

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN
CAPE (HWC), ARCHAEOLOGY, PALAEOLOGY AND METEORITES
COMMITTEE (APM)**

**Held on Friday, 8 November 2019 in the Boardroom, 1st Floor Protea Assurance
Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00 AM**

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Dr Antonia Malan, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members

Dr Antonia Malan (AMa)
Dr Wendy Black (WB)
Dr Ragna Redelstorff (RR)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Mr John Gribble (JG)
Dr Lita Webley (LW)

Members of Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSm)
Mr Andrew September (AS)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CPo)

Visitors

Mr Phillip Hine
Dr Jan de Vynck

Mr Izak Venter

Observer

New committee member Ms Emmylou Bailey, as a member of the incoming APM Committee, attended as observer.

3. APOLOGIES

Dr Jayson Orton (JO)
Dr Abigail Moffet (AMo)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)

Absent

None

4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

4.1 Dated 8 November 2019.

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor additions.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES AND MATTERS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETING

5.1 Dated 2 October 2019.

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with some amendments.

6. DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST

6.1 None

Approved APM Minutes 8 November 2019

7. CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS

7.1 None

8. APPOINTMENTS

9:15 am for Item 14.1: Submission of Blombos Museum as a Registered Repository with Heritage Western Cape.

9. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

9.1.1 Mitigation Project for the Raising of the Clanwilliam Dam.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- The heritage consultants' (PGS) contract with Department of Water & Sanitation (DWAS) has ended.
- Additional information for the final report is still awaited, as previously requested by APM, including adequate artefact description and analysis.
- In terms of the repository agreement with PGS, the material requiring appropriate storage conditions is due to be sent to Iziko Museums, but there is a custodianship clause to allow for the rock art panels to remain in Clanwilliam. The options for where the rock art will be housed are a private museum or the Old Jail which is a public institution.
- The removed rock art panels are still in temporary storage at the Clanwilliam Living Landscape Project facility. Professor Parkington is awaiting funding from DWAS, which has signed an agreement regarding the proposed curation and display but not released the money.
- It was noted that the decision made by APM on 6 September 2017 should be followed up and reported back to APM: "The 'sheep' panel must be cleaned and recorded, and a decision regarding its removal can then be made in consultation between HWC, the consultant team and DWA".

OUTSTANDING FUTURE REQUIREMENTS

The heritage consultant (PGS) must submit the edited Final Report and supplementary artefact description and analyses, as per the Committee's previous request.

RECOMMENDATION

HWC (or DCAS) to write a letter to DWAS confirming that the funds are available for the relocation, conservation and storage of the rock art panels and that they will be released urgently in terms of the agreement with the Clanwilliam Living Landscape Project.

9.1.2 US Ambassador Fund for Cultural Preservation

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

Dr Galimberti was not able to attend the APM meeting to make her presentation. The item will be postponed.

9.1.3 Battle of Blaauwberg: Collection and exhibition of archaeological material.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- It was noted that the requirement for a permit to use a metal detector on an archaeological site is set out in S.35(4)(d) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), and that applications for a permit to “trade in or sell for private gain” are required under s.20(1)(a) of HWC Regulations.
- Mr Willem Hutten had a permit to carry out a metal detecting survey of the battlefield for his research and was assisted by local enthusiasts.
- Ms Louisa Hutten noticed an advertisement for an exhibition of battlefield materials “found with metal detector” at a local shopping mall, alerted the organisers that the collection was possibly illegally obtained, and they cancelled the show.
- SB tried unsuccessfully to contact the exhibitor – “Westcoast Historical Society” – directly.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

SB to provide feedback on communication with the exhibitor(s) regarding the provenance of the material that was to be displayed and the possible unauthorised collection of archaeological material associated with the Battle of Blaauwberg.

9.1.4 Blombos PHS Access

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Professor Henshilwood has raised concerns about unauthorised access to Blombos via a walking trail laid out on a guest house property adjacent to the Blombos estate.
- The Department of Economic Development and Tourism (DEDAT) made enquiries and the guest house owner stated that the trail does not go onto Blombos property and that their guests are informed that it is private property.

RECOMMENDATION

HWC to write to the owner of the guest house requesting confirmation that the guests are clearly informed that they are not allowed onto the Blombos Estate without the guest house receiving written permission from the landowners/owner/s.

9.1.5 Limits on Validity of Impact Assessment Reports

FOR NOTING

IACOM and APM proposed a five year time limit (with option to request an extension) for impact assessment reports. This is to be a standard paragraph in Section 38(4) decisions and in comments to DEA&DP and DEA.

9.2 Outcomes of Appeals

PM reported back on the decisions of the Appeals Committee meeting of 16 October 2019.

10 Standing Items

10.1 Proposed Site Inspections

10.1.1 None

10.2 Site Inspection Report

10.2.1 None

10.3 Report back on Council

10.3.1 The new HWC Council met on 1 November 2019 to select committees and members will be notified shortly. The Committee congratulated Ms Muller and Ms Bailey on their appointments to Council and as members of APM.

10.4 RATIFICATION VIA EMAIL

10.4.1 None

11 POLICY AND PROCEDURES

11.1 SAPS and HWC Accidental Finds Protocol and Procedure

No further update.

AS

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

12. SECTION 35 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

12.1 Proposed Palaeoproteomic analyses of faunal bones from Klipdrift Shelter and Blombos Cave HM / RIVERSDALE-SWELLENDAAM / PALAEOPROTEOMIC ANALYSES OF FAUNAL BONES

Case No: 19082207AS0925E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The research proposal aims to explore the potential of taxonomically identifying fragmentary bone assemblages from the Middle Stone Age (MSA) sites Klipdrift Shelter (KDS) and Blombos Cave (BBC), through the use of Zooarchaeology by Mass Spectrometry (ZooMS). 201 bone fragments (each less than 2 cm in size) will be tested to see whether ZooMS can be used in combination with traditional zooarchaeological techniques for better understanding bone assemblages from South African MSA sites, both for better characterising the faunal record, as well as for searching for hominin bone remains.

- Dr Douka's Finder Project is based at the Max Planck Institute, Germany, and the official repository, Iziko Museums, has approved access to the archaeological material which is retained at an off-site facility.

DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application for palaeoproteomic analyses of faunal bones from Klipdrift Shelter and Blombos Cave.

AS

**12.2 Proposed sampling and dating of Yzerfontein beach skeleton
HM/YZERFONTEIN/ YZERFONTEIN BEACH SKELETON**

Case No:N/A

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Andrew September presented the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- The human remains were observed some time ago in a known area of archaeological and geological interest (16 Mile Beach), but not disturbed or reported to HWC. Wave action recently eroded the remains, some of which were then removed by local residents and taken to SAPS, who then removed the remainder. HWC was made aware of the situation by Forensic Pathology, Darling.
- HWC conducted a site inspection on 26 July 2019, but the site marker had been washed away. The exact location of the burial was later indicated by Mrs van der Vyver and GPS co-ordinates were recorded by Dr Duncan Miller.
- It was noted that the discovery, removal and storage process was undertaken without formal notification, nor a permit application, public consultation or official approval. There is therefore no HWC case number.
- The remains are currently in temporary care at UCT's FACT unit, and Dr Gibbon has requested that she is kept informed of HWC's decisions.
- There is current research by the University of the Witwatersrand into the rapidly eroding dune cordon along 16 Mile Beach, with its complex stratigraphy, and the researchers are seeking absolute dates related to the chronology of deposition and changing sea levels.
- The application before the Committee was submitted by Dr Mary Evans, School of Geography, Archaeology and Environmental Studies; University of the Witwatersrand, in conjunction with Dr Miller, and is a proposal to sample and date the human remains by C14, and to sample and date the sand dune by OSL, both processes to be carried out at Dr Woodborne's iThemba LABS.
- The Committee is of the opinion that the human remains were removed illegally and therefore a process is to be initiated to decide their future and availability for study.

DECISION

The application to sample and date the human remains removed from 16 Mile Beach is not approved.

FURTHER REQUIREMENT

A process is to be initiated to decide the future of the human remains and availability for study, in conjunction with Dr Mary Evans (Wits) and Dr Gibbon (FACT), and with public consultation.

SB

13 SECTION 35 PERMIT REPORTS

13.1 Mitigation for Geelwal Karoo 262, Near Koekenaap, Vredendal, and also Associated Survey HM/VREDENDAL/FARM GEELWAL KAROO 262

Case No: 15042305AS0506E

Mr Andrew September tabled a Permit Report by Dr Deano Stynder (UCT) and Prof Kaye Reed (Arizona State University).

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- The project started in 2009 and relates to the exploitation of the West Coast by animals and early humans. The relevant permit application was dated 2015 and this is the Final Report.
- The new owner of the mining property in 2016 refused permission for archaeologists to access these significant sites for further research. HWC to forward the revised Final Report to Tormin with a recommendation for further research and protection.
- The report does not meet the minimum standards for reporting (lacking a cover page, conclusions or recommendations, etc.) and, given the importance of the research, lacks substantial academic information, statement of significance and recommendations for grading (such as a potential PHS).

FUTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Report to be revised to comply with HWC minimum standards of reporting.
2. Recommendations for grading to be included in the report.

AS

13.2 Palaeo-archaeological investigation and excavation on Duynefontein 2, Farm 1375, Farm Duynefontein 34, Farm Klein Springfontein 33, Koeberg Nature Reserve, Melkbosstrand HM/MELKBOSSTRAND/FARM DUYNEFONTEIN 34

Case No: 17031401AS0316E

Mr Andrew September tabled a Permit Report by Dr. Deano Stynder.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- The original permit expired in 2016 and was extended to 2019. This is the Final Report. The project was to explore the behaviour of Acheulean hominins along the southwest coast of South Africa, by analysing stone tools directly associated with remains of large animals.

- The report includes students' specialist reports on cut marks, lithics and calcrete, only one of which meets acceptable standards of reporting. These papers should have been edited to remove errors, etc. and interpreted by the principal author.
- The report does not meet the minimum standards for reporting (lacking a cover page, page numbers, conclusions or recommendations, etc.) and, given the importance of the research, lacks substantial academic information, statement of significance and recommendations for grading (such as a potential PHS).

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Report to be revised to comply with HWC minimum standards of reporting.
2. Recommendations for grading to be included in the report.

AS

14 SECTION 35 REGISTRATION OF REPOSITORIES

14.1 Registration of Blombos Museum, Langenhoven Street, Stilbaai as a Registered Repository HM/REPOSITORIES/HESSEQUA/BLOMBOS MUSEUM

Case No: 19072401AS0829E

The item was introduced by SB.

Mr Phillip Hine (Manager of APM Unit SAHRA), Mr Izak Venter (Chairperson of Blombos Archaeological and Fynbos Trust (BAFT)) and Dr Jan de Vynck (Museum Collections Manager), were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- A HWC site inspection took place on 27 September 2019; an agreement and other documents have been submitted as requested by APM.
- The prime concern is s.35(2) of the NHRA. Archaeological material belongs to the State and in this case a private museum is the custodian.
 - Has HWC legal authority to require registration of a private museum? What does a "public institution" mean?
 - The relationship between Blombos Research Project and the museum to be clarified. The name of the museum is confusing. Promotion and protection of archaeological resources is a major aim of the BAFT.
 - There is a close and excellent relationship with Professor Henshilwood and his team at Blombos and Dr Marean at Pinnacle Point, as well as other scientists and universities.
- Collections have been donated over the years and this is ongoing, but there is no active collecting by the museum. The fragile and threatened fossils removed by Dr Helm near Sedgefield are loaned to the museum by SANParks.
 - Iziko Museums could perhaps incorporate the Blombos Museum collections within their collections and loan them back as a permanent loan. This needs to be discussed with Iziko Senior Management.
- There are SAHRA requirements regarding collections registration and management. Also concerns about what happens to the collections if the museum closes.
 - The Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists (ASAPA) recommends that the curator should be a professional archaeologist. De-accessioning, or destruction / relocation, of material must be regulated.

- Access to material for research purposes must be allowed to bona fide researchers. Students who remove items for study must follow a formal loan agreement process.
- Recommended that Iziko Museums is asked to advise on NHRA archaeological management requirements for a collection strategy and agreements, and the process of de-accessioning.
- There are plans to expand the museum facility to enable community outreach, especially to previously disadvantaged communities and group with ancestral indigenous ties to the region.
 - A Stillbaai Interpretation Centre is planned to integrate with the Cradle of Human Culture heritage route. This will require a larger space and enhanced IT connection. The Blombos and Pinnacle Point material will be displayed there.
 - KhoiSan and Hessequa groups are involved in a project regarding Southern Cape origins of cultural / artistic expression, also with tourism in mind, with exhibitions in town hall and school visit programmes.
- Protection and interventions in the shell midden site and the fish traps in the harbour and at Noordkapperspunt.
 - The shell midden is fenced and successfully maintained in collaboration with the municipality. The fish traps were inside a marine protected area since 1968 so no longer used and fixed by traditional fishermen. The Society has an agreement with SAHRA and Cape Nature to assist with the care of Noordkapperspunt fish traps.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Iziko Museums, SAHRA and Blombos (Stillbaai) Museum to draft and submit to HWC for comment, a proposal regarding:
 - a. Compliance;
 - b. Sustainability of museum activities;
 - c. Planned interpretation centre.

SB

15 SECTION 38 WORKPLAN APPLICATIONS

15.1 None

16 SECTION 38 WORKPLAN REPORTS

16.1 None

17 SECTION 38 (8) TO OTHER AUTHORITIES

17.1 None

18 SECTION 27: PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE

18.1 None

19 REQUEST FOR EXCEPTION / OPINION / ADVICE

19.1 None

20 REPORT BACK FROM OTHER MEETINGS WHEN RELEVANT

20.1 None

21 OTHER MATTERS

**21.1 Proposed nomination for Kasteelberg Archaeological Site to be a PHS
HM/VREDEBURG/KASTEELBERG**

Case No: N/A

Mr Andrew September presented the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was noted and discussed:

- The previous dossier in support of a nomination as a PHS needs to be updated, expanded and revised in light of more recent research, publications and socio-cultural conditions.
- JG to lead the project in liaison with AS and members of APM Committee.

RECOMMENDATION

The previous nomination dossier to be reviewed, updated and revised in light of recent research and heritage practice.

AS

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions.

23 CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: 11:55

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

2 December 2019

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____