignificant ESA cores being found on the surface.
- Applicant recommends NFS.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

RB

14.36 Remainder of Erf 2794, Corner of Cradock Street and Fichat Street, George, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24100714RB1031

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Internal photographs required.

RB

- 14.37 Portion 17 of Small Holding 221, Portion 10 of Small Holding 221, and Remainder of Portion 22 of Small Holding 221, off Botfontein, Road, Kraaifontein, S38(1) - NID**
Case No: HWC24080603RB

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Topo maps, SG Diagrams, Resolution/POA, and clarity with the application forms submitted and procedure required.

RB

- 14.38 Carissa WEF and Associated Infrastructure over Multiple Farm Portions, South of Beaufort West, along the N12, Central Karoo, Beaufort West, S38(8) - HIA (Phase 1)**
Case No: HWC24071217SB0712

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposing the development of a 1,000 MW Carissa Wind Energy Facility (WEF) approximately 30 km south of Beaufort West. The majority of the site falls within the Beaufort West Renewable Energy Development Zone (REDZ). The project includes 176 wind turbines, facility substations, power lines, a main transmission substation, grid connection corridors, and other infrastructure to connect the generated energy to the national grid. Additional components such as Battery Energy Storage Systems, laydown areas, and access roads are also part of the proposal.
- Architectural: Only two historically significant structures older than 60 may be negatively impacted due to their proximity to the grid corridor footprint
- Archaeological: Stone tools, graves, knapping or settlement sites, although low according to the screener report, moderate to high from the site inspection.
- Palaeontological noted as high sensitivity according to the report provide.
- Consultant recommends HIA

INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse Phase 1 of the HIA prepared by Heidi Fivaz & Sky-Lee Fairhurt-Booyse, dated 14 October 2024 and the following recommendations on page 96 to 100:

1. It is recommended that a final heritage walkthrough be completed before construction to identify any additional areas that may be impacted by development and that may have been missed due to adjustments to the development layout post-survey.
2. Resources given Field Rating IIIA: graveyard (BE/21/374/007) identified at Portion 21 of Brits Eigendom 374, is situated within the proposed Grid Corridor and will be negatively impacted by development. All graves are of high significance and should be protected. It is recommended that a Buffer/Safety No-Go zone of 50m should be implemented around the graves. The buffer/safety zone implemented should be clearly demarcated during the construction and decommissioning phases of the project and completely avoided by personnel and equipment. Should it be impossible to avoid graveyard(s), grave(s) or burial(s) sites during development, mitigation a workplan in terms section 36 application must be submitted to HWC before any relocation of burial or graves.
3. Resources given Field Rating IVA:
 - The Knapping site (F/RE/380/002; F/RE/380/003; F/RE/380/004) is highly significant. However, since the turbine's location has been adjusted post-survey, the site now falls outside the WTG86 footprint, so it will likely not be impacted. Thus, no further mitigation is recommended.
4. Resources given Field Rating IVB:
 - The farmstead older than 60 years with associated features (BE/19/374/010; BE/19/374/011) identified near the proposed grid corridor on Portion 19 of the Farm Brits Eigendom 374. These resources are considered to be of medium significance. Since the farmhouse (BE/19/374/010) is outside of the grid corridor, it will not be impacted by development. Thus, no further mitigation is recommended.
 - However, the kraal and associated features (BE/19/374/011) will be impacted. Thus, a 100 m buffer/safety zone is recommended to negate the negative impact.

– The historical period structures on Jagerskraal 2/374 (JK/2/374/27) and Portions 25, 21, and 4 of Brits Eigendom 374 (BE/374/028) are older than 60 years. Due to the recent changes that were made to the corridor locations, it will now be impacted by development. Any impact on these resources would be negative. A 100 m buffer/safety zone is recommended for JK/2/374/27 and a 200 m buffer/safety zone

recommended for BE/374/028 to negate the negative impact on these resources.

5. Resources given Field Rating IVC:

– The isolated occurrences of LSA period lithics (BE/2/374/017; PF/RE/370/018; PF/RE/370/019; PF/RE/370/019; MP/326/026) identified at Brits Eigendom 2/374, Palmietfontein RE/370, and Meyerspoort 326 are considered to be of low significance as they are without substantial archaeological context or matrix and are therefore deemed of minor scientific importance and not conservation-worthy (NCW). The impact is negligible. Thus, no further mitigation is recommended.

– The Historical Period resources (PF/2/370/005; VK/3/369/006; BE/RE/11/374/008; BE/RE/11/374/009; BE/8/374/012; BE/8/374/013; BE/8/374/014; BE/8/374/015; PF/RE/370/020) identified at Palmietfontein

2/370, RE/370 Vetkoe Kraal 3/369, Brits Eigendom RE/11/374, 8/374 are considered to be of low significance as they are without substantial archaeological context or matrix and are therefore deemed of minor scientific importance and not conservation-worthy (NCW). The impact is negligible. Thus, no further mitigation is recommended.

6. Although all possible care has been taken to identify sites of cultural importance during the investigation of study areas, it is always possible that hidden or sub-surface sites could be overlooked during the assessment. If during construction, any evidence of archaeological sites or remains (e.g. remnants of stone-made structures, indigenous ceramics, bones, stone artefacts, ostrich eggshell fragments, charcoal and ash concentrations), fossils or other categories of heritage resources are found during the proposed development, HWC must be alerted as per section 35(3) of the NHRA. If unmarked human burials are uncovered, the HWC must be alerted immediately as per section 36(6) of the NHRA. Depending on the nature of the finds, a professional archaeologist or palaeontologist must be contacted as soon as possible to inspect the findings. If the newly discovered heritage resources are of archaeological or palaeontological significance, a Phase 2 rescue operation may be required, subject to permits Issued by HWC. UBIQUE Heritage Consultants and its personnel will not be held liable for such oversights or costs incurred due to such oversights.

The Chance Find Protocol (Appendix A) for surface and sub-surface finds must be included in the EMPr and implemented by the ECO/site manager in charge of these developments. These discoveries ought to be protected (if possible, in situ). The ECO/site manager must report to HWC so that an archaeologist can carry out mitigation (collection and recording). Identified fossil sites are north, west and south of the development, and very few fossil sites have been documented in the Carissa WEF footprint. Based on the site investigation and desktop research, it is concluded that the Carissa WEF development footprint has a fossil heritage of scientific and conservational interest.

– Thus, a Palaeontological Walkdown is recommended by a professional Palaeontologist for the Carissa WEF and associated infrastructure before vegetation clearance and construction take place. A Chance Find Protocol is attached if fossil remains are discovered prior to the Palaeontological Walkdown.

– The Chance Find Protocol must be implemented by the ECO/site manager in charge of these developments. These discoveries ought to be protected (if possible, in situ). The ECO/site manager must report to HWC so that a palaeontologist can carry out mitigation (collection and recording).

– Preceding any collection of fossil material, the specialist would need to apply for a collection permit from HWC. Fossil material must be curated in an accredited collection (museum or university collection). At the same time, all fieldwork and reports should meet the minimum standards for palaeontological impact studies suggested by HWC (Appendix B).

The following mitigation and monitoring requirements are recommended to ensure the visual impact of the proposed development is limited (Donaway Environmental 2024, Appendix C):

7. The final HIA may be submitted to HWC upon completion.

14.39 Erf 13756, 15 Brickfields Road, Salt River, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101708SB1023

This is a duplicate case with XM as the original case officer.

SB

14.40 Erf 2299, 98 St Georges Street, Simon's Town, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24012306SB1023

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Streetscape photographs required.

SB

14.41 Erf 2482, 61B Pienaar Street, Somerset West, S34 - Alteration
Case No: SB1023

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

POP, locality plan, streetscape required.

SB

14.42 Remainder of Erf 3604, Eddie Prinsloo Street, Worcester, S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24080127SB1023

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Quarry has been operating more than 30 years and produces stone, the mine currently is 92.79 hectares and proposing to extend it to 50 hectares, but a large portion will be "no-go"/protected areas. A new access point and boom is proposed with future plans to relocate the office area.
- The only trigger is NEMA.
- Low visual impact as eastern portion of the Garden is screened by a ridge. Further, only a small portion visible from Worcester.
- Archaeological: There has been a previous survey, and no archaeological resource identified therefore impact low.
- Palaeontological: Low according to SAHRIS palaeo-map.
- Consultant recommends no further studies

COMMENT

The proposal does not trigger the NHRA. A letter of no trigger to be issued.

SB

14.43 Erf 3794, Point Road, Mossel Bay, S34 - Minor Works
Case No: HWC24102415SB1025

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Title deed, SG Diagram, POA required.

SB

14.44 Erf 56094, 25 Mountain Road, Claremont, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24102103SB1023

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Locality Plan, Internal, External, Streetscape photographs, municipality comments, conservation body comments, and motivation required.

SB

14.45 Cape Winelands Airport over Multiple Farm Portions, 66 Mellish Road, Paarl Farms, S38(8) - HIA
Case No: HWC23101215SB1102

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- NID Level: Consultant recommends HIA – VIA on the Landscape (HOMs committee: VIA on the CLA). This project will take place in a phased approach.
- Proposed “Cape Winelands Airport” is being developed into a commercial and aviation hub, expanding from approximately 150 hectares to 881 hectares. The focus includes enhancing non-aeronautical revenue streams such as property rentals
- Landscape/Built: The HIA indicates that while the landscape holds aesthetic significance due to its rural character, there are no significant built heritage resources within the development area. Structures older than 60 years were identified, but none were deemed aesthetically significant or worthy of conservation
- Findings:
 - The archaeological field report concluded that the expansion does not pose a significant threat to local archaeological heritage resources.
 - The Visual Impact Assessment (VIA) supports the development, provided that mitigation measures are effectively implemented
 - Cultural Landscape: The area has undergone significant transformation due to urban encroachment, with agricultural activities diminishing. The landscape is characterized by invasive alien vegetation and has lost much of its original ecological integrity
 - Historical Context: The airport site has historical relevance dating back to WWII but currently lacks significant structures that contribute to its heritage value. The existing buildings are primarily derelict and do not hold special significance
- Recommendations Summaries:
 1. Mitigation Measures: It is recommended that visual mitigation measures be applied to minimize the impact of the development on the cultural landscape. This may include landscaping strategies or architectural guidelines to blend new structures with the surroundings.
 2. Support for Development: Heritage Western Cape (HWC) is requested to support the proposed development, contingent upon adherence to the recommended mitigation strategies outlined in the HIA.
- Public Participation: City of Cape Town does not object but does provide a comment but noted that Buurmanskraal is not NCW. DHS had no objections

REFERRAL

The Committee resolved to refer the application/matter to IACom on 3 December 2024 for their expertise given the comment from City of Cape Town and the input required about the visual impact on the landscape.

SB

14.46 Farm 839, Casa Maris Estate, Stellenbosch, S47 - CMP
Case No: X111019JB17

HELD OVER

The application is held over to the Heritage Officers’ Meeting (HOMs) on 18 or 25 November 2024 due to the complex nature of the application.

SB

14.47 Erf 4444, 11 Duiker Street, North Cliff, Hermanus, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101707CH0122

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for the addition of four bedrooms and reception rooms.
- Work has not started.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- OHAC supports.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.48 Erf 55, 25 Caledon Street, Stanford, S31 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101703CH1024

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Internal, external and streetscape photographs required.

CH

14.49 Erf 80522, 35 Gordon Road, Heathfield S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24102413CH1028

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

POP with HWC reference number, application form to reflect correct property details (should be Erf 80522, 35 Gordon Road, Heathfield instead of Erf 730, 8 Weenen Road, Milnerton), streetscape photographs, CoCT comment and locality plan required.

CH

14.50 Erf 95137, 25 Queen Victoria Street, Cape Town, S27 - Minor Works
Case No: HWC24102126CH1022

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application to upgrade the interior lobby and reception area and bathrooms at the SA National Museum.
Repair specifications at the bathrooms include:
 - Fixtures and fixings
 - Floor and wall tiles
 - Finishes and accessories
 - Interior cubicle stalls
 - Interior timber doors
 - Ceilings and bulkheads
 - Lighting and additional electrical elements
 - Painting and cleaning.Repair specifications at the lobby and reception include:
 - Security access control system
 - Kiosk/ point-of-sale desk
 - Ceiling

- Information display
- Existing reception desks and copper framed door to be removed and replaced with steel frames structure with infill safety glass and new lockable glass door in space of copper door. The copper framed door will be stored for potential future use.
- The specifications are further detailed in annexure E and F.
- Work has not started. According to the report, all proposed work conforms to the Conservation Management Plan for the IZIKO Museums that was approved by HWC.
- Conservation Management Plan (CMP) dated 2019 and 5-year Maintenance Plan (MP) dated 2018 (MP needs to be reviewed to see if any revisions or changes are required). CMP as a management tool is implemented for 10 years.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that,

1. A close out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

14.51 Erf 96222, 7 King Street, Unit 23 and 24, Gardens, S34 - Minor Works Case No: HWC24102509CH1028

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal alterations to enlarge the existing bathrooms, replace the kitchenette joinery, install new door in living room to enable flow within the house to the upper floor and install new ducted air-conditioning so that the interior units are not visible.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.52 Erf 97, 3 St Albans Close, Bishopscourt, S34 - Total Demolition Case No: HWC24102401CH1024

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is to demolish existing house and outbuildings.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the demolition stating that the existing resource has been changed over time albeit having retained the original footprint and architectural style. The replacement building's relative position and footprint is not too dissimilar to those of the existing buildings on site – this will result in the retention of a large portion of the existing site greenery.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CH

14.53 Erf 95135, Queen Victoria Street, Cape Town, S27 - Signage
Case No: HWC24102125CH1022

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for new signage and graphics to existing sign for the commonwealth war graves commission. It is also proposed to refurbish the existing signage display board. The signage will be in the Delville Wood Memorial complex which aims at commemorating the efforts and loss of lives of South Africans during WWI and WWII, particularly Delville Wood, France. The new signboards and graphics will match the existing signage street furniture on the Company's Garden site except for the graphic information on the board. For the refurbishment of the existing sign, the poles are to be repaired and prepared for re-painting with new signage to be incorporated on to the existing board location.
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the location of the signage and the refurbishment of the existing signage poles as it will not detract from the high contextual significance of the area. The new signage board is supported as it will enhance the high associational, aesthetical and historical significance of this portion of the Company's Gardens plans.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO

UNDER INVESTIGATION

Clarity regarding what is required to be stamped should the application be approved. The applicant to provide the text and graphic design for each signage board.

CH

14.54 Erf 2373, 22-24 Burg Street, Cape Town S34 - Minor Works, Deviation
Case No: HWC24102414CH1024

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Streetscape photographs, confirmation if deviations have started/is completed and photographs of the areas where the work is proposed required.

CH

14.55 Erf 20624, Grand Roche, 1 Plantasie Street, Paarl, S27 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101408CH1022

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

Mr. Clive Theunissen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for an extension to the conference venue and to replace the existing wire fence with a new main road boundary wall. The extension will be a steel frame structure consisting of a covered patio with a flat sheeted roof and enclosed with aluminium stacking door. The boundary wall will be brick columns with decorative steel/ palisade fencing.
- Work has not started.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the work to the conference venue and objects to the boundary fence as it does not consider the slope of the ground towards the road, the existing trees and steps on Main Street.
- Graded II
- Outside HPO.
- Drakenstein Municipality requires revised drawings that address the boundary wall concerns.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal and provided comment stating that the boundary wall is not

support as the significant small gate leading up to the front door of the Manor House is not incorporated in the new proposal.

- DHF supports the proposal and states that the heritage gate and granite steps to the main roads needs to be retained and celebrated in the new design. The current heritage gate aligns with the front door of manor house and is an important spatial axis and should be retained.
- The draft heritage statement notes that the design of the boundary wall has been altered to incorporate the retention of the garage and stone steps and that the final report and revised drawings were circulated to I&APs.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. A close out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.
2. Monitoring and Close Out Report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion by Henry Aikman.

CH

14.56 Erf 1291, 17 Victory Avenue, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24021202CN1025

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Completed application form, Title Deed, all photos, CoCT comments and motivation required.

CN

14.57 Erf 15003, 16 Fabriek Street, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101803CN1022

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for internal alterations and an extension to the side of the building.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Work has not started.
- DHAC has no objection
- DHF has no objection
- Paarl 300 supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.58 Erf 2119-RE, 4 Third Avenue, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101805CN1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Confirmation if work has been completed required.

CN

14.59 Erf 240, 9 Berg Street, Franschhoek, S34-Deviation
Case No: HWC24102121CN1022

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for a deviation from the previously approved plans of 25 June 2024 and includes
1. Removal of the proposed new Dining room and first floor East Terrace and addition of a new pergola over this footprint. 2. Minor Internal re-organization of the proposed extension and "old cottage". 3. Lowering of the existing ceiling in the "old cottage and new staircase layout.
- To note: this is the 4th application on the property in 3 years. All previous applications were approved by HWC and the municipality.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.60 Erf 51053, 56 Keurboom Road, Claremont, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24102405CN1028

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal was for a covered terrace in place of where previously built additions were demolished.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

14.61 Erf 56012, 1 Doris Road Claremont, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24102419CN1028

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to convert the existing outbuilding into a second dwelling. I concur with the architect that the conversion is sympathetic and complements the existing.
- CoCT supports
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

14.62 Erf 8938, 7A Du Toit Street, Paarl, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24101804CN1022

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposals are to revamp the bathrooms, scullery converted into a bathroom, installation of new kitchenette in existing living room and minor changes to exterior of building.
- Ungraded
- Inside HPO
- DHAC has no objection
- DHF no objection
- Paarl 300 supports
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.63 Erf 8992, 5 First Avenue, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101506CN1022

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal was for internal alterations, a garage extension to the side and alterations to the rear. Changes to doors and windows were also made.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.
- DHAC has no objection
- DHF notes that the new garage should be set back at least 300mm from the main front façade. Both decorative columns in front of the garage need to be retained and the front façade of the garage should be a parapet wall.
- Paarl 300 does not support and note they cannot comment on work already completed without a permit.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

14.64 Farm 975 (unregistered Erf 1752), via R45 (Franschhoek Road), Simondium, S34-Alterations & Additions
Case No: CN1025

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to restore and rebuild the 48-year-old building. Built in 1976. NHRA not triggered.

- Paarl 300 supports

COMMENT

The proposal does not trigger the NHRA. A letter of no trigger to be issued.

CN

14.65 RE of Farm Schoemanshoek 446, via R325, Albertinia, S34 - Alterations, Additions & Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24090502CN1025

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Title Deed, all proposals to be coloured up on plans, Municipality and SVDSF comments and SG diagram required.

CN

14.66 Erf 117325, 58 Surrey Street, Claremont, S34 - Minor Works

Case No: HWC24101512XM1021

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Title Deed, SG Diagram, Annotated Internal, External & Streetscape photographs and Motivation required.

XM

14.67 Erf 125560, 67 Princess Alice Avenue, Ysterplaat, Brooklyn, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: XM1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

POP/Reference Number, Title Deed, SG Diagram, Locality Map, Plans, Annotated Streetscape photographs, Local municipality comments required.

XM

14.68 Erf 1361, 37 Ocean View Drive, Green Point, S34 - Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24082719XM1021

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal for demolition is to enable the site to be developed with an apartment use building in accordance with the site's zoning scheme rights.
- Work has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports
- GPRRA did not provide comment within 30 days

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

XM

14.69 Erf 13811, Milner Street, Wellington, S34 - Minor Works

Case No: HWC23102006XM1021

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Title Deed, SG Diagram, Annotated Internal and Streetscape photographs required.

XM

14.70 Erf 1451, 3 Anmar Mansions, 2 Seymour Avenue, Vredehoek, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24100721XM1021

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Annotated External photographs, Consultation comments: Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group and Motivation required.

XM

14.71 Erf 296, Franschhoek High School, 15 Akademie Street, Franschhoek, S34 - Minor Works

Case No: HWC24092515XM1021

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

SG diagram colored up plans and consultation comments required.

XM

14.72 Erf 44434, 19 Loch Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24102202XM1022

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for a new single garage
- Work has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- COCT supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

14.73 Erf 681, 1 Vaal Road, Milnerton, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24040310XM1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area (FoBCA) comment required.

XM

14.74 Erf 68296, 178 Rosemead Avenue, Kenilworth, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24010813XM1022

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Annotated Streetscape photographs and Local municipality comments required.

XM

14.75 Erf 94630-RE, Unit 41, Langholm Court, 60 Kloof Street, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24101501XM1021

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Streetscapes photographs required.

XM

15. OTHER MATTERS

16. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

CH moves to adopt and CN seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. CLOSURE

The chairperson, Mr Ruan Brand, officially closed the meeting at 12:15.

18. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, 18 November 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

Ruan
Brand

Digitally signed by
Ruan Brand
Date: 2024.11.20
07:20:56 +02'00'

SECRETARY:

Aneeqah
Brown

Digitally signed by
Aneeqah Brown
Date: 2024.11.20 07:05:32
+02'00'

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners

AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society

BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association

BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement

CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers ' & Residents Association

CoCT – City of Cape Town

CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust

CRM - Cultural Resources Management

DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association

Docomomo South Africa

DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society

EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department

FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area

FE - Friends of Elim

GLCA- Greater Lynfræ Civic Association

GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association

HVA- Harfield Village Association

HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay

HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association

HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association

HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment

ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa

KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association

KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association

LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District

MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society

NCW – Not Conservation Worthly

NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)

NID - Notification of Intent to Develop

NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association

OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage

Paarl300 Foundation

PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association

PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation

SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency

SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society

SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association

SvDSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town

STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society

SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation

SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust

GHT - George Heritage Trust

RVRA- Rustenburg Valley Residents Association

TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society

VASSA - Vernacular Architecture Society of South Africa

WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group

WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council

WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee

WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society

WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists

ABHC - Associated Bibeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)

BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee

CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association

CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association

CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation

CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations

CMP – Conservation Management Plan

DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association

DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation

EMPr - Environmental Management Program

FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association

FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts

GBRM - Great Brak River Museum

GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group

GCS - Greyton Conservation Society

HRF - Helderberg Renaissance Foundation

HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting

HPO – Heritage protects overlay.

HWC – Heritage Western Cape

IACom - Impact Assessment Committee

IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee

KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society

MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society

NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation

NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body

NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999

NRA - Newlands Residents Association

OCA - Observatory Civic Association

OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee

PPP - Public Participation Process

PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust

RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee

SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System

SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee

SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group

SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association

OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society

TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation

UCRRA- Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association

WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association

Ward 2 Forum

WCC- Whale Coast Conservation

WRA - Woodstock Residents Association

WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association