

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 20 September 2023 via MS
Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH) (co-opted)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)
Mr Yaseen Samodien (YS)
Ms Chané Herman (CH)
Ms Corné Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)

Visitors:

Ms Nelia Wolfaardt
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Daniel Hellenberg
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Mark Bell
Ms Tater Anderson
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Johan Cornelius
Ms Nicolene Visser
Mr Arthur Levin

Ms Anja Lareman
Ms Anne-Marie Fick
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Ms Adelaide Combrink
Ms Ntombi Nkoane
Ms Corne Viljoen
Mr Philip Smith
Mr Marnus Erasmus
Mr Stuart Burnett
Mr Mike Scurr

Apologies

Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Siphiso Mavumengwana (SM)
Ms Athi Njoba (AN)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 20 September 2023.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 20 September 2023.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 30 August 2023

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 30 August 2023 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

- GJ: item 13.9
- DB: item 13.6

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

NR reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed redevelopment of Hospital and Park, Earl Street, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 16109, Corner of Camp and Manitoa Street, Saldanha Bay
- Proposed development of a new school on Erf 4464, Adriaans Avenue, Asla Park, KwaNonQaba, Mossel Bay

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up

For noting.

8.5 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 907,24 Marmion Road, Oranjezicht

A site inspection report has been prepared, and this matter will be heard at the next BELCom meeting on 12 October 2023. This report can be distributed to the I&APs.

8.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 179757, 3 Royal Road, Muizenberg

The written Comment as required by the Tribunal directive of 24 August 2023 and prepared by Committee members was endorsed.

8.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 4774 & 4777, 96 Longmarket Street, Cape Town

The Committee agreed to grant RSA heritage consultants additional time to compile a thorough report as previously required.

8.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Portions 4 & 6 of Farm 100, Morgenhof Wine Estate, Stellenbosch

This item will be held over to the next BELCom meeting on 12 October 2023.

8.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 172010, Beach Road, Muizenberg, Empire West Building

This item was removed from the agenda. The application is incomplete.

8.10 Union Castle Building, V&A Waterfront

SJ reported back on progress. A report from RSA heritage consultants will be presented at the next BELCom meeting on 12 October 2023.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

- Items no 13.9, 13.10 and 13.11 were removed/held over.

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Rem of Erf 48164, 7 Hampton Avenue, Newlands
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4907 Uitkyk/Pearl Mountain, Bo Lang Street, Groenvlei, Paarl
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 980, 979, 985, 986 & 987, Cloud Nine Boutique Hotel, 8-12 Kloofnek Road & 93-95 New Church Street, Tamboerskloof
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 2231

Case No: HWC23062306RG0626

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Nelia Wolfaardt (applicant), Ms Anja Lareman (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on Thursday, 17 August 2023. See attached annexure SI1.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS, in the Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone of Paarl and in a prominent location adjacent to the Strooidak Church.
- Unauthorised work includes alterations to the Victorian villa, as well as recent alterations to existing structures and a new IBR clad structure behind the villa.
- Proposals for rectification and mitigation were discussed, including the importance of a positive approach to landscaping of the courtyard area which forms a visual continuum with the grounds of the Strooidak Church.
- The Committee supports continuation of works in principle. The legality and planning approval processes may not support such.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

A heritage agreement needs to be entered into with HWC. Revised drawings separating out contentious elements as per discussions held in BELCom and recommended by the heritage consultant are to be presented along with mitigation proposals to the unauthorised kitchen block. The Committee is of the opinion that landscaping which is complementary to the Strooidak Church is required.

SJ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 None

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 149979, 18 Campbell Road, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 149979

Case No: HWC23021413CN0217

Ms Corné Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Daniel Hellenberg (applicant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site, an early 20th C Victorian semi-detached house, is graded IIIC and located in the Upper Observatory HPOZ.
- A loft and balcony, visible from the street and constructed of materials and in a form considered insensitive within the heritage protected area, were added to the semi-detached house without prior authorisation.
- CoCT and Observatory Civic Association did not support the loft addition in its current form.
- Should the applicant present acceptable mitigation measures to restore heritage significance a new application needs to be made.

RECORD OF DECISION:

HWC cannot condone unauthorised work. The application as submitted is refused. No S.51 letter can be issued since heritage resources have been impacted. The additions, shape, form and scale are not acceptable within the heritage context.

CN

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28910, 23 Koning Street, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 28910

Case No: HWC22102503TZ1101

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Anne-Marie Fick (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The existing house has origins in the late 19th C, however, has been subsequently altered so as to reduce its heritage significance.
- The site is graded IIIC and is not in a heritage protected area, nor does the immediate context display any architectural consistency.

- While the initially proposed loft alteration was deemed inappropriate, the addition of a first floor with raised walls and new roof was deemed a better response.
- Re-use of the timber and cast iron ventilators is recommended where possible.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 1052-B-151, 1052-B-152, 1052-B-153, 1052-B-154, 1052-B-201, 1052-B-301 and 1052-B-311 – Revision D dated 4 May 2023 prepared by Gideon J Nieuwoudt from Woudt Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on RE of Erf 48164, 7 Hampton Avenue, Newlands: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / NEWLANDS / REMAINDER OF ERF 48164

Case No: HWC23070311CN0718

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on Tuesday, 12 September 2023. See attached annexure SI2.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant) and Ms Tater Anderson (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This cottage known as 'The Woods' dates from 1860 and is remarkably intact in spite of some alterations and insensitive additions at the back.
- Various Georgian and Victorian stylistic features are evident. Some may be replacements of earlier features or installed at roughly the same time, thereby expressing a transition between Georgian and Victorian stylistic periods.
- Georgian features include 12 pane sash windows with elaborate interior architraves and pockets (now empty) for internal shutters and two cast iron fireplaces. While identical architraves and shutter pockets remain at the front sash windows flanking the entrance, later Victorian 4 pane sash windows have been installed in those earlier frames.
- The application for new additions to the back of the site was supported by the CoCT and Newlands Residents Association, however proposed alteration of the front windows into doors was opposed by both parties.
- The site is not in a heritage protected area but was historically part of the Papenboom Estate.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the proposal in principle. Recommendations as per the site inspection report can be adopted. Revised detail drawings are to be submitted to BELCom.

CN

**13.4 Proposed Restoration or Replacement of Mowbray Horse Fountain, Corner Campground and Durban - Klipfontein Road, Mowbray: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / MOWBRAY / ERF 29077-RE**

Case No: HWC23082112SJ0826

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Mark Bell (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The fountain is graded IIIA and was originally installed at the intersection of Main Road and Station Roads, Mowbray, having been donated to the SPCA.
- Options for restoration or for replacement with a cast aluminium replica were presented by the CoCT.
- The Committee warned against combining cast iron and aluminium elements as this would result in erosion of the iron in contact with the aluminium due to a reaction between the two galvanically incompatible metals in the presence of water.
- There are cold metal stitching systems available that can repair cast iron without the complication of welding. In fact, the fountain was successfully repaired using such a metal stitching process in the late 1980's/early 1990's.
- Although the fountain's present lantern may not be the same as in early photographs, it is possible that this lantern is also an early surviving element, but from elsewhere. The workshops of the then Cape Town City Council during the 1970's – 1990's was known for recovering elements from other early installations and keeping them in storage pending re-use elsewhere. This may be one such example.
- While a replica may represent a reminder of a bygone time, there would be considerable value in the conservation of the material object itself as embodying historical, technological and social heritage significance. This would be especially important if the fountain is found to contain more authentic early material than previously suspected.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Further specialist investigative study is to be undertaken to determine to what extent the fountain can be repaired. The Committee supports in principle the future relocation of the fountain.

SJ

**13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 980, 979, 985, 986 & 987, Cloud Nine Boutique Hotel, 8-12 Kloofnek Road & 93-95 New Church Street, Tamboerskloof: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / TAMBOERSKLOOF / ERVEN 980, 979, 985, 986, 987**

Case No: HWC23052607RG0530

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 15 August 2023. See attached annexure SI3.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant), Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT) and Mr Corné Viljoen (applicant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Cloud Nine Hotel occupies five adjacent erven, four erven graded IIIB and one erf graded IIIC, located in the Upper Table Valley HPOZ. The buildings date from late 19th to early 20th C.
- Unauthorised alterations and additions have occurred over several years as the buildings were renovated to meet the requirements of the hotel.
- An Infill building has been constructed across the backs of the erven to join the originally separate buildings (circulation space) and includes high structures that tower above the surrounding buildings.
- The CoCT and CIBRA objected to the unauthorised work that was carried out.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

HWC's legal advisor has confirmed that a S.34 process is required for this application.

1. The Committee strongly advises that a suitably qualified architect to HWC's approval be appointed to prepare proposals for mitigation.
2. The applicant is to study the site inspection report prepared by the Committee and present responses/mitigations for consideration. Responses should be tabled at the BELCom meeting in November 2023.

SJ

**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1276, Corner of Berg and Dirkie Uys Street,
Franschhoek: NM
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 1276**

Case No: HWC23060903RG0614

DB recused himself and logged off from MS Teams. The Committee nominated HvdM to chair for this item.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Minutes of the Belcom Meeting held on 30 August 2023, item 13.5, records an approval for 'drawings numbered 23-01-02 dated January 2023' after the committee viewed a proposal which had been confirmed as the correct one.
- However, after the meeting the applicant advised that this was not the correct proposal and confirmed that the alternative design that had also been available at the last meeting was in fact the correct one. The application was therefore placed on the agenda for this meeting.
- The site is graded IIIB, dates from the late 19th C and is located in the core heritage area of Franschhoek.
- The intact nature of the street presentation of the subject building would be negatively impacted by a double storey directly adjacent to it.
- The resulting box gutter detail was questioned due to potential for water damage to the historic building should the gutter fail.
- A significant setback, or location of the additional accommodation at the back of the site should be explored.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Proposal D is to be revised so that the double storey section is significantly set back from the street. The proposed box gutter detail is to be reconsidered.

The Committee reiterates its support for Sketch Design 3 as considered at BELCom on 30 August 2023.

SJ

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4907, Pearl Mountain, Bo Lang Street, Groenvlei, Paarl: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 4907**

Case No: HWC23071907SJ0726

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on Tuesday, 12 September 2023. See attached annexure SI4.

Ms Anne-Marie Fick (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The farm 'Uitkyk' has its origins in the 18th c with the gabled and thatched T-shaped homestead with a gable dated 1820.
- The site is graded IIIA and is not in a heritage protected area.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The thatch roof is integral to the historic significance of the original T-shaped homestead building and must be retained. The Committee supports the proposed removal of insensitive additions, the proposed addition to the rear is acceptable. The Committee requires further detail on the intention to remove tie beams and other structural elements of the thatch roof.

SJ

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 363, 30 High Level Road, Green Point: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / ERF 363**

Case No: HWC23022104RG0223

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (RSA heritage consultant), Mr Arthur Levine (owner) and Mr Stuart Burnett (Green Point Residents and Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This three storey building, known as 'Sicilia', was originally a residence for the Scalabrino family.
- The building is graded IIIB and not in a HPOZ.
- Unauthorized building work had taken place and a Stop Works order issued.
- A mitigation report by Rennie Scurr Adendorff heritage consultants is under consideration in terms of, amongst others, detailed proposals for reinstatement of balconies to the NE façade and new bathroom windows to the highly visible SE façade.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is in support of option B as presented with further exploration of balcony column sizes and number of columns. Final drawings with the desired column type are to be submitted for endorsement and inclusion in a heritage agreement.

Revised drawings can be submitted for consideration at the next BELCom meeting on 12 October 2023.

SJ

- 13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Portions 4 & 6 of Farm 100, Morgenhof Wine Estate, Stellenbosch: MA**
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ PORTIONS 4 AND 6 OF FARM 100

Case No: HWC22053008CH0815

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the next BELCom meeting on 12 October 2023.

CH

- 13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 172010, Beach Road, Muizenberg, Empire West Building: NM**
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / MUIZENBERG/ ERF 172010

Case No: HWC23083008CN0901

This item was removed from the agenda. The application is incomplete.

CN

- 13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 4774 & 4777, 96 Longmarket Street, Cape Town: MA**
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN / ERVEN 4774 & 4777

Case No: 21012804ND0218E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee agreed to grant Rennie Scurr Adendorff heritage consultants additional time to compile a thorough report. A progress report is to be submitted at the BELCom meeting on 9 November 2023.

KB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

- 14.1** None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 14:20

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

12 October 2023

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

12 October 2023
DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

12 October 2023
DATE _____